

## Notice of Meeting and Agenda Scotland Excel Executive Sub-committee

Date	Time	Venue
Friday, 29 June 2018	09:45	City Chambers, Glasgow City Council, 80 George Square, Glasgow, G2 1DU

KENNETH GRAHAM Clerk

#### Membership

Provost Bill Howatson (Aberdeenshire Council); Councillor Angus Macmillan Douglas (Angus Council); Councillor Graham Hutchison (City of Edinburgh Council); Provost Norman A Macdonald (Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar); Councillor Stephen Thompson (Dumfries and Galloway Council); Councillor Altany Craik (Fife Council); Bailie Norman MacLeod (Glasgow City Council); Councillor Alister Mackinnon (Highland Council); Councillor Todd Ferguson (North Ayrshire Council); Councillor Paul Di Mascio (North Lanarkshire Council); Councillor John Shaw (Renfrewshire Council); Councillor Amanda Westlake (Shetland Islands Council) and Councillor Collette Stevenson (South Lanarkshire Council)

Councillor John Shaw (Convener): Councillor Paul Di Mascio (Vice Convener)

#### **Further Information**

This is a meeting which is open to members of the public.

A copy of the agenda and reports for this meeting will be available for inspection prior to the meeting at the Customer Service Centre, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley and online at <a href="http://renfrewshire.cmis.uk.com/renfrewshire/CouncilandBoards.aspx">http://renfrewshire.cmis.uk.com/renfrewshire/CouncilandBoards.aspx</a>
For further information, please either email <a href="mailto:democratic-services@renfrewshire.gov.uk">democratic-services@renfrewshire.gov.uk</a> or telephone 0141 618 7112.

#### Members of the Press and Public

Members of the press and public wishing to attend the meeting should report to the customer service centre where they will be met and directed to the meeting.

#### Items of business

### **Apologies**

Apologies from members.

#### **Declarations of Interest**

Members are asked to declare an interest in any item(s) on the agenda and to provide a brief explanation of the nature of the interest.

1 Minute 3 - 8

Minute of meeting of the Executive Sub-committee held on 1 June 2018.

## 2 Contracts for Approval

and Fresh Fish

2(a) Supply and Distribution of Fresh Meats, Cooked Meats 9 - 32

Report by Director of Scotland Excel.

2(b) Supply and Delivery of Roadstone

33 - 44

Report by Director of Scotland Excel.

2(c) Social Care Agency Workers

45 - 78

Report by Director of Scotland Excel.

## 3 Date of Next Meeting

Note that the next meeting of the Executive Sub-committee will be held at 10.45 am on 24 August 2018 in Scotland Excel Meeting Room 1, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley.



# Minute of Meeting Scotland Excel Executive Sub-committee

Date	Time	Venue
Friday, 01 June 2018	10:45	Scotland Excel Meeting Room 1 Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley

#### **Present**

Councillor Altany Craik (Fife Council); Bailie Norman MacLeod (Glasgow City Council); Councillor Alister Mackinnon (Highland Council); Councillor Paul Di Mascio (North Lanarkshire Council); Councillor John Shaw (Renfrewshire Council); and Councillor Amanda Westlake (Shetland Islands Council).

### By Videolink

Provost Bill Howatson (Aberdeenshire Council); and Provost Norman A Macdonald (Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar).

#### Chair

Councillor John Shaw, Convener, presided.

#### In Attendance

J Welsh, Director, H Carr, Head of Strategic Procurement, S Brannagan, Head of Customer & Business Services, M Robertson, Marketing and Communications Manager, and K Copland, Procurement Co-ordinator (all Scotland Excel); L Belshaw, Democratic Services Manager, E Currie, Senior Committee Services Officer, L Dickie, Finance Manager and K Crawford, Accountant (all Renfrewshire Council).

## **Apologies**

Councillor Angus Macmillan Douglas (Angus Council); Councillor Graham Hutchison (City of Edinburgh Council); Councillor Stephen Thompson (Dumfries and Galloway Council); Councillor Todd Ferguson (North Ayrshire Council); and Councillor Collette Stevenson (South Lanarkshire Council).

#### **Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest intimated prior to the commencement of the meeting.

#### 1 Minute

There was submitted the Minute of the meeting of the Executive Sub-committee held on 27 April 2018.

The Convener referred to the discussion at the last meeting regarding having 'Any Other Competent Business' on future agendas. He advised that Scotland Excel was a joint committee formed under Section 57 of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 and that also in terms of Section 57, the Joint Committee established the Executive Sub-committee. Accordingly, the requirements of the Act in terms of access to meetings and documents of local authorities applied equally to Scotland Excel Joint Committee and the Executive Sub-committee as they applied to meetings of local authorities. "Any Other Competent Business" did not comply with the terms of the Act and Scotland Excel's Procedural Standing Orders. If a member had an urgent item of business to raise, which was not detailed in the agenda, then he/she should raise this at the start of the meeting and the Convener would then rule whether or not this item of business was indeed urgent and whether or not it would be considered at all during the course of the meeting. Any matter raised and not agreed by the Convener as urgent would not be recorded in the Minute of the meeting. This was also the position with any matters which officers or members advised on at the close of the meeting.

#### **DECIDED**:

- (a) That the Minute be approved; and
- (b) That the position in relation to "Any Other Competent Business" be noted.

## **2** Contract for Approval: Salt for Winter Maintenance

There was submitted a report by the Director of Scotland Excel relative to the award of a renewal framework agreement for salt for winter maintenance which would be effective from 1 July 2018 until 30 June 2022.

The report intimated that the framework covered a full range of salt and de-icing equipment and accessories including bulk and bagged rock salt, marine salt and treated salt to allow councils to deliver various public services.

The framework had been divided into seven lots as detailed in table 1 of the report and had been advertised at an estimated value of £65 million over the four-year period with the forecast annual spend for participating councils being £16.2 million per annum.

It was noted that 30 Councils had confirmed their intention to participate in the framework. In addition, Tayside Contracts, NHS Scotland and Advanced Procurement for Universities and Colleges had confirmed their intention to participate.

Tender responses had been received from nine suppliers and a summary of offers received was detailed in Appendix 2 to the report.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out within the tender document, a full evaluation of the compliant offers had been completed and Appendix 3 to the report detailed the scoring achieved by each bidder.

Based on the evaluation undertaken in line with the criteria and weightings set out in the report it was recommended that a multi-supplier framework agreement be awarded to nine suppliers across the seven lots as outlined in Appendix 3 to the report.

**<u>DECIDED</u>**: That the award of the framework agreement for salt for winter maintenance, as detailed in Appendix 3 to the report, be approved.

#### 3 Treatment and Disposal of Recyclable and Residual Waste

The Convener advised that the Director of Scotland Excel had withdrawn this report.

**DECIDED**: That it be noted that the report had been withdrawn.

## 4 Request for Associate Membership: Homes for Life Housing Partnership

There was submitted a report by the Director of Scotland Excel advising that Homes for Life Housing Partnership had submitted an application to become an associate member of Scotland Excel.

<u>**DECIDED**</u>: That the application by Homes for Life Housing Partnership to become an associate member of Scotland Excel, at an annual membership fee of £500, be approved subject to completion and signing of the agreement documentation.

## 5 Corporate Strategy 2018/23 and Operating Plan 2017/18

There was submitted a report by the Director of Scotland Excel relative to the development of a new corporate strategy 2018/23 and operating plan 2017/18.

The report intimated that the Executive Sub-committee were being requested to review the proposed new corporate strategy and first-year operating plan prior to it being submitted to the meeting of the Joint Committee to be held on 29 June 2018 for approval.

The new corporate strategy built on the progress made over the past three years and had been developed in close consultation with local authority stakeholders and Scotland Excel staff. It aligned with the challenges facing local government and the wider public sector, responded to procurement and commercial requirements of members, and recognised Scotland Excel's need to secure sustainable funding and growth.

The four business goals which informed Scotland Excel's strategic direction had been updated to reflect the experience and influence gained and these were detailed in the report. The strategy now covered a five-year period to support a longer-term view of the organisation's future and would be reviewed at the end of year three and updated, if required. This year's operating plan set out an ambitious agenda which would lay the foundations for delivering the aims of the strategy over the next five years.

Progress reports would be produced quarterly and half-yearly and annual reports would be submitted to meetings of the Joint Committee with reports for the interim quarters submitted to the Executive Sub-committee. Reports would also track performance against strategy outcomes using fourteen key performance indicators currently being finalised.

**DECIDED**: That the report be noted.

## 6 Draft Funding Model Proposal

There was submitted a report by the Director of Scotland Excel providing an overview of potential future funding models for Scotland Excel.

The report intimated that the revenue estimates 2018/19 report presented to the Joint Committee at its meeting held on 8 December 2017 highlighted the challenging future financial landscape for local government and the impact on Scotland Excel. Throughout 2017/18 Scotland Excel had been reviewing opportunities and options to address the issue and to identify additional income. A number of successes had been achieved with projects generating additional benefits to members but each on a 'cost recovery' model.

In addition to the operational deficit there were other areas where ongoing funding gaps existed. The main area of concern was within the Scotland Excel Care Portfolio and the report provided further information on the gaps within care and the options explored in order to try and diversify its funding base.

Scotland Excel had identified other potential funding opportunities, being consultancy services, new build housing, learning and development, rebates and associate membership expansion and the report detailed a short summary on the background, financial scale and opportunity for each project.

The report highlighted that in order to facilitate the expansion of the additional services outlined in section 3 of the report Scotland Excel required to review its existing office space. Discussions were ongoing with Renfrewshire Council in relation to Scotland Excel expanding their office space within Renfrewshire House. Scotland Excel were also investigating the possibility of relocating elsewhere.

To ensure members had a full picture of the five-year forecast, indicative figures had been incorporated into the total funding gap. A number of options had been identified to address the deficit faced by Scotland Excel over the coming fiscal periods and these were detailed in the report.

#### **DECIDED**:

- (a) That it be noted that the funding opportunity projects were being progressed by Scotland Excel;
- (b) That it be noted that the Care Home for Older People project continued to seek direct funding from the participating councils for 2020/21 and beyond;
- (c) That it be noted that Scotland Excel continued to work with colleagues in Renfrewshire Council to identify methods to address the short-term deficit; and

(d) That it be noted that a report would be submitted to the meeting of the Joint Committee to be held on 29 June 2018 detailing the proposal and documenting the proposed approach that would be taken in the coming months in order to present a balanced budget to the meeting of the Joint Committee to be held on 7 December 2018.

#### Sederunt

Provost Macdonald left the meeting prior to consideration of the following item of business.

#### 7 Risk Register Update

There was submitted a report by the Director of Scotland Excel providing an update on the risk register maintained to assess threats and risks that could impact on the delivery of Scotland Excel's organisational objectives and to identify actions that had been taken to mitigate such risks. A copy of the risk register was appended to the report

**DECIDED:** That the report be noted.

#### 8 Date of Next Meeting

**<u>DECIDED</u>**: That it be noted that the next meeting of the Executive Sub-committee would be held at 9.45 am on 29 June 2018 in Glasgow City Chambers.

Page 8 of 78



#### Scotland Excel

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 29 June 2018

Report by Director Scotland Excel

Tender: Supply & Distribution of Fresh Meats, Cooked Meats and Fresh Fish

Schedule: 01/18

Period: 1 October 2018 until 30 September 2021 (with the option to extend

for up to a 1 year period until 30 September 2022)

#### 1. Introduction and Background

The current framework for fresh meats, cooked meats and fresh fish will expire on 30 September 2018. This recommendation is for the award of a renewal framework which will operate from 1 October 2018 to 30 September 2021 with the option to extend to 30 September 2022.

This framework will provide councils with a mechanism to procure a range of fresh goods including but not limited to, beef, lamb, pork, poultry, sausages, burgers, cooked meats and fresh fish. Users of the framework are likely to include schools, nurseries, leisure centres, community centres, social work, council buildings and civic centres.

The renewal incorporates a number of enhancements to the current framework including locally sourced produce and an increase in sustainable products.

The report summarises the outcome of the procurement process for this national framework arrangement.

#### 2. Scope, Participation and Spend

As part of the strategy development, the User Intelligence Group (UIG) endorsed the inclusion of four lots as summarised in Table 1. The lotting structure was also further split into geographical sub-lots allowing large and rural councils the option to split into smaller areas if required. This resulted in 41 geographical sub-lots.

**Table 1: Lotting Structure** 

Lot No.	Description	Estimated % Spend through lot
1	Fresh Meats	70%
2	Cooked Meats	23%
3	Fresh Fish	2%
4	Specialised Products	5%

This lotting structure recognises the current landscape of the market place, and is designed to more closely align with council requirements. The lotting strategy continued to maximise opportunities for SMEs.

The framework was advertised to enable access by all 32 councils in Scotland. As detailed in Appendix 1, 28 councils and Tayside Contracts have confirmed their intention to participate in this framework. Comhairle nan Eilean Siar and Orkney Islands Council have confirmed that they do not intend to participate as they currently have their own arrangements in place. Dumfries and Galloway Council and Moray Council have still to confirm their position on this.

Historical spend data would suggest a forecast framework spend of c. £8.6m per annum, but this framework was advertised with a potential value of £10 million per annum. This takes into account growth through the Scottish Government's pledge to increase the provision of free early learning and childcare provision to 1,140 hours per year by 2020 which will include a free lunch service, as well as migration of non-participating councils. It should be noted however that no guarantee is given of any business or any level of business under the framework.

#### 3. Procurement Process

A Prior Information Notice (PIN) was published on 14 December 2017 resulting in expressions of interest from 18 companies. Market engagement led to 6 supplier meetings, which helped inform the delivery strategy in areas such as ability to service, market trends, community benefits and sustainability were discussed as well as inclusion of potential products and specifications.

The User Intelligence Group (UIG), consisting of procurement and technical representatives from the participating councils, endorsed the procurement strategy at regional events in January 2018. A working group of technical representatives from the councils was formed to review the specifications and the technical criteria to adopt during the tender process. This group also played an integral role in evaluating technical responses from bidders.

To ensure maximum competition, the UIG agreed that an open tender process should be used and this was advertised on the Official Journal of the European Union and the Public Contracts Scotland portal on 29 March 2018. The tender process was conducted using the Public Contracts Scotland Tender system (PCS-T).

The procurement process followed a two stage tendering procedure. Stage one, Qualification, was conducted using the European Single Procurement

Document (ESPD). Within the ESPD, tenderers are required to answer a number of exclusionary questions along with questions on insurance, financial standing, quality management, health and safety and environmental management.

At the second stage of the process offers were evaluated against the following criteria and weightings with the technical breakdown shown in table 2 below:

Technical 20%Commercial 80%

**Table 2: Technical Scoring Breakdown** 

Area	Maximum Score Available
Fair Work Practices	2
Community Benefits	2
Servicing the Contract	4
Supply Chain Traceability	5
CO <sub>2</sub> Emissions, Food Miles & Route Planning	1
Recycling	6

Within the technical section, bidders were required to evidence their knowledge and experience by responding to technical questions, which included areas such as supply chain traceability, fair work practices, servicing the contract, reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and food miles and recycling. In addition to these questions, a scored question was also asked in relation to the commitments bidders would make in respect of community benefits.

Within the commercial section for all lots, bidders were invited to offer a net delivered price for each of the core products used by councils. Bidders also had the ability to offer variant pricing for individual geographic council sub-lots due to the varying distribution requirements of each council.

#### 4. Report on Offers Received

The tender document was downloaded by 17 organisations, with 10 tender responses received.

A summary of all offers received is provided in Appendix 2.

All respondents passed the first stage assessment. However, Hartleys Farm Foods Ltd was non-compliant with the second stage technical assessment as they failed to offer an ability to service for any council area.

Despite significant engagement with the marketplace, as per the current framework, no offer was received for the following council regions and lots:

- Argyll & Bute Council Area E Tiree & Coll Lots 1, 3 and 4
- Argyll & Bute Council Area F Islay, Jura & Colonsay Lots 1, 3 and 4
- Comhairle nan Eilean Siar Lots 1, 3 and 4

- Highland Council Lots 1, 3 and 4
- Orkney Islands Council Lots 1-4
- Shetland Islands Council Lots 1-4

Scotland Excel will continue to liaise with these councils following award of this framework, including offering assistance with any future local procurement processes.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender document, a full evaluation of the compliant offers received was completed. Appendix 3 confirms the scoring achieved by each bidder.

#### 5. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation undertaken, and in line with the criteria and weightings set out above, it is recommended that a multi supplier framework agreement is awarded to 7 suppliers across the four lots as outlined in Appendix 3.

For the recommended suppliers, Renfrewshire Council's Environmental Services has assessed self-audit documentation, as well as the latest audit reports from relevant Food Enforcement Authorities. Site audits were also conducted to ensure that recommended suppliers comply with the relevant legislation and have robust processes in place for managing a contract of this nature. All relevant reports and audits were considered to be satisfactory and compliant with requirements.

The 7 recommended suppliers provide the choice, scope and range required by councils as well as representing best value and providing geographical coverage. These 7 suppliers also represent a mix of small, medium and large organisations, with 5 of the recommended suppliers classified as SMEs.

#### 6. Benefits

#### Savings

Scotland Excel conducted a benchmarking exercise for each council based on the available historical information. The results of this benchmarking are detailed in Appendix 1.

The projected average saving across all applicable councils is 2.3%, which equates to an estimated total saving of approximately £196k per annum based on current forecast spend levels. The projected savings per council ranges from a saving of -4% to a saving of 12.2%. These costs / savings are largely dependent on the menus adopted by each council, the sustainability of the products they are using and the suppliers tendering for each council.

#### **Price Stability**

For all lots, suppliers agreed to hold both core and non-core pricing for six months. Furthermore, 6 suppliers have agreed to provide fixed pricing on core products for 12 months and 4 suppliers have agreed to provide fixed pricing on non-core products for 12 months.

#### **Sustainable Procurement Benefits**

Scotland Excel worked alongside Zero Waste Scotland during strategy and tender development to establish the most relevant sustainable factors for inclusion in the framework. Suppliers were asked to complete method statements on assisting councils with recycling on areas such as reducing plastic packaging, eliminating the use of black plastic, offering reusable, returnable packaging solutions and any food waste prevention solutions.

Some solutions offered in reducing plastic packaging included reducing the film thickness in inner plastic packs and the use of polystyrene boxes which can be returned for recycling with this further being investigated to look at replacing polystyrene with rice-based and carboard packaging. Many suppliers also use re-usable crates / delivery trays which are then returned to suppliers either immediately or on the next delivery visit where they will then be sterilised and re-used. Finally, the majority of suppliers have already eliminated the use of black plastic on their products and those that do still use it have already begun reducing the number of lines using this kind of packaging.

Examples of solutions for food waste included focusing on diverting waste to local farms as animal feed and flexibility in quantities and pack size to avoid excessive product. Suppliers also offered for excess stock to be donated to charities (where safe for consumption). Finally, workshops can also be offered on good practice across food production including stock rotation, portion control, utilising excess products and creative menu engineering.

Definitions of "country of origin of Scotland" and "manufactured in Scotland" were included within the tender to allow both elements to be monitored and recorded correctly. The origin of all products was captured through the tender process and this will be tracked during the life of the framework through quarterly management information returns.

The framework has also seen the number of sustainably sourced meat and fish products increase by 60%. Further sustainable benefits are likely to be captured through the life of the framework through planned core product reviews to further increase the number of locally sourced products.

#### **Community Benefits**

At the strategy UIG, the group endorsed that community benefits attained would be delivered at a local level for each council and would be aligned to the Scottish Government's National Indicators.

This is a different approach to the current framework and should ensure that councils receive community benefits tailored to their spend levels, and reflective of their local needs, whilst taking the National Indicators into account.

Of the 7 recommended suppliers, 6 have confirmed their commitment to Scotland Excel's community benefits approach for this framework. The supplier who has not committed to this has not done so due to their holistic approach taken to community benefits across the frameworks they are part of. Delivered

benefits will be based on the annual spend thresholds of bidder's costs provided for individual councils.

When councils reach annual spend thresholds with a supplier they will accrue "Community Benefit Points". The community benefits lead or other designated person will liaise with the bidder to finalise the specific benefits that they are offered under the framework relative to spend.

Within the published tender documents, suppliers were given a list of indicative community benefits that could be agreed with councils. Examples of the indicative benefits which were conveyed to suppliers were:

- Fundraising event for external charities / initiatives within the council area;
- Engage in community projects such as growing of food, allotment assistance, for a minimum of 10 hours;
- Work placements to school students from council area;
- Offer training sessions to wider community within the council are (nonemployees / school children);
- Employability workshop or event in a school, college or group within the council area;
- Donation of materials and / or labour to support community projects within the council area to the value of £250;
- Sponsorship of sports team or community event within the council area, to the value of £500;
- Recruit a modern (or other approved) apprentice from within the council area; and
- Recruit one person from with the council area.

Scotland Excel will support delivery of these commitments during the lifetime of the framework and this will also be reported through ongoing contract management returns. Results reported on community benefits will be disseminated to councils on a six monthly basis.

#### **Fair Work Practices**

Suppliers were also scored on how they will engage in fair work practices for staff employed in the delivery of this framework.

This included questioning suppliers on how they avoid exploitative employment practices and improve the wide diversity of their staff. In addition, suppliers were also asked for details on what training they provided for their staff, as well as how they proactively engage with them to promote empowerment so that they can fulfil their potential. Most suppliers stated that they offered development programmes for their staff, which included training and courses that looked to enhance their skills and advance their careers.

For information, suppliers were also asked to confirm their approach to the Scottish Living Wage. Of the 7 recommended suppliers:

- 2 are working towards accreditation of becoming a Scottish Living Wage supplier; and
- 1 further supplier has agreed to provide this same commitment within the initial two-year period of the Framework Contract.

Scotland Excel will continue to monitor Fair Work Practices including the Scotlish Living Wage within its contract and supplier management programme. Scotland Excel will work with all awarded suppliers who do not yet pay the Scotlish Living Wage to encourage them to achieve this.

#### 7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

In accordance with Scotland Excel's established contract and supplier management programme, this framework has been classified as a level 1 arrangement in terms of both risk and spend requiring as a minimum quarterly supplier meetings. The UIG will be convened on a regular basis throughout the framework period.

Achievement of key performance indicators as provided in the tender, such as the number of environmentally sourced products, development of SMEs / Scottish Economy and recycling quotas will be finalised and agreed at contract award.

#### 8. Summary

This framework for supply & distribution of fresh meats, cooked meats and fresh fish aims to maximise collaboration, promote added value and deliver best value. A range of benefits can be reported in relation to savings, price stability, sustainability and community benefits.

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendation to award this framework agreement to the suppliers as detailed in Appendix 3.

Page 16 of 78

## Appendix 1 – Participation, Spend and Savings Summary Fresh Meats, Cooked Meats and Fresh Fish 01-18

Member Name	Participation in	Participation Entry	Estimated Annual	Source of Spend Data	Indexation (%)	% Estimated	Estimated Annual	Basis of Savings Calculation
Member Name	Contract	Date	Spend (£)	Source of Speria Data	indexation (%)	Forecast Savings	Savings (£)	basis of Savings Calculation
Aberdeen City Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£454,473	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-2.9%	-£13,200	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Aberdeenshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£645,679	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-4.0%	-£25,515	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Angus Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£34,073	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	11.5%	£3,914	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Argyll & Bute Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£143,545	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-1.1%	-£1,586	Benchmarked Current Contract*
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£566,440	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	7.2%	£40,740	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Clackmannanshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£51,858	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	8.1%	£4,192	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	No		-	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member				
Dumfries & Galloway Council	TBC	TBC	£319,234	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	2.2%	£7,023	Average Benchmark
Dundee City Council	Yes	01 October 2018	-	Contained within Tayside Contracts Spend				
East Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£114,945	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	12.2%	£14,060	Benchmarked Current Contract*
East Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£132,988	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	2.9%	£3,905	Benchmarked Current Contract*
East Lothian Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£151,398	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	5.1%	£7,734	Benchmarked Current Contract*
East Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£139,892	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	2.4%	£3,423	Benchmarked Current Contract
Falkirk Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£197,043	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	1.9%	£3,734	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Fife Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£456,333	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-1.0%	-£4,471	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Glasgow City Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£1,037,000	Member Provided	4.0%	4.7%	£48,573	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Highland Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£124,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-0.2%	-£306	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Inverclyde Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£136,351	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	4.7%	£6,380	Benchmarked Current Contract
Midlothian Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£106,273	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	0.0%	-£23	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Moray Council	TBC	TBC	-					
North Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£442,793	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-4.0%	-£17,811	Benchmarked Current Contract*
North Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£624,227	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	1.9%	£11,890	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Orkney Islands Council	No		-					
Perth & Kinross Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£33,783	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	6.3%	£2,115	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£277,283	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	4.1%	£11,489	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Scottish Borders Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£200,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	4.0%	£7,922	Benchmarked Current Contract
Shetland Islands Council	Yes		-					
South Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£179,136	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	6.8%	£12,243	Benchmarked Current Contract*
South Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£417,709	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	-1.8%	-£7,378	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Stirling Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£168,608	Member Provided	4.0%	2.2%	£3,709	Average Benchmark
West Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£273,849	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	7.8%	£21,453	Benchmarked Current Contract*
West Lothian Council	Yes	01 October 2018	£479,886	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	6.9%	£32,966	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Tayside Contracts	Yes	01 October 2018	£594,391	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.0%	2.9%	£16,962	Benchmarked Current Contract*
Totals			£8,503,190			2.3%	£194,138	
Associate Members	Yes	01 October 2018	£95,000	Member Provided	4.0%	2.2%	£2,090	Average Benchmark
Totals			£8,598,190			2.3%	£196,228	

Asterisk (\*) denotes confirmation TBC

Indexation - This column confirms the difference when the relevant market indices are compared with the relevant Contract indices derived from framework specific cost drivers/

## Appendix 2 - SME Status

Company Name	SME Status	Location	Lots Offered
Brake Bros Ltd	Large	Ashford, Kent	2
Campbell Brothers Ltd	Medium	Bonnyrigg, Midlothian	1 - 4
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	Large	Linlithgow, West Lothian	1 - 4
Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd	Small	Aberdeen, Aberdeen City	1, 2 and 3
John Gilmour Butchers	Small	Macmerry, East Lothian	1
J Pieroni & Sons Ltd	Small	Ayr, South Ayrshire	3 and 4
McLays Ltd	Medium	Glasgow, Glasgow City	1 - 4
PFD (Carlisle) Ltd. t/a Pioneer Foodservice	Medium	Carlisle, Cumbria	1 and 2
Dennis Thomson (Fresh Meat) Ltd	Small	Dumfries, Dumfries & Galloway	2

Page 20 of 78

## Appendix 3 - Scoring and Recommendations <sup>1</sup>

Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
Aberdeen City Council	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd*	91.00		Aberdeeshire Counc
Aberdeen aty countri	Campbell Brothers Ltd	90.89		Aberdeesiiire Counc
			•	
Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
Angus Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63		Argyll & Bute Council Area A
Aligus Coulidit - Noll School Wears	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.89		
			•	
Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area B - Oban & Lorne	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75		Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid
Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area D - Helensburgh &	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63		Argyll & Bute Council Area E - 1
Lomand	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	81.55		
Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
gyll & Bute Council Area F - Islay, Jura & Colonsay	NO OFFER	N/A		Argyll & Bute Council Area
			<u>.</u> '	
Council	Supplier	Lot 1		Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area H - Bute	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75		
			•'	City of Edinburgh Cour
9 11	Committee.			

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Clackmannanshire Council	McLays Ltd*	96.10
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.94
	John Gilmour Butchers	65.74

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Dumfries & Galloway Council	PFD (Carlisle) Ltd. t/a Pioneer Foodservice*	93.50
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	91.93
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.90

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
East Ayrshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.42

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Aberdeeshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd	87.43

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Argyll & Bute Council Area A - Cowal	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid Argyll & Kintyre	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Argyll & Bute Council Area E - Tiree & Coll	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Argyll & Bute Council Area G - Mull	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
City of Edinburgh Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.45
	John Gilmour Butchers	78.51

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.54
	John Gilmour Butchers	79.88

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
East Dunbartonshire Council	McLays Ltd*	98.63
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	91.93
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.90

<sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
East Lothian Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.64
	John Gilmour Butchers	73.89

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Falkirk Council	McLays Ltd*	98.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.39
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	82.68
	John Gilmour Butchers	82.33

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Glasgow City Council	McLays Ltd*	98.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	85.86
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	85.63
	John Gilmour Butchers	63.17

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Inverclyde Council	McLays Ltd*	98.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	91.43
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	89.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Moray Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
North Ayrshire Council - Isle of Arran	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Orkney Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
East Renfrewshire Council	McLays Ltd*	93.93
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.48

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.38
	John Gilmour Butchers	72.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Highland Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Midlothian Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	83.35
	John Gilmour Butchers	75.22

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
North Ayrshire Council - Mainland & Cumbrae	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	85.77

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
North Lanarkshire Council	McLays Ltd*	94.29
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.48

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Perth & Kinross Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.20
	John Gilmour Butchers	73.07

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> \* Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Renfrewshire Council	McLays Ltd*	95.53
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.82

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Shetland Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.06
South Lanarkshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
	John Gilmour Butchers	81.54

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Townide Courtments	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Tayside Contracts	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.89

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	91.01
	John Gilmour Butchers	69.08

<sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Scottish Borders Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.97
	John Gilmour Butchers	71.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
Cough Armshine Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
South Ayrshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	89.38

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Stirling Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	83.33
	John Gilmour Butchers	75.75

Council	Supplier	Lot 1
West Dunbartonshire Council	McLays Ltd*	98.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	91.15
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	86.85

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Aberdeen City Council	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd*	91.00
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	76.71

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
Angus Council - Non School Meals	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	92.98
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	84.55

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area B - Oban & Lorne	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.99
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area D - Helensburgh & Lomand	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.79
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	68.65

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area F - Islay, Jura & Colonsay	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area H - Bute	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.99
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Clackmannanshire Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	86.23
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	80.97
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	70.74

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	93.02
	Thomson Foodservice Ltd t/a Dennis Thomson (Fresh Meat) Ltd	91.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.41
	PFD (Carlisle) Ltd. t/a Pioneer Foodservice	89.14
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	82.25

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Aberdeeshire Council	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd*	91.00
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	83.03

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area A - Cowal	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.99
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid Argyll & Kintyre	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.99
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2	l
Argyll & Bute Council Area E - Tiree & Coll	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50	

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Argyll & Bute Council Area G - Mull	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.99
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
City of Edinburgh Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Brakes Bros Ltd	90.01
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	71.58

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	92.98
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	84.55

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.10
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	82.04

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.59
	Brakes Bros Ltd	94.50
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	74.85

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Falkirk Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	88.93
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	76.98
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	70.07

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Glasgow City Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	90.92
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	80.49
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	71.76

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Inverclyde Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.10
	McLays Ltd	87.79
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	79.72

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Moray Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	74.44

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
North Ayrshire Council - Isle of Arran	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Brakes Bros Ltd	85.25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> \* Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
East Dunbartonshire Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	85.24
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	79.49
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	75.87

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
East Renfrewshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	90.15
	McLays Ltd	70.39
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	65.51

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	69.70
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	65.25

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Highland Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	75.68
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	70.08

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
North Ayrshire Council - Mainland & Cumbrae	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Brakes Bros Ltd	88.21
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	68.38

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
North Lanarkshire Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	84.74
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	78.02
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	75.04

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Orkney Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Renfrewshire Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	88.47
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	86.10
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	78.59

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Shetland Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	84.99
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	78.81

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	77.07
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	72.57

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
West Lothian Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.05
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	73.36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	85.60
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	83.29

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	83.42
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	78.57

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	83.29
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	77.12

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
Stirling Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	89.60

Council	Supplier	Lot 2
West Dunbartonshire Council	Brakes Bros Ltd*	94.50
	McLays Ltd	89.30
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	86.45
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	78.96

Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Aberdeen City Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	Aberdeeshire Council
Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Angus Council - Non School Meals	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75	Argyll & Bute Council Area A
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63	
Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area B - Oban & Lorne	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75	Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid A
Algyir & Bute Council Area B - Oban & Lonie	campben's Pinne Meat Liu	90.75	Algyii & Bute council Alea C- Wild A
Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area D - Helensburgh &	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	Argyll & Bute Council Area E - Ti
Lomand	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	86.65	
Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area F - Islay, Jura & Colonsay	NO OFFER	N/A	Argyll & Bute Council Area G
Council	Cumplion	Lot 3	Council
Argyll & Bute Council Area H - Bute	Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75	Council
		<u> </u>	City of Euroburgh Counc
Council	Supplier	Lot 3	Council
Council	Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd*	Lot 3 92.63	Council
Council Clackmannanshire Council			Council
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	Council
Clackmannanshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd	92.63 87.86 87.33	Council Comhairle nan Eilean Si
	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier	92.63 87.86 87.33	Council
Clackmannanshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34	Council Comhairle nan Eilean Si
Clackmannanshire Council  Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier	92.63 87.86 87.33	Council Comhairle nan Eilean S  Council
Clackmannanshire Council  Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63	Council Comhairle nan Eilean S  Council
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63	Council Comhairle nan Eilean S  Council Dundee City Council - Non Scho
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63	Council  Comhairle nan Eilean S  Council  Dundee City Council - Non Scho
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council  Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63	Council  Comhairle nan Eilean S  Council  Dundee City Council - Non Scho
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council  Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63 92.63	Comhairle nan Eilean Si  Council  Dundee City Council - Non Scho
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council  Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63 92.63	Council  Comhairle nan Eilean Si  Council  Dundee City Council - Non Scho
Clackmannanshire Council  Council  Dumfries & Galloway Council  Council  East Ayrshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd McLays Ltd  Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd  Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd*  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  J Pieroni & Sons Ltd	92.63 87.86 87.33 Lot 3 96.34 92.63 Lot 3 92.63 92.17 87.45	Council  Comhairle nan Eilean Si  Council  Dundee City Council - Non Scho  Council  East Dunbartonshire Cou

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 1}$  \* Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Aberdeeshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	•	
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Argyll & Bute Council Area A - Cowal	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
		<u>-</u>
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid Argyll & Kintyre	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Argyll & Bute Council Area E - Tiree & Coll	NO OFFER	N/A
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Argyll & Bute Council Area G - Mull	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
City of Edinburgh Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.72
city of Edinburgh Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	NO OFFER	N/A
Council  Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Supplier Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Campbell Brothers Ltd	Lot 3 96.34 92.63
	campoen brothers ata	32.00
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
East Dunbartonshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.88
	McLays Ltd	88.14
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
East Renfrewshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	91.26
	1	I -

McLays Ltd

88.67

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Falkirk Council	McLays Ltd	88.50
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	86.62
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Glasgow City Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	88.59
	McLays Ltd	87.33
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Inverclyde Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	87.86
	McLays Ltd	87.33
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Moray Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
Council	Supplier	Lot 3
North Ayrshire Council - Isle of Arran	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
13. a. Ayisime council 13te of Allan	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd	91.03

Ī	Council	Supplier	Lot 3
ſ	Orkney Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Renfrewshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	McLays Ltd	91.24
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	89.21

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Shetland Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

<sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Fife Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.67
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Highland Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Midlothian Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.43
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	92.17
	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd	87.45

	Council	Supplier	Lot 3
North Lanarkshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	
	McLays Ltd	83.91	
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	81.35	

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Perth & Kinross Council - Non School Meals	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.35
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Scottish Borders Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	93.30
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
South Ayrshire Council	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd	89.82
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	89.53

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
South Lanarkshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	93.82
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Tayside Contracts	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.34
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
West Lothian Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.12
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> \* Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
Stirling Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.36
	Campbell Brothers Ltd	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 3
West Dunbartonshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	McLays Ltd	88.68
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd	85.30

Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd*	91.00	Abardoashira Council	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) L
Campbell Brothers Ltd*	88.32	Aberdeesinie Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	Argyll & Bute Council Area A - Cowal	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32		•
•	<u>-</u>		
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75	Argyll & Bute Council Area C - Mid Argyll & Kintyre	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
•	<u>-</u>		
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	Argyll & Bute Council Area E - Tiree & Coll	NO OFFER
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	88.99		-
·	<u> </u>		
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
	N/A	Argyll & Bute Council Area G - Mull	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
<u></u>	,	<u> </u>	,
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75		Campbell Brothers Ltd*
_ ·	<u>'</u>	City of Edinburgh Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
			•
Supplier	Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75	Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	NO OFFER
Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11		
McLays Ltd*	70.47		
	/9.4/		
Meta ya Eta	79.47		
1	79.47 Lot 4	Council	Supplier
Supplier	Lot 4		Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd*
Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd*	Lot 4 92.63	Council  Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd*
Supplier	Lot 4		''
Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	Lot 4 92.63 92.32	Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	Lot 4 92.63 92.32		Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Supplier
Supplier Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	Lot 4 92.63 92.32	Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd* Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*
	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd*  Campbell Brothers Ltd*  Supplier  Campbell Brothers Ltd*  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Supplier  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Supplier  Campbell Brothers Ltd*  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Supplier  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Supplier  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Supplier  Y NO OFFER  Supplier  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd* 91.00 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 88.32  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 92.32  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 88.99  Supplier Lot 4 Y NO OFFER N/A  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75  Campbell Brothers Ltd* 96.75  Campbell Brothers Ltd* 90.11	Gordon McWilliam (Aberdeen) Ltd* 91.00 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 88.32  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 92.32  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 92.63 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 88.99  Supplier Lot 4 Vincoloffer N/A  Supplier Lot 4 Council Area E - Tiree & Coll Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* Council Area G - Mull  Supplier Lot 4 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75  Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75 Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd* 96.75 Campbell Brothers Ltd* 90.11

91.00 90.29

Lot 4 96.75

Lot 4 96.75

Lot 4 N/A

Lot 4 96.75

Lot 4 92.63 92.32

Lot 4 N/A

Lot 4 92.63 92.32

96.75 90.11 79.47

<sup>1 \*</sup> Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
East Lothian Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Falkirk Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
Glasgow City Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	88.19
	McLays Ltd*	77.97

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
Inverclyde Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Mora y Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
North Ayrshire Council - Isle of Arran	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	94.72
	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd*	93.63

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Orkney Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
Renfrewshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Shetland Islands Council	NO OFFER	N/A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> \* Denotes supplier recommended as part-successful

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
East Renfrewshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Fife Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	90.62

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Highland Council	NO OFFER	N/A

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Midlothian Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.06
North Ayrshire Council - Mainland & Cumbrae	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd*	89.60

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
North Lanarkshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Perth & Kinross Council - Non School Meals	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Scottish Borders Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	88.99

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
South Ayrshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	95.06
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	J Pieroni & Sons Ltd*	89.60

	Council	Supplier	Lot 4
South Lanarkshire Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63	
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32	

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Tayside Contracts	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
West Lothian Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

1 * Denotes	supplier	recommen	ded as	part-suc	cessful

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
Stirling Council	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	92.63
	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	92.32

Council	Supplier	Lot 4
West Dunbartonshire Council	Campbell's Prime Meat Ltd*	96.75
	Campbell Brothers Ltd*	90.11
	McLays Ltd*	79.47



#### **Scotland Excel**

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 29 June 2018

Report by Director Scotland Excel

Tender: Supply and Delivery of Roadstone

Schedule: 28/17

Period: 1 July 2018 until 30 June 2022 (effective date 23 July 2018)

#### 1. Introduction and Background

The current framework for Roadstone will expire on 30 June 2018. This recommendation is for the award of a renewal framework which will operate from 23 July 2018 until 30 June 2022. This framework covers a range of coated, uncoated and recycled roadstone, as well as ready mixed concrete to support the requirements of councils' road departments.

This renewal incorporates a number of enhancements to the current framework including additional products, the removal of any limits on the number of quarries or plants offered and an increased commercial focus on distribution costs.

The report summarises the outcome of the procurement process for this national framework arrangement.

#### 2. Scope, Participation and Spend

As part of the strategy development, the User Intelligence Group (UIG) confirmed a level of satisfaction with the current framework and endorsed the inclusion of four lots as summarised in Table 1. This strategy is designed to align with council requirements, whilst also recognising the current structure of the market place, as well as maximising opportunities for local SME participation.

**Table 1: Lotting Structure** 

Lot Number	Description	Estimated % of Spend
1	Coated Roadstone	80%
2	Uncoated Roadstone	5%
3	Recycled Roadstone	5%
4	Ready Mixed Concrete	10%

As detailed in Appendix 1, 10 Councils have confirmed that they will participate in this framework renewal. Scotland Excel will liaise with all non-participating authorities to update them on the improvements and potential savings offered by this second-generation renewal framework, to encourage authorities to review their best value option for this commodity and encourage councils to participate in the framework once their own arrangement concludes.

As a number of councils have their own contracts currently in place, to ensure that all 32 councils have the option to use the framework, all councils have been listed in the EU notice as participants so that they have the opportunity to use the Scotland Excel framework where it provides them with best value.

The contract was advertised with an estimated value of £20m over the 4-year period. The forecast annual spend for participating councils is circa £3m per annum and the framework was advertised at a value of £5m per annum to allow for growth within participating Councils, and increased participation from Councils or cross sector collaborations.

#### 3. Procurement Process

A UIG consisting of representatives from participating councils endorsed the procurement strategy on 25 January 2018. In addition, a working group of technical and procurement representatives was formed to review the lot structure, technical specifications and participate in the evaluation.

A Prior Information Notice (PIN) was published on 9 December 2017, which resulted in expressions of interest from 18 organisations. Thereafter, in order to ensure maximum competition, the UIG agreed that an open tender process should be followed to establish the framework.

The Contract Notice was published via the Official Journal of the European Union and the Public Contracts Scotland portal (PCS) on 2 May 2018 with the tender documentation being made available for immediate download from 4 May 2018, via the Public Contracts Scotland Tenders (PCS-T) system.

The procurement process followed a two stage tendering procedure. At the first stage, tender European Single Procurement Document (ESPD) Scotland responses were assessed against financial capability, technical/professional capability and business probity requirements. Bidders were required to pass this stage to be eligible for award. At the second stage, offers were evaluated against the following criteria and weightings.

Technical 20% Commercial 80% **Table 2: Technical Scoring Breakdown** 

Area	Maximum Score Available
Sustainability	4
Operational Processes	10
Community Benefits	4
Fair Work Practices	2

Within the technical section, bidders were required to evidence their knowledge and experience by responding to method statements which covered areas including; sustainability, operational processes and community benefits. In addition to these questions, bidders were asked to provide added value suggestions to councils.

Bidders were also asked to confirm which council areas they had the ability to service.

Within the commercial section, bidders were invited to offer on a lot by lot basis and provide prices for a range of the most commonly used roadstone/concrete products. In addition, bidders were asked to provide prices for delivery rates on a per tonne/ per cubic metre basis.

Fixed pricing for 3 months was requested for lot 1 and fixed pricing for 12 months was requested for lots 2, 3 and 4, with further options for bidders to confirm if they are willing to offer longer periods of fixed pricing or early settlement discounts.

#### 4. Report on Offers Received

The tender document was downloaded by 25 organisations, with 14 tender responses received.

A summary of all offers received is provided in Appendix 2.

It should be noted that no offers were received to service Orkney Council or Shetland Islands Council areas.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender document, a full evaluation of the compliant offers received was carried out. Appendix 3 sets out the scoring achieved by each bidder.

#### 5. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation undertaken, and in line with the criteria and weightings set out above, it is recommended that a multi supplier framework arrangement is awarded to 14 suppliers across the four lots as outlined in Appendix 3.

The 14 recommended suppliers can meet operational requirements, provide a range of choice and capacity for council members, whilst also representing a

mix of small, medium and large organisations, with 11 of the recommended suppliers classified as SMEs.

#### 6. Benefits

#### Savings

Scotland Excel conducted a benchmarking exercise for each council and the results of this benchmarking are detailed in Appendix 1.

The benchmarking exercise was based on the existing framework prices and compared these against the new framework prices for each council, taking into account which suppliers have agreed to service each council. This was evaluated by comparing lot 1 core product roadstone prices available on the current framework compared to the framework renewal prices.

The projected savings per council range from 8% to 21%, which equates to an estimated total saving of approximately £565k per annum based on current forecast spend levels.

Potential savings at point of call offs by councils may vary due to the variable costs of distribution from the location of quarry to destination. Distribution costs have been identified within the tender to assist councils in achieving best value.

#### **Price Stability**

All service providers have agreed to the stated fixed price period at the start of the framework. Provision thereafter is for price reviews quarterly for lot 1 and annually for lots 2, 3 and 4 to accommodate market fluctuations. All requests for price increases will be evaluated against prevailing market conditions and supporting documentary evidence.

In addition to the mandatory fixed pricing periods for all lots, 3 of the recommended suppliers have offered further additional fixed pricing periods for a further 12 month period.

#### **Sustainable Procurement Benefits**

Within the technical section of the tender, the sustainability method statement assessed bidders in relation to their corporate approach to sustainability and how their organisation promotes recycle, reuse and reduce initiatives to minimise the impact of the supply chain on the environment. A range of sustainable measures were outlined by service providers including;

- Recycling aggregates where possible;
- Implementing environmental initiatives;
- Controlling their fleet/vehicle environmental standards;
- Reducing carbon footprint and emissions;
- Waste reduction and
- End of life recycling / disposing.

## **Community Benefits**

Bidders were also asked to detail and demonstrate their commitment to providing community benefits, and this will be further discussed during framework mobilisation and reported through ongoing contract management returns. Results reported on community benefits will be disseminated to councils on a six-monthly basis. A range of community benefits dependent on spend levels were offered by bidders including:

- Sponsorship of local sports teams
- Sponsorship of community events
- Recruitment of modern apprentices
- Work experience to school children and further education students
- Assist in community projects
- Offer training sessions to council apprentices
- Workshop/school/college event
- Employability workshop or event
- Donation of product vouchers
- Recruitment

## Fair Work Practices including the Living Wage

Bidders were asked a question on their approach to Fair Work Practices and the Scottish Living Wage status. Of the 14 recommended service providers:

- 4 are accredited Scottish Living Wage Employers;
- 1 is currently going through the process of becoming an accredited Scottish Living Wage Employer;
- 3 have agreed to provide this same commitment within the initial twoyear period of the Framework Contract; and
- 4 are not currently accredited Scottish Living Wage Employers, but do pay the Scottish Living Wage to all employees (except volunteers, apprentices and interns).

Scotland Excel will continue to monitor Fair Work Practices including the Scotlish Living Wage within its contract and supplier management programme. Scotland Excel will work with all awarded suppliers who do not yet pay all staff the Scotlish Living Wage to encourage them to achieve this.

## 7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

All service providers and participating members will be issued with a mobilisation pack containing all required details to launch the framework. Each service provider will be invited to a mobilisation meeting, if required, to outline the operation of the framework, roles and responsibilities, management information requirements and community benefits commitments.

In accordance with Scotland Excel's established contract and supplier management programme, this framework has been classified as a category 2 arrangement in terms of both risk and spend requiring annual supplier and user group reviews as appropriate.

# 8. Summary

This framework for the supply and delivery of roadstone and ready mixed concrete aims to maximise collaboration, support councils' roads departments to deliver the various services they provide, promote added value and deliver best value. A range of benefits can be reported in relation to best value, price stability, sustainability and community benefits.

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendation to award this framework agreement to the suppliers as detailed in Appendix 3.



# Appendix 1 – Participation, Spend and Savings Summary – Supply and Delivery of Roadstone 28/17

				ROADSTONE FRAMEV	/ORK				
	Participate In	Participation	Est. Annual			% Estimated	<b>Estimated Annual</b>		
Member Name	Framework	Entry Date	Spend (£)	Source of Spend	Indexation	Forecast Savings	Savings (£)	Basis of Savings Calculation	
Aberdeen City Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	11%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Aberdeenshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	11%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Angus Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	13%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Argyll & Bute Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	21%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Clackmannanshire Council	Yes	Contract Start	£5,000	Contract MI	-8%	11%	£550	Benchmarked current framework	
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar Council	Yes	Sep-18	£300,000	Council Confirmed	-8%	16%	£48,000	Benchmarked current framework	
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Yes	Contract Start	£5,000	Contract MI	-8%	15%	£750	Benchmarked current framework	
Oundee City Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	18%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
ast Ayrshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	14%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
ast Dunbartonshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	17%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
ast Lothian Council	Yes	Contract Start	£30,000	Council Confirmed	-8%	8%	£2,400	Benchmarked current framework	
ast Renfrewshire Council	Yes	Contract Start	£331,965	Council Confirmed	-8%	16%	£53,114	Benchmarked current framework	
dinburgh City Council	Yes	Contract Start	£400,000	Council Confirmed	-8%	8%	£32,000	Benchmarked current framework	
alkirk Council	Yes	Contract Start	£1,300,000	Council Confirmed	-8%	17%	£221,000	Benchmarked current framework	
ife Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	13%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Glasgow City Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	14%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
lighland Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
nverclyde Council	Yes	Contract Start	£366,725	Contract MI	-8%	14%	£51,342	Benchmarked current framework	
Midlothian Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	8%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Moray Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	12%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
North Ayrshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	14%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
North Lanarkshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
Orkney Islands Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
erth & Kinross Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	13%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
enfrewshire Council	Yes	Contract Start	£189,480	Contract MI	-8%	15%	£28,422	Benchmarked current framework	
cottish Borders Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	7%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
hetland Islands Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
outh Ayrshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	14%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
outh Lanarkshire Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	14%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
tirling Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
ayside Contracts	No	-	-	-	-8%	-	-	-	
Vest Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	Contract Start	£850,000	Council Confirmed	-8%	15%	£127,500	Benchmarked current framework	
Vest Lothian Council	No	-	-	-	-8%	10%	-	Benchmarked current framework	
Totals			£3,778,171			13.3%	£565,078		

<sup>\*</sup> Indexation: this column confirms the difference when the relevant marked indicies are compared with the relevant Contract indices derived from framework specific cost drivers.



# Appendix 2 - SME Status

TENDERER	SME STATUS	LOCATION	LOTS OFFERED
Beatsons Building Supplies Ltd	Medium	Alloa	4
Breedon Northern Limited	Large	Angus	1, 2, 3, 4
Cemex UK Materials Limited	Large	Warwickshire	1
D. Geddes (Contractors) Limited	Medium	Angus	1, 2, 3, 4
Fleximix Concrete Ltd	Micro	Broxburn, West Lothian	4
Hillhouse Quarry Group Limited	Medium	Troon	1, 2, 3, 4
John Gunn & Sons Limited	Small	Caithness	1, 2, 4
Tarmac Trading Limited	Large	Birmingham	1, 2
Leiths (Scotland) Limited	Medium	Aberdeen	1, 2, 3, 4
MacDonald Groundworks Ltd	Medium	Inverness	2, 4
Patersons of Greenoakhill Limited	Small	Coatbridge	2, 4
Pat Munro (Alness) Limited	Medium	Alness	1, 2, 3, 4
Tillicoultry Quarries Limited	Medium	Kincardine on Forth	1, 2, 4
William Thompson & Son (Dumbarton) Limited	Medium	Dumbarton	2, 3, 4

Page 42 of 78



# **Appendix 3 - Scoring and Recommendations** (Asterisk (\*) denotes recommended supplier)

LOT 1 - Coated Roadstone						
Tenderer	Score					
Hillhouse Quarry Group Limited**	97.00					
Tillicoultry Quarries Limited**	92.86					
Cemex UK Materials Limited**	85.45					
Tarmac Trading Limited**	83.96					
Breedon Northern Limited**	72.99					
Pat Munro (Alness) Limited**	65.40					
Leiths (Scotland) Limited**	61.69					
D. Geddes (Contractors) Limited**	60.10					
John Gunn & Sons Limited**	59.51					

LOT 3 - Recycled Roadstone							
Tenderer	Score						
Hillhouse Quarry Group Limited**	95.16						
Breedon Northern Limited**	92.57						
William Thompson & Son (Dumbarton) Limited**	91.50						
Leiths (Scotland) Limited**	88.71						
Pat Munro (Alness) Limited**	88.17						
D. Geddes (Contractors) Limited**	85.47						

LOT 2 - Uncoated Roadstone						
Tenderer	Score					
Hillhouse Quarry Group Limited**	91.64					
John Gunn & Sons Limited**	88.02					
Patersons of Greenoakhill Limited**	87.60					
Tillicoultry Quarries Limited**	84.70					
D. Geddes (Contractors) Limited**	78.28					
Breedon Northern Limited**	78.09					
William Thompson & Son (Dumbarton) Limited**	77.96					
MacDonald Groundworks Ltd**	77.46					
Tarmac Trading Limited**	77.18					
Leiths (Scotland) Limited**	71.32					
Pat Munro (Alness) Limited**	71.00					

LOT 4 - Ready Mixed Concrete						
Tenderer	Score					
Patersons of Greenoakhill Limited**	88.53					
Hillhouse Quarry Group Limited**	84.34					
William Thompson & Son (Dumbarton) Limited**	83.11					
Tillicoultry Quarries Limited**	82.66					
D. Geddes (Contractors) Limited**	81.52					
Breedon Northern Limited**	76.40					
Pat Munro (Alness) Limited**	75.94					
Leiths (Scotland) Limited**	68.09					
John Gunn & Sons Limited**	65.55					
MacDonald Groundworks Ltd**	65.23					
Fleximix Concrete Ltd**	65.09					
Beatsons Building Supplies Ltd**	56.40					

Page 44 of 78



# **Scotland Excel**

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 29 June 2018

Report by Director Scotland Excel

**Tender: Social Care Agency Workers** 

Schedule: 20/17

Period: 1 August 2018 to 31 July 2022

# 1. Introduction and Background

This recommendation is for the award of a national framework arrangement for social care agency workers.

Agency workers are individuals who are supplied by a recruitment agency to work for a third party, in this case, councils and Scotland Excel associate members ("purchasers").

In the current social care environment, purchasers face challenges employing and retaining staff, therefore creating a requirement to employ agency workers on a short-term basis when covering gaps in staffing to supplement a purchaser's permanent workforce from time to time.

As such, the key objectives of this framework are as follows:

- Assist purchasers to consolidate and manage expenditure on social care agency workers to ensure best value;
- Provide detailed management information (MI) by stipulating reporting requirements in the contract terms;
- Increase competition to encourage maximum response from the market and from small and medium sized enterprises (SME's);
- Address supply issues in rural areas of Scotland;
- Fix pricing for two years as a minimum, providing purchasers with pricing stability;
- Encourage innovative approaches to reduce transaction costs for timesheets, billing and invoicing;
- Deliver a range of community benefits and sustainability objectives.

The framework also aims to bring flexibility and scope to meet the everchanging needs of the care and support market by allowing the addition of new suppliers throughout the duration of the agreement where required to enable the continued delivery of best value, and sufficient geographic and service coverage across all of Scotland.

# 2. Scope, Participation and Spend

The procurement strategy was discussed and endorsed at the user intelligence group (UIG) meeting on 9 August 2017. Purchasers expressed a wish to renew the framework with the aim to expand the coverage of the framework, both in terms of the roles provided and the geographical coverage of the framework. The structure of the framework was based on the current model, but with some adaptations to respond to purchaser feedback.

The lotting structure was streamlined into three lots, each lot incorporating new core roles to expand the service coverage of the framework:

**Table 1: Lotting Structure** 

Lot		Number of Core	% Estimated
No.	Description	Roles	Framework Value
1	Care Roles	4	85%
2	Professional Roles	6	12%
3	Ancillary Roles	5	3%

Additionally, each lot was divided into 17 geographical regions to encourage SME participation and allow suppliers operating in specific geographical areas to submit competitive bids. Each lot contained detailed specifications for the core roles within the lot.

The framework is available to all 32 councils, NHS National Procurement, the Scottish Prison Service and a number of associate member housing associations.

Although there is no guarantee of purchaser spend or continuity of spend throughout the flexible framework agreement, council forecasting indicates use of the framework would be anticipated from at least 27 councils, as well as other participating bodies. The remaining councils indicated that they operate in house 'banks' of staff, and therefore annual expenditure may be negligible. While councils confirmed they wished to be named to provide flexibility in their social care workforce, the market was also advised of indicative percentages of spend to ensure transparency.

## 3. Procurement Process

The UIG consisting of procurement and technical representatives endorsed the procurement strategy. In addition, a technical panel was formed to develop technical specifications and tender documentation.

Dialogue was also held with suppliers via a Prior Information Notice. These discussions were used to inform the final procurement strategy - particularly in

developing the flexible approach designed to meet the requirements of the social care recruitment market.

Scotland Excel took the strategic decision, supported by the UIG, to structure the tender so that tenderers would not be penalised for offering a fair rate of pay to their agency workers. In recognition of this, tenderers were asked to submit a range of hourly rates for each core role to provide flexibility and choice for councils depending on their specific requirements. To ensure transparency of costs, the total hourly fee payable for an agency worker was split into the following elements with only the supplier's fee evaluated under the tender:

- Agency worker's rate the hourly rate payable to the agency worker from the supplier
- Supplier's contribution legally required contributions relating to national insurance, Working Time Regulations, pension, apprenticeship levy and any other applicable national contributions
- Supplier's fee the commission received by a supplier per hourly rate paid to the agency worker

The remit of this procurement falls within the 'Social and Other Specific Services' category as defined in Schedule 3, and is subject to the procurement regimes set out in section 7, both of the Public Contracts (Scotland) Regulations 2015. These regulations contain a more flexible set of rules for the procurement of certain services (including those related to the provision of social care) and this is known as the 'light-touch' regime. The 'light-touch' regime gives broader options for the procurement of care services and therefore this framework has been developed as a flexible framework.

As such, Scotland Excel has more scope to choose the procurement methodology most suited to the market whilst fundamentally adhering to the EU Treaty principles of non-discrimination, equal treatment, transparency and proportionality.

Scotland Excel has adopted a procedure similar to an open tender procedure under the 'light-touch' regime and providers were evaluated against predetermined criteria. Stage one, Qualification, was conducted using the European Single Procurement Document (ESPD). Within the ESPD tenderers are required to answer a number of qualification questions along with questions on insurance, financial standing, quality management, health and safety and environmental management.

Applying the light touch regime and considering the fluctuating needs of purchasers, this framework has been developed to be a flexible framework, permitting new entrants and changes to existing participants on the published tender conditions during the framework.

The invitation to tender (ITT) was published on 12 February 2018 and offers were evaluated against the following criteria:

- Technical 40%
- Commercial 60%

Within the technical element, tenderers were assessed on their approach to community benefits and sustainability and their commitment to delivering fair work practices. Tenderers were also required to evidence their knowledge and experience by responding to four method statements. The available scoring was broken down as follows:

**Table 2: Technical Scoring Breakdown** 

Quality (40%)	Quality Sub Criteria	
Community Benefits (4%)		
Sustainability, including Fair	Corporate Sustainability Approach	2%
Work Practises (4%)	Fair Work Practices	2%
	Managing Recruitment	8%
Method Statement Questions	Account Management & Customer Service	8%
(32%)	Complaints & Issues	8%
	Service Capabilities	8%

As noted previously, within the commercial element, the supplier's fee was the only element of the total fee payable which was evaluated. In addition, tenderers were assessed in relation to the long-term assignment discounts offered.

# 4. Report on Offers Received

There were offers received from 48 suppliers, across the three lots, as set out in Appendix 2.

Three submissions were noted to be identical in all aspects, with the exception the scored elements of the commercial envelope. The tenderers were requested to provide evidence that they would operate as three distinct entities. Following extensive clarifications two tenderers subsequently withdrew their tender submissions.

A number of organisations submitted proposals to amend the framework terms. After extensive review, all proposals for amendment were rejected. One tenderer subsequently withdrew their tender submission.

A further tenderer withdrew at the Request for Documentation stage, citing increased business elsewhere leaving them unable to meet requirements.

Two tenderers submitted non-compliant offers for all lots/geographical regions. A further two tenderers submitted one non-compliant offer each for specific lot/geographical regions. Any offer deemed non-compliant offer was not evaluated.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender documentation, a full evaluation of the remaining compliant offers received was conducted and details of the overall scores are set out in Appendix 3.

#### 5. Recommendations

In order to provide a range of providers for each region, to provide coverage and choice, it is recommended that participation on the flexible framework is awarded to 15 tenderers, as detailed in Appendix 3.

The 15 providers represent a mix of micro, small, medium and large organisations, with four being classed as small or micro.

#### 6. Benefits

#### Savings

Scotland Excel has conducted a benchmarking exercise against the supplier's fee for all three lots.

Due to past difficulties in recruiting a number of roles, particularly in rural areas, and changing demand for certain roles, it is difficult to forecast accurately the actual requirements and spend – and as noted previously, there is no guarantee to suppliers of business or continuity of business.

The benchmarking methodology undertaken, which was endorsed by the UIG, was to benchmark current margins with the equivalent supplier fee offered under the framework arrangement, therefore the benchmarking process was completed on a like for like basis.

Therefore, the exercise looked at the effect of purchasers remaining with the supplier with the highest spend (where this option is available), and was based on a comparison of rates currently paid for the key roles in each lot (those which attracted the highest scores during commercial evaluation), against the rates submitted at tender. Those roles were:

- Lot 1 Care Assistant
- Lot 2 Social Worker
- Lot 3 Cook/Domestic Assistant/Kitchen Assistant

The resultant range of estimated savings against the supplier's fee is detailed in Appendix 1.

The forecasted estimated saving for each purchaser ranges from 10.8% to 43.3% and the estimated average overall saving for all purchasers is 19.1%.

Scotland Excel has also carried out a further exercise, to evaluate the impact of switching to the highest scoring bidder in a region. This information showed potential for further savings, and has also been shared with all purchasers for their own region.

The framework arrangement terms set out clear parameters for the collection of management information which will address any data shortfalls previously experienced.

## **Price Stability**

All suppliers have agreed to the minimum fixed price period of two years, in relation to the supplier's fee element of pricing. Additionally, three tenderers have committed to hold their supplier's fee to the full four-year term.

Price increases on the agency workers rates are anticipated, as this element is affected by wages inflation generally and specific matters such as increases to the Scottish Living Wage.

#### **Sustainable Procurement Benefits**

#### **Community Benefits**

At the strategy UIG, the group endorsed that community benefits attained would be delivered at a local level for each purchaser and would be aligned to the Scottish Government's National Indicators.

This is a different approach to the current framework and should ensure that purchasers receive community benefits tailored to their spend levels, and reflective of their local needs, whilst taking the National Indicators into account.

All suppliers have confirmed their commitment to Scotland Excel's community benefits approach for this framework. Delivered benefits will be based on the annual spend thresholds on supplier's fees provided for individual purchasers.

When purchasers reach annual spend thresholds with a supplier they will accrue "Community Benefit Points". The community benefits lead or other designated person will liaise with the supplier to finalise the specific benefits that they are offered under this flexible framework relative to that spend.

In the published tender documents, suppliers were given a list of indicative community benefits that could be agreed with purchasers. Examples of the indicative benefits which were conveyed to suppliers were:

- Fundraising event for external charities/initiatives within the purchaser's area
- Engage in community projects within the purchaser's area such as Reading Partnership, befriending, for a minimum of 10 hours
- Work placements to school, college or university students from purchaser's area
- Offer training sessions to wider community within the purchaser's area (non-employees)
- Employability workshop or event in a school, college or group within purchaser's area
- Donation of materials and/or labour to support community projects within the purchaser's area to the value of £250

- Recruit a modern (or other approved) apprentice from within the purchaser's area
- Recruit one person from within the purchaser's area

## Environmental

The Scottish Government Sustainability Test was completed to identify how this framework could contribute to national and local sustainability priorities, with a number of National Indicators identified as relevant outputs.

Tenderers were asked to detail their corporate approach to delivering sustainability in the agency worker sector, with responses considering how the service will contribute to the delivery of these National Indicators and benefit those involved with social care services.

Whilst responses were diverse, some common outputs linked to each of the identified National Indicators were echoed throughout the submissions:

## 5 - Improve Scotland's Reputation

- Hiring a diverse workforce, tackling the inequalities in Scottish society
- Promoting environmentally friendly practises

# 8 - Improve the skill profile of the population

- Investing in training and development opportunities, including providing funding for relevant recognised qualifications
- Implementing internal training, including refresher courses

#### 9 - Reduce Underemployment

- Working in partnership with local employability initiatives
- Particular focus on rural/remote locations, or people with travel restrictions
- Work towards long term, sustainable employment

## 10 - Reduce the proportion of employees earning less than the living wage

 Paying all staff a minimum of the Scottish Living Wage and providing pay raises to all staff in line with the uplift of the Scottish Living Wage

## 11 - Reduce the pay gap

- Implementing a comprehensive Equal Opportunities policy
- Ensuring the most appropriate applicant is hired in a fair and consistent manner free from discrimination

## 15 - Increase the proportion of young people in learning, training or work

- Offering work experience placements for young people nearing school leaving age
- Implement placements in office administration for young people
- Visiting education establishments, engaging with students moving into work

## 26 - Improve support for people with Care Needs

- Ensuring clients have choice and control over their service
- Utilising a person centred and outcome focussed approach to service delivery
- Conducting six monthly reviews
- Investing in service specific training to enhance service delivery

## Fair Work Practices

Suppliers were asked to describe how they would commit to fair work practices for workers, recognising that this is critically dependent on workforces that are well-rewarded, well-motivated, well-led, have access to appropriate opportunities for training and skills development, are diverse and are engaged in decision making.

In the range of responses that were submitted, some of the key points detailed included:

- Fair and equal pay policy, with continual monitoring
- Wide diversity of staff actively monitoring gender, age and ethnicity equality
- Providing ongoing skills and training, promoting continuing professional development
- Supporting flexible working to enhance opportunities for those with caring responsibilities
- Avoidance of exploitative employment practices such as zero-hours contracts
- Awareness of and involvement in the eradication of modern slavery through robust supply chain management

#### **Scottish Living Wage**

The tender stipulated that the range of agency workers rates for each role had to encompass the Scottish Living Wage so that purchasers always have the opportunity to engage agency workers at or above the Scottish Living Wage. As a result, all purchasers can engage agency workers in every role at a Scottish Living Wage pay rate from every supplier recommended for award onto this framework arrangement.

Of the 15 suppliers Scotland Excel are recommending for award, 14 pay their staff at or above the Scottish Living Wage. Four suppliers are Living Wage accredited, and through this exercise one further supplier has committed to achieving accreditation throughout the duration of the framework. Scotland

Excel will include Living Wage accreditation status within our Contract and Supplier Management programme and will work with all suppliers who have not yet secured accreditation to encourage them to achieve this.

#### **Other Benefits**

#### Increased Coverage

One of the primary aims of this flexible framework was to increase the coverage for purchasers, and therefore reduce off-framework spend, as well as providing consistency for authorities in regard to terms and rates paid. With an increased number of providers being recommended for award, this outcome should be realised.

As noted in section 3 of the report, applying the 'light touch' regime applicable to this service and considering the fluctuating needs of purchasers, this framework has been developed to be a flexible framework, permitting new entrants and changes to existing participants on the published tender conditions during the framework.

In particular, rural areas will be monitored closely to ensure purchasers are receiving increased coverage and are able to make full use of the framework. Scotland Excel will work with the relevant purchasers to increase provision where this is deemed to not be meeting requirements.

## 7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

It is anticipated that there will be significant mobilisation in order to make the most of opportunities presented by increasing the number of suppliers on this framework, and to encourage the purchasers to make full use of the range of suppliers within each region.

This will not only increase capacity for the purchasers who have struggled to realise coverage via the current framework, it will also afford some purchasers the opportunity to reduce their reliance on a small number of critical suppliers.

Scotland Excel will host mobilisation events for both providers and purchasers and will provide a mobilisation pack to purchasers which will contain details on the framework arrangements and the relevant documents such as the order form and specification, which includes job descriptions for the core roles.

Contract and supplier management will undertake regular examination of participation and supply to ensure purchasers are able to use those suppliers awarded to their region.

Scotland Excel will continue to use the management information submitted by the participating framework suppliers to create quarterly contract management reports. These contract management reports will provide a detailed account of spend and use by supplier and purchaser, as well as relevant trend information.

This information will also be used to monitor rates being charged to purchasers, to ensure rates bid for are those charged, and any suppliers charging above the agreed rates will be challenged on the basis of the impact of their commercial scores achieved during tender.

The quarterly management information and annual reports will continue to be developed by Scotland Excel to improve reporting to purchasers to enable them to understand their placement patterns in relation to the national picture.

# 8. Summary

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendation to award this flexible framework agreement as detailed within Appendix 3.

# Appendix 1 - Participation, Spend and Savings Summary

# **Social Care Agency Workers 20/17**

There is no guarantee of purchaser spend or continuity of spend throughout the flexible framework agreement. Savings are based

on the supplier's fee element of forecast spend.

Member Name	Participation in Contract	Participation Entry Date	Estimated Annual Spend (£) [ALL]	Estimated Annual Spend (£) [SUPPLIER FEE]	Source of Spend Data	Indexation <sup>1</sup>	% Estimated Forecast Savings	Estimated Annual Savings (£)	Basis of Savings Calculation
Aberdeen City Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£240,000	£32,808	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	43.3%		Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Aberdeenshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£155,250	£21,222	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	43.3%		Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Angus Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£558,076	£93,461	Contract MI	4.8%	19.6%	£18,328	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Argyll & Bute Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£182,680	£17,158	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	18.0%		Benchmarked Current Contract
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£6,311,010	£532,577	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£104,438	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Clackmannanshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£137,801	£17,075	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%		Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	Yes	01 August 2018	£8,609	£913	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.2%	£130	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£29,877	£4,900	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	11.0%	£537	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Dundee City Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£5,189	£833	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£163	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
East Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£0	£0	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£0	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
East Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£46,750	£5,921	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£1,161	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
East Lothian Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£183,750	£19,440	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	18.5%	£3,600	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
East Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£2,567,000	£266,441	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£52,249	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Falkirk Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£200,000	£28,501	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£5,589	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Fife Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£3,000,000	£326,098	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.7%	£47,904	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Glasgow City Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£1,422,475	£116,290	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£22,804	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Highland Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£150,000	£18,998	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.2%	£2,696	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Inverclyde Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£39,851	£5,171	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£1,014	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Midlothian Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£1,507,651	£131,001	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	15.4%	£20,109	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
North Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£0	£0	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£0	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
North Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£0	£0	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£0	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Orkney Islands Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£3,466	£268	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.2%	£38	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Perth & Kinross Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£22,135	£2,124	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	35.1%	£745	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£500,000	£137,874	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	17.4%	£23,962	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Scottish Borders Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£30,000	£3,390	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	15.4%	£520	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Shetland Islands Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£19,447	£1,865	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.2%	£265	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
South Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£0	£0	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£0	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
South Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£0	£0	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	19.6%	£0	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Stirling Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£160,386	£26,474	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	23.8%	£6,309	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Moray Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£5,000	£670	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	14.2%	£95	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
West Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£194,214	£32,153	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	37.9%	£12,189	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
West Lothian Council	Yes	01 August 2018	£162,178	£14,873	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	11.8%	£2,283	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Other Public Sector Bodies	Yes	01 August 2018	£117,382	£21,458	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	12.9%	£2,323	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Associate Members	Yes	01 August 2018	£131,000	£16,592	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.8%	12.3%	£2,132	Benchmarked Using Member Provided Data
Totals			£18,091,175	£1,896,548		4.8%	19.1%	£361,405	

<sup>1</sup> Indexation: this column confirms the difference when the relevant market indices are compared with the relevant Contract indices derived from framework specific cost drivers

# Appendix 2 - SME Status

Appendix 2 details: all organisations who submitted a valid offer as part of the tender process, their SME status, location and the lots for which they have bid.

Tenderer's Name	SME Status	Location	Lots Tendered
4Recruitment Services Ltd	Medium	Ilford	2
Ailsa Care Services Ltd	Medium	Glasgow	1
Ailsa Response Limited	Small	Renfrew	1, 3
Almond Blossom Care Limited	Small	Edinburgh	1
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment	Medium	Edinburgh	1, 2, 3
Asphalia Holdings Limited, t/a Care Field	Small	Leicester	1, 2, 3
Black & Black Recruitment Limited	Micro	Glasgow	1
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	Medium	Aberdeen	1, 3
Brightwork Limited	Medium	Glasgow	1, 2, 3
Caledonia Healthcare Limited	Small	Glasgow	1
Caritas Recruitment Ltd	Medium	London	2
G.O.L.D. Healthcare Limited	Small	Inverness	1
Graceguard Services Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	Micro	Edinburgh	1
GSR Healthcare Limited	Micro	Aberdeen	1
HCL Social Care Limited	Medium	London	2
HSC Futures Ltd	Small	Kilmarnock	1
ID Medical Group Limited	Large	Milton Keynes	1, 2
Jobs and Co Ltd	Micro	Glasgow	1, 3
JPS1 Ltd t/a 247 Professional Health	Micro	Stiring	1
Maxxima Limited	Medium	London	2
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	Large	Devon	1
Olive Healthcare Solutions Limited	Small	Nottingham	1
Oran Homecare Ltd	Medium	Cupar	1
Potters Health Care Limited	Micro	Falkirk	1
Rainbow Services (UK) Limited	Small	Ayr	1
Randstad Public Services Limited	Large	Luton	1, 2
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	Medium	Hertford	2
Reed Specialist Recruitment Ltd t/a Reed Community Care	Large	London	1, 2, 3
S C P Recruitment Limited	Large	Aberdeen	1, 3
Sanctuary Personnel Limited	Medium	Ipswich	2
ScotForce Recruitment Ltd	Small	Perth	1
Search Consultancy Limited	Large	Glasgow	1, 2, 3
Service Care Solutions Ltd	Medium	Preston	1, 2, 3
Seven Resourcing Limited	Medium	Ipswich	1, 2
Specialist Resource Solutions Ltd	Small	Aberdeen	1
SPS Social Care Ltd	Small	Glasgow	1
SRS Partnership Limited	Medium	Glasgow	1, 3

Tenderer's Name	SME Status	Location	Lots Tendered
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	Medium	London	1, 2
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	Small	Bellshill	2
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited	Small	Edinburgh	1, 2
Tripod Partners Limited	Medium	London	1, 2
UK Private Healthcare trading as Ana recruitment	Small	Aberdeen	1, 3

# **Appendix 3 - Scoring and Recommendations**

# **Lot 1 Care Roles**

Lot 1 Region 1 - Highland	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment***1	88.35
Service Care Solutions Ltd***	79.71
Randstad Public Services Limited**2	75.72
Tripod Partners Limited*	64.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	51.17
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	49.16
ID Medical Group Limited	44.66
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.08
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	38.28
G.O.L.D. Healthcare	33.85
Specialist Resource Solution Ltd	33.38
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	32.54

Lot 1 Region 2 - Moray	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment***	90.56
Service Care Solutions Ltd***	81.67
SCP Recruitment Limited*	65.98
Tripod Partners Limited*	65.28
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	52.37
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	49.96
ID Medical Group Limited	46.42
Seven Resourcing Ltd	41.23
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	38.57
Specialist Resource Solution Ltd	35.52
G.O.L.D. Healthcare	35.44

Lot 1 Region 3 - The Islands	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd***	80.81
Randstad Public Services Limited***	77.29
Tripod Partners Limited*	64.86
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	52.10
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	49.70
ID Medical Group Limited	46.30
G.O.L.D. Healthcare	41.20

Lot 1 Region 4 - Western Isles	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd***	80.81
Randstad Public Services Limited***	77.29

 <sup>1 \*\*</sup> denotes recommended suppliers receiving FULL award
 2 \* denotes recommended suppliers receiving partial award

Tripod Partners Limited*	64.86
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	52.10
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	49.70
ID Medical Group Limited	46.30
G.O.L.D. Healthcare	41.20
Seven Resourcing Ltd	38.93

Lot 1 Region 5 - Argyll & Bute	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.45
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	74.56
Randstad Public Services Limited**	71.58
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	68.61
Tripod Partners Limited*	60.51
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.91
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.74
ID Medical Group Limited	43.14
Seven Resourcing Ltd	38.36
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.41

Lot 1 Region 6 - South West	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.45
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	82.79
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	74.46
Randstad Public Services Limited**	71.41
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	67.86
Jobs and Co Ltd*	62.53
Tripod Partners Limited*	60.01
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	52.79
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd*	52.39
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.71
Ailsa Response Ltd	47.00
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.49
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.99
ID Medical Group Limited	42.79
Seven Resourcing Ltd	38.11
Rainbow Services (UK) Limited	37.41
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.41
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 7 - Glasgow	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.15
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.87
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.88
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited***	70.59
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.42
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	64.78

Jobs and Co Ltd*	62.27
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.11
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	51.06
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	48.95
SPS Social Care Ltd	48.37
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.96
Caledonia Healthcare Ltd	47.42
SRS Partnership Limited	47.14
Ailsa Response Ltd	46.55
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.68
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.47
ID Medical Group Limited	41.33
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.37
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.22
HSC Futures Ltd	32.95
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	29.74
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	16.03
ProHealth Ltd - Non- Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 8 - Lanarkshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.15
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.87
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.88
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	70.59
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.42
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	64.78
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.11
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	51.06
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	48.95
SPS Social Care Ltd	48.37
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.96
Caledonia Healthcare Ltd	47.42
SRS Partnership Limited	47.14
Ailsa Response Ltd	46.55
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.68
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.47
ID Medical Group Limited	41.33
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.37
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.22
HSC Futures Ltd	32.95
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 9 - Renfrewshire and Inverclyde	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	81.35
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	78.57
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	70.57

The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	68.77
Randstad Public Services Limited**	67.88
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	62.78
Jobs and Co Ltd*	59.72
Tripod Partners Limited*	57.21
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	50.11
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	47.23
SPS Social Care Ltd	46.81
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	46.72
Caledonia Healthcare Ltd	46.57
SRS Partnership Limited	46.18
Ailsa Response Ltd	45.60
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.61
Search Consultancy Ltd	43.98
ID Medical Group Limited	40.78
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	36.78
Seven Resourcing Ltd	36.40
HSC Futures Ltd	32.47
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 10 - West Dunbartonshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.15
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.87
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.88
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	70.59
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.42
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	64.78
Jobs and Co Ltd*	62.27
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.11
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	48.95
SPS Social Care Ltd	48.37
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.96
Caledonia Healthcare Ltd	47.42
SRS Partnership Limited	47.14
Ailsa Response Ltd	46.55
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.68
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.47
ID Medical Group Limited	41.33
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.37
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.22
HSC Futures Ltd	32.95
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	16.03
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 11 - Aberdeen City	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.25

ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.96
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.48
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	65.59
SCP Recruitment Limited*	59.78
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.16
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.99
SRS Partnership Limited	47.17
UK Private Healthcare Ltd t/a Ana Recruitment Professionals	46.29
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.70
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.51
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	44.18
ID Medical Group Limited	41.34
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.38
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.24
Specialist Resource Solution Ltd	30.35
Olive Healthcare Solutions Limited	28.51
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.62
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	16.04

Lot 1 Region 12 - Aberdeenshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.25
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.96
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.48
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	65.59
SCP Recruitment Limited*	59.78
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.16
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.99
SRS Partnership Limited	47.17
UK Private Healthcare Ltd t/a Ana Recruitment Professionals	46.29
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.70
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.51
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	44.18
ID Medical Group Limited	41.34
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.38
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.24
Oran Homecare Ltd	31.27
Specialist Resource Solution Ltd	30.73
Olive Healthcare Solutions Limited	28.51
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.62
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	16.04
Aberness Care Limited - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 13 - Tayside	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.25

ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.96
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.48
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	67.53
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.16
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	49.00
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.99
SRS Partnership Limited	47.17
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.70
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.51
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	44.18
ScotForce Recruitment Ltd	42.36
ID Medical Group Limited	41.34
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.38
Seven Resourcing Ltd	37.24
Olive Healthcare Solutions Limited	28.56
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.62
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	16.04
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	_

Lot 1 Region 14 - Edinburgh	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	81.35
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	78.57
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	70.57
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	68.77
Randstad Public Services Limited**	67.88
Tripod Partners Limited*	57.21
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	50.11
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	47.23
SPS Social Care Ltd	46.81
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	46.72
SRS Partnership Limited	46.18
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.61
Search Consultancy Ltd	43.98
Almond Blossom Care	42.07
ScotForce Recruitment Ltd	41.45
ID Medical Group Limited	40.78
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	36.78
Seven Resourcing Ltd	36.40
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	29.11
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.41
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	•

Lot 1 Region 15 - Central	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	81.35
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	78.57

Service Care Solutions Ltd**	70.57
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	68.77
Randstad Public Services Limited**	67.88
Black and Black Recruitment Limited*	62.78
Tripod Partners Limited*	57.21
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	50.11
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	47.23
SPS Social Care Ltd	46.81
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	46.72
SRS Partnership Limited	46.18
Ailsa Response Ltd	45.60
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.61
Search Consultancy Ltd	43.98
ScotForce Recruitment Ltd	41.45
ID Medical Group Limited	40.78
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	36.78
Seven Resourcing Ltd	36.40
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	29.11
Potters Health Care Limited	28.91
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.41
JPS1 t/a 247 Professional Health	15.75
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 16 - Lothian & Borders	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	80.15
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	77.37
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	69.34
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	67.57
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.38
Tripod Partners Limited*	56.41
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.76
SPS Social Care Ltd	46.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.92
SRS Partnership Limited	45.73
Search Consultancy Ltd	43.50
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	43.11
ID Medical Group Limited	40.30
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	36.60
Seven Resourcing Ltd	35.80
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment	33.77
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.23
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

Lot 1 Region 17 - Fife	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.15
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	81.87

Service Care Solutions Ltd**	73.88
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	70.59
Randstad Public Services Limited**	70.42
Tripod Partners Limited*	59.11
Ailsa Care Services Ltd**	51.06
SPS Social Care Ltd	48.37
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.96
SRS Partnership Limited	47.14
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.68
Search Consultancy Ltd	45.47
ScotForce Recruitment Ltd	42.34
ID Medical Group Limited	41.33
Seven Resourcing Ltd	38.89
Newcross Healthcare Solutions Limited	37.37
GSR Healthcare Ltd	25.61
ProHealth Ltd - Non-Compliant	

# Lot 1 – Non-Compliant (Region not identified)

Aberness Care

# **Lot 2 Professional Roles**

Lot 2 Region 1 - Highland	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	86.23
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	79.08
Randstad Public Services Limited**	77.08
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	75.64
Tripod Partners Limited*	64.60
Search Consultancy Ltd*	63.88
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd*	61.85
4Recruitment Services Ltd	58.06
HCL Social Care Ltd	55.55
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	54.23
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	51.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	45.54
ID Medical Group Limited	45.16
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	44.32
Maxxima Limited	41.89
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	37.78

Lot 2 Region 2 - Moray	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	86.23
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	79.08
Randstad Public Services Limited**	77.08
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	75.64
Tripod Partners Limited*	64.60
Search Consultancy Ltd*	63.88

Sanctuary Personnel Ltd*	61.85
4Recruitment Services Ltd	58.06
HCL Social Care Ltd	55.55
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	54.23
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	51.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	45.54
ID Medical Group Limited	45.16
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	44.32
Maxxima Limited	41.89
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	37.78

Lot 2 Region 3 - The Islands	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	79.08
Randstad Public Services Limited**	77.08
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	75.64
Tripod Partners Limited*	64.60
Search Consultancy Ltd*	63.88
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd*	61.85
4Recruitment Services Ltd	58.06
HCL Social Care Ltd	55.55
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	54.23
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	51.21
ID Medical Group Limited	45.16
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	44.32
Maxxima Limited	41.89
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	37.78

Lot 2 Region 4 - Western Isles	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	78.96
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	77.07
Randstad Public Services Limited**	74.44
Tripod Partners Limited*	63.88
Search Consultancy Ltd*	63.40
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd*	61.85
4Recruitment Services Ltd	58.06
HCL Social Care Ltd	55.43
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	53.87
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	51.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	45.24
ID Medical Group Limited	44.92
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	44.20
Maxxima Limited	41.53
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	37.78

Lot 2 Region 5 - Argyll & Bute	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	85.50

Service Care Solutions Ltd**	69.23
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	68.86
Randstad Public Services Limited**	68.52
Tripod Partners Limited	58.43
Search Consultancy Ltd	56.00
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	55.58
4Recruitment Services Ltd	52.27
HCL Social Care Ltd	50.63
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	49.72
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	47.14
ID Medical Group Limited	42.97
Seven Resourcing Ltd	41.60
Maxxima Limited	39.03
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	38.69
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	33.84

Lot 2 Region 6 - South West	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 7 - Glasgow	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05

Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.51

Lot 2 Region 8 - Lanarkshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.51

Lot 2 Region 9 - Renfrewshire and Inverclyde	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46

Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 10 - West Dunbartonshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 11 - Aberdeen City	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65

Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 12 - Aberdeenshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	56.24
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 13 - Tayside	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

# Lot 2 Region 14 - Edinburgh

SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 15 - Central	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 16 - Lothian & Borders	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30

The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

Lot 2 Region 17 - Fife	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	83.60
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	74.48
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	67.30
The Social Care Community Partnership Limited**	66.97
Randstad Public Services Limited**	66.62
Tripod Partners Limited	57.16
Caritas Recruitment Limited	55.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	55.05
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	54.19
4Recruitment Services Ltd	51.00
HCL Social Care Ltd	49.36
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	48.46
Sugarman Health and Wellbeing Ltd	46.01
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	44.77
ID Medical Group Limited	42.21
Seven Resourcing Ltd	40.65
Maxxima Limited	38.07
Recruitment Team Nine Limited	34.90
Taylor Davenport Resourcing Ltd	32.48

**Lot 3 Ancillary Roles** 

Lot 3 Region 1 - Highland	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	93.40
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.91
Search Consultancy Ltd	48.26
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	47.97
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.21
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 2 - Moray	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	90.65
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	56.87
SCP Recruitment Limited*	55.28
Search Consultancy Ltd	50.81
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	44.69
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	43.67

Lot 3 Region 3 - The Islands	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	83.41
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field*	58.30
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	57.37

Lot 3 Region 4 - Western Isles	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	84.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field*	59.91
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care*	59.00

Lot 3 Region 5 - Argyll & Bute	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
Brightwork Limited**	86.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	72.32
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	53.69
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	52.42
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 6 - South West	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	93.40
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.91
Jobs and Co Ltd	52.97
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	47.97
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	47.21
Ailsa Response Ltd	44.07
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 7 - Glasgow	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	88.48
Brightwork Limited**	67.58
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	55.82
Search Consultancy Ltd	50.21
Jobs and Co Ltd	49.62
SRS Partnership Limited	46.39

Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	43.33
Ailsa Response Ltd	43.03
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 8 - Lanarkshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	88.48
Brightwork Limited**	67.58
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	55.82
Search Consultancy Ltd	50.21
SRS Partnership Limited	46.39
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	43.33
Ailsa Response Ltd	43.03
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	42.27
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 9 - Renfrewshire and Inverclyde	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.01
Jobs and Co Ltd	52.74
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81
SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41
Ailsa Response Ltd	44.07
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 10 - West Dunbartonshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.01
Jobs and Co Ltd	52.74
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81
SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41
Ailsa Response Ltd	44.07
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	`

Lot 3 Region 11 - Aberdeen City	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	90.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	58.41

SCP Recruitment Limited	53.58
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.56
UK Private Healthcare Ltd t/a Ana Recruitment Professionals	45.64
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	45.42
SRS Partnership Limited	45.32
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.07
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	44.31

Lot 3 Region 12 - Aberdeenshire	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	90.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	58.41
SCP Recruitment Limited	53.58
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.56
UK Private Healthcare Ltd t/a Ana Recruitment Professionals	45.64
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	45.42
SRS Partnership Limited	45.32
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.07
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	44.31

Lot 3 Region 13 - Tayside	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	90.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	58.41
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.56
Bon Accord Support Services Ltd	45.42
SRS Partnership Limited	45.32
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	45.07
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	44.31

Lot 3 Region 14 - Edinburgh	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.01
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81
SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 15 - Central	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.01
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81

SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41
Ailsa Response Ltd	44.07
Black and Black Recruitment Limited - Non-Compliant	
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 16 - Lothian & Borders	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	59.01
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81
SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41
Graceguard Service Ltd [T/S] Seasoned Hands Recruitment - Non-Compliant	

Lot 3 Region 17 - Fife	
SUPPLIER NAME	TOTAL
ASA International Ltd, trading as ASA Recruitment**	91.60
Brightwork Limited**	70.70
Service Care Solutions Ltd**	58.94
Search Consultancy Ltd	47.81
SRS Partnership Limited	47.57
Asphalia Holdings Limited t/a Care Field	46.17
Reed Specialist Recruitment t/a Reed Community Care	45.41

Page 33 of 33 Page 77 of 78

Page 78 of 78