

Agenda Item No 3(a)

Scotland Excel

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 08 December 2017

Report by Director Scotland Excel

Tender: Supply & Distribution of Milk

Schedule: 19/17

Period: 1 March 2018 until 28 February 2021 (with the option to extend for

an additional 1 year period until 28 February 2022)

1. Introduction and Background

The current framework for the Supply & Distribution of Pasteurised Milk and Associated Products will expire on the 28 February 2018. This recommendation is for the award of a renewal framework which will operate from 01 March 2018 to 28 February 2021, with the option to extend for an additional one year period until 28 February 2022.

This framework will provide local authorities and other participating bodies with a mechanism to procure a range of dairy products, including whole milk, semi-skimmed milk, skimmed milk, flavoured milk, organic milk, and fresh cream. It will support the duties established by the Schools (Health, Promotion and Nutrition) (Scotland) Act 2007, and the standards set out by the Nutritional Requirements for Food and Drink in Schools (Scotland) Regulations 2008.

This report summarises the outcome of the procurement process for this national framework arrangement.

2. Scope, Participation and Spend

As detailed in Appendix 1, 31 local authorities and Tayside Contracts indicated their intention to participate in this contract. Orkney Islands Council stated that they have existing arrangements in place and declined to participate.

Based on the forecasted spend levels provided by local authorities, the framework is worth approximately £7.5 million per annum. This opportunity was advertised at a value of £36 million over the four-year period (£9 million per annum) to allow for non-participating local authorities to migrate over and to account for;

- The volatility of the marketplace, especially in the wake of Brexit. It is still unclear what impact any potential free trade deals will have on the dairy and wider food industry, as well as the future of the £3 billion which UK farmers receive from the EU's Common Agricultural Policy (CAP).
- A third-generation framework where sustainability is a significantly weighted factor.

3. Procurement Process

A Prior Information Notice (PIN) was published on 27 May 2017 with 15 companies expressing an interest. Market engagement led to 4 supplier meetings, which helped to inform the commodity strategy in areas such as wider market trends, product development, servicing outlying regions, and delivering efficiencies.

The User Intelligence Group (UIG), consisting of procurement and technical representatives from the participating councils, endorsed the procurement strategy at regional events in June 2017. A working group of technical representatives from the councils was formed to review the specifications and the technical criteria to adopt during the tender process. This group also played an integral role in evaluating technical responses from bidders.

To ensure maximum competition, the UIG agreed that an open tender process should be used and this was advertised on the Official Journal of the European Union and the Public Contracts Scotland portal on 11 September 2017. The tender process was conducted using the Public Contracts Scotland Tender system (PCS-T).

The procurement process followed a two-stage tendering procedure. Stage one, Qualification, was conducted using the European Single Procurement Document (ESPD). Within the ESPD, tenderers were required to answer a set of exclusionary questions along with providing details and/or acknowledgement on insurance, financial standing, quality management, health & safety and environmental management policies and/or procedures.

At the second stage of the process offers were evaluated against the following criteria and weightings:

Technical 30%Commercial 70%

Tenderers were required to indicate which local authority areas, referred to as "Geographical Lot(s)", for which they wanted to bid. Most Geographical Lots (43 in total) represent an authority area in its entirety, however Argyll & Bute Council (10 lots) and North Ayrshire Council (2 lots) were sub-divided further to make the contract more accessible to local SMEs based in these areas.

Tenderers were invited to bid on the following basis:

- A net delivered unit price for the 24 core products listed within the Schedule of Offer, and:
- A discount or additional on-cost on tendered prices, as they deemed appropriate, for individual Geographical Lots, based on the transactional and/or distribution efficiencies of local authorities.

Within the technical section, tenderers were required to evidence their knowledge and experience in areas such as supply chain sustainability, transparency, and efficiency, as well as how they intend to service the contract and deliver community benefits through the framework.

4. Report on Offers Received

The tender document was downloaded by 12 organisations, with 7 tender responses received.

A summary of all offers received is provided in Appendix 2.

Achieving full geographic coverage for this commodity has historically proved challenging, however through engagement with the marketplace and local authorities contract coverage has improved, with bids being received for areas which previously received no offers, including Shetland Islands Council, and most of the Geographical Lots listed in Argyll & Bute Council.

Despite extensive engagement, no offers were received for Comhairle nan Eilean Siar, Highland Council, Orkney Islands Council and the following Geographical Lots;

Argyll & Bute Council - Area E, Tiree & Coll

- Area H, Colonsay

- Area I, Bute

North Ayrshire Council - Area B, Isle of Arran

Scotland Excel will continue to liaise with local authorities who have not received coverage following award of this contract to ensure that they have support in terms of conducting separate exercises to meet their contractual needs, where appropriate.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender document, a full evaluation of the offers received was conducted.

Following evaluation of commercial offers, both technical and commercial scores were combined to provide the overall scores achieved by each tenderer for each Geographical Lot for which they submitted a bid. The combined scores can be found in Appendix 3 of this report.

5. Recommendations

Based on the evaluation undertaken, and in line with the criteria and weightings set out above, it is recommended that a multi supplier framework agreement is awarded to 7 suppliers across the 36 Geographical Lots which received an offer as outlined in Appendix 3.

All recommended suppliers have completed self-audits which have been evaluated by Scotland Excel's appointed Environmental Health team. In addition to this, processing sites have also been audited to ensure compliance.

The 7 recommended suppliers provide the choice, scope and range of milk products required by local authorities, as well as representing best value. It should also be noted that 5 of the recommended suppliers are classified as SMEs.

6. Benefits

Savings

Scotland Excel conducted a benchmarking exercise for each local authority based on the available management information, the results of which are detailed in Appendix 1.

Following the evaluation of tenders, clarifications were conducted with each tenderer, with a view to securing greater geographical coverage and best value. These discussions did not alter the outcome of the scoring outlined in Appendix 3, or the evaluation process, concluding in a forecast cost increase of 1.3% across the framework. This ranged from a saving of 7.8% to an on-cost of 14.7%. Favourable pricing was offered to authorities with more efficient distribution models and delivery schedules, which helps to explain these variations.

The benefits associated with the clarification process have satisfied Scotland Excel's aim of ensuring best value for all participating local authorities.

Price Stability

All suppliers core pricing will be fixed for 12 months from contract commencement, with the exception John McKerrell and D J Campbell & Son who have agreed to hold their pricing for 9 months and 6 months respectively.

Subsequent pricing will then be held for 6 monthly periods, with any price variance request within these windows being considered in accordance with the defined Scotland Excel process. All requests will be evaluated against market indices which monitor farm gate pricing, fuel, and packaging costs.

Sustainable Procurement Benefits

Tenderers were asked several scored questions in regards to sustainability, where they would have to demonstrate an acute awareness of wider issues within the dairy industry as well as an understanding of local authorities' efforts to recycle and reduce waste as part of wider national strategies.

Following the initiatives set out by the Scottish Government's Dairy Action Plan (2014), and the volatility that the dairy industry has experienced in recent years, tenderers were asked to demonstrate how they promoted an efficient, transparent and resilient supply chain. The information attained from these responses will allow Scotland Excel to have visibility on what suppliers are doing to support sustainable farm gate pricing, and this will be used throughout the duration of the framework for contract management purposes.

Another key area of focus within the tender document was CO2 emissions and Food Miles. Responses noted investment in innovative route planning technology, as well as capital input in milk tankers to increase logistical efficiencies. In addition to this, tenderers also had to outline their recycling policies and how they could assist local authorities with their environmental targets. This included a proposal where local authorities would work in direct partnership with the supplier and packaging manufacturer to implement a carton collection system.

Tenderers also had to provide their procedures for managing the shelf life of products and outline how these could ensure that food waste is minimised. Within this question, they also had to outline what storage solutions they could offer to local authorities which could consolidate delivery schedules thus driving further efficiencies. Responses detailed a collaborative approach with local authorities to reduce delivery days through refrigeration solutions and the amalgamation of accounts, with the potential savings generated from such exercises being passed on to the customer.

Community Benefits

Tenderers were asked to detail community benefit initiatives that they would commit to deliver during the life of the framework in line with the Scottish Government's National Outcomes.

Responses received included:

- National Outcome D Our young people are successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens
 - Dairy farm visits for school pupils to help them attain a better understanding of the dairy industry and how milk is produced.
 - Visiting schools to provide classroom talks.
 - Work experience and apprenticeships.
 - Supporting theme days and recipe competitions which look to promote healthy eating and dietary habits.
- National Outcome F We live longer, healthier lives;
 - Sponsorship of national campaigns which look to promote healthier eating through educational initiatives.
 - Support and funding for local sporting organisations.
- National Outcome L We value and enjoy our built and natural environment and protect it and enhance it for future generations

- Promoting community garden projects within schools, to encourage pupils to appreciate their local environment and relationship with food.
- National Outcome M We take pride in a strong, fair and inclusive national identity
 - Assist local authorities in the promotion of local and Scottish produce.
 - Supporting local businesses through sub-contracting opportunities.
- National Outcome N We reduce the local and global environmental impact of our consumption and production;
 - Working with local authorities to reduce food miles and their recycling objectives.

Scotland Excel will support the delivery of these commitments throughout the duration of the framework, and a bi-annual report will be produced for publication.

Fair Work Practices

Tenderers were also scored on how they will engage in fair work practices for staff employed in the delivery of this contract.

This included questioning suppliers on how they avoid exploitative employment practices, and improve the wider diversity of their staff. Some suppliers stated that they publish an annual statement which complies with the Modern Slavery Act (2015), with one also stating that they offered free English lessons for staff members whose first language was not English.

In addition, tenderers were asked for details on what training they provided for their staff, as well as how they proactively engage with them to promote empowerment so that they can fulfill their potential. Most suppliers stated that they offered development programmes for their staff, which included training and courses that looked to enhance their skills and advance their careers.

As an unscored question, Scotland Excel asked tenderers if they paid the Scottish Living Wage. Of the recommended 7 suppliers, 3 stated they did pay the Scottish Living Wage but were not accredited.

Scotland Excel will continue to monitor Fair Work Practices, including the Scottish Living Wage through contract management, and will work with all awarded suppliers who do not currently pay the Scottish Living Wage to encourage them to do so.

7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

In accordance with Scotland Excel's established contract and supplier management programme, this framework has been classified as a level 1 arrangement in terms of both risk and spend. As such, Scotland Excel will conduct quarterly review meetings with suppliers, whilst monitoring management information and community benefits associated with this framework.

Achievement of key performance indicators, to be finalised and agreed at contract award, will be a driver to ensure that the required service is monitored, maintained, and where possible improved upon during the framework period.

8. Summary

This framework for the Supply & Distribution of Milk aims to maximise collaboration, promote added value and deliver best value. A range of benefits can be reported in relation to savings, price stability, sustainability and community benefits.

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendation to award placings on this framework to the suppliers as detailed in Appendix 3.

Appendix 1 - Participation, Spend and Savings Summary

Properties Pro	LOCAL AUTHORITY	PARTICIPATION IN CONTRACT PARTICIPAT		ION ENTRY DATE ESTIMATED ANNUAL SPEND	SOURCE OF SPEND DATA	EST. FORECAST SAVINGS (%)	EST. ANNUAL SAVINGS (£)	EST. FORECAST SAVINGS (%) EST. ANNUAL SAVINGS (£) BASIS OF SAWINGS CALCULATIONS
100 100	Aberdeen City Council	YES	01/03/2018	£265,761	Member Provided	7.8%	£20,741	Benchmarked Current Contract
100 100	Aberdeenshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£326,319	Member Provided	-0.3%	-£1,129	Benchmarked Current Contract
100 12 12 12 12 13 14 14 14 14 15 15 15 15	Angus Council - Non School Meals	YES	01/03/2018	£29,105	Member Provided	-9.4%	-£2,730	Benchmarked Current Contract
10,000,000 1,0	Argyll & Bute Council - Area A, Cowal	YES	01/03/2018	N/A	N/A	%0.0	03	Benchmarked Current Contract
17.5 17.5	Argyll & Bute Council - Area B, Oban & Lorne	YES	01/03/2018	N/A	N/A	0.0%	03	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/39/2018 ETS,249 Member Provided 0.00 FRER RECEVED VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 N/A N/A N/A N/A VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 N/A N/A N/A N/O FERR RECEVED VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018 VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEVED 0,0/3/2018 1,0/3/2018<	Argyll & Bute Council - Area C, Mid Argyll & Kintyre Peninsula	YES	01/03/2018	N/A	N/A	0.0%	0 3	Benchmarked Current Contract
KFS BUTNO OFFER RECEVED 0,003/2018 1,05	Argyll & Bute Council - Area D, Helensburgh & Lomond	YES	01/03/2018	£35,249	Member Provided	-7.2%	-£2,540	Benchmarked Current Contract
Yes 01/08/2018 N/A N/A N/O 0.00%	Argyll & Bute Council - Area E, Tiree & Coll	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	N/A		NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED OLIGIZATION N/A N/A NO OFFIES RECEIVED VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 N.A NO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.005/2018 VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E56,233 NAmenber Provided 3.0% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E56,233 NAmenber Provided 3.0% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E58,335 NAmenber Provided 3.0% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E58,335 NAmenber Provided 3.5% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E58,335 NAmenber Provided 3.5% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E53,235 NAmenber Provided 3.5% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E53,232 Contract NI - Confirmed by Namber 3.5% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E52,322 Contract NI - Confirmed by Namber 3.5% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018 E52,322 Contract NI - Confirmed by Namber 3.0% VESS BOTTO OFFIES RECEIVED 0.0103/2018	Argyll & Bute Council - Area F, Islay & Jura	YES	01/03/2018	£2,652	Member Provided	0.0%	0 3	Benchmarked Current Contract
WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED BURDAZIONS N/A NA NO DEFENS RECEVED WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E54,238 NA NA 0.00 WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E54,333 Nember Provided 2.0% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E56,238 Nember Provided 2.0% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E58,230 Nember Provided 2.0% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,030 Nember Provided 2.0% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,232 Contract MI Confirmed by Nember 3.7% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,232 Contract MI Confirmed by Nember 5.2% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,232 Contract MI Confirmed by Nember 5.2% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,232 Contract MI Confirmed by Nember 5.2% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018 E52,232 Contract MI Confirmed by Nember 5.0% WS. BUTNO OPTERS RECEVED 0.0/09/2018	Argyll & Bute Council - Area G, Mull	YES	01/03/2018	N/A	N/A	0.0%	0 J	Benchmarked Current Contract
12, 12, 12, 13, 14, 14, 15,	Argyll & Bute Council - Area H, Colonsay	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	N/A		NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
100	Argyll & Bute Council - Areal, Bute	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	N/A		NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
VES. BUT.NO.OFFES.RECENED Q1/03/2018 E79,433 Member Provided 3,4%	Argyll & Bute Council - Area J, Dunoon	YES	01/03/2018	£6,428	N/A	0.0%	0 J	Benchmarked Current Contract
1975 1975	City of Edinburgh Council	YES	01/03/2018	£794,933	Member Provided	3.4%	£26,767	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES. BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/08/2018 E50,000 Member Provided 1.5%	Clackmannanshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£96,733	Member Provided	-5.0%	-£1,928	Benchmarked Current Contract
oil YES 0 (1/63/2018 £183,555 Outnate Provided 4.5% ci YES 0 (1/63/2018 £13,252 Contract Min. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% ci YES 0 (1/63/2018 £13,252 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% ci YES 0 (1/63/2018 £13,252 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -5,5% YES 0 (1/63/2018 £12,252 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -5,5% YES 1 (1/63/2018 £12,252 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -5,5% YES 1 (1/63/2018 £12,252 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -5,5% YES 1 (1/63/2018 £12,675 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% YES 0 (1/63/2018 £12,675 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% YES 0 (1/63/2018 £12,621 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% YES 0 (1/63/2018 £12,621 Contract M. Confirmed by Member Provided -1,5% YES 0 (1/63	Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	£20,000	,	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
15, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20, 20	Dumfries & Galloway Council	YES	01/03/2018	£183,195	Member Provided	-1.5%	-£2,798	Benchmarked Current Contract
158 1582 10 1583 1582 1582 1583 158	Dundee City Council	YES	01/03/2018	£37,585	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-8.7%	-£3,275	Benchmarked Current Contract
ci VES 01/03/2018 E89,520 Nember Provided 5,6% FISH 01/03/2018 E71,532 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 0.3% FISH 01/03/2018 E71,232 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 0.7% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,532 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 0.7% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,532 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 0.7% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,532 Nember Provided 0.7% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,673 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 1.5% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,673 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 1.5% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,673 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 1.5% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E72,673 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 1.5% FISH VYES 01/03/2018 E73,600 Contract MIConfirmed by Member 1.5% FISH VYES	East Ayrshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£31,282	Member Provided	-1.5%	-£463	Benchmarked Current Contract
rest QL(93/2018 E277,582 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 5.2% VYS QL(93/2018 E128,533 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 5.2% VYS QL(93/2018 E128,532 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 5.2% VYS QL(93/2018 E822,352 Member Provided Q.7% VYS QL(93/2018 E128,500 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% VYS QL(93/2018 E128,500 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% VYS QL(93/2018 E128,500 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% VYS QL(93/2018 E528,130 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% VYS QL(93/2018 E528,130 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% VYS QL(93/2018 E528,130 Contract M	East Dunbartonshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£89,520	Member Provided	-5.6%	-£4,999	Benchmarked Current Contract
NES QJ(39/2018 E128,633 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 0.3% YES QJ(39/2018 E213,322 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 5.2% YES QJ(39/2018 E213,322 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 0.7% YES QJ(39/2018 E135,000 Member Provided 0.7% YES QJ(39/2018 E135,075 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.5% YES QJ(39/2018 E135,075 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.15% YES QJ(39/2018 E135,075 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.15% YES QJ(39/2018 E63,130 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.13% YES QJ(39/2018 E63,130 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.13% YES QJ(39/2018 E63,130 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.13% YES QJ(39/2018 E63,130 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.13% YES QJ(39/2018 E63,130 Contract Mn - Confirmed by Member 1.23% YES QJ(39/2018 <td>East Lothian Council</td> <td>YES</td> <td>01/03/2018</td> <td>£277,582</td> <td>Contract MI - Confirmed by Member</td> <td>-5.2%</td> <td>-£14,459</td> <td>Benchmarked Current Contract</td>	East Lothian Council	YES	01/03/2018	£277,582	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-5.2%	-£14,459	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES 0J/03/2018 £233.23 Contract MI Confirmed by Member 7 5.2% VES TRE £785,000 Member Provided 0.7% VES TRE £785,000 Member Provided 0.7% VES U/03/2018 £123,675 Contract MI-Confirmed by Member -1.5% VES U/03/2018 £60,210 Contract MI-Confirmed by Member -5,0% I VES U/03/2018 £60,233 Contract MI-Confirmed by Member -2,3% I VES U/03/2018 £60,233 Contract MI-Confirmed by Member -2,3% I VES U/03/2018 £60,000 Amember Provided -2,3% I VES U/03/2018 £20,000 Contract MI-Confirmed by Member -2,3% I VES U/03/2018 £60,000 Amember Provided	East Renfrewshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£128,633	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	0.3%	£396	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES 01/03/2018 E822,352 Member Provided 0.7% YES BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £153,000 Member Provided 0.46% YES BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £123,675 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% YES BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £60,310 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% YES BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £60,310 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% YES BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £60,323 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -0.5% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £63,000 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.5% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £63,000 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.0% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £63,000 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.0% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £63,000 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.0% I NO OFFER RECEIVED 01/03/2018<	Falkirk Council	YES	01/03/2018	£213,232	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	5.2%	£11,014	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES TBC £735,000 Member Provided 4,6% VES 01/03/2018 £126,075 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 1.5% 1.5% VES 01/03/2018 £123,673 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 1.5% 1.5% VES 01/03/2018 £225,136 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 1.3% 1.3% VRS 01/03/2018 £25,136 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 1.3% NO PERFR RECEVED IVA VES 01/03/2018 £25,136 NO Member Provided 2.3% IVA - NA - - NO PERR RECEVED 01/03/2018 IVA - NA - - NA - IVA - NA - - - - IVA - - - - -	Fife Council	YES	01/03/2018	£822,352	Member Provided	0.7%	£5,978	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES, BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 01/03/2018 £160,000 . AVES 01/03/2018 £123,675 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 1-15% 1.15% AVES 01/03/2018 £227,621 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 1-13% 1.15% AVES 01/03/2018 £255,136 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 1-13% 1.13% AVES 01/03/2018 £255,136 Member Provided Nember 1-13% NO OFFER RECEIVED NO OFFER RECEIVE	Glasgow City Council	YES	TBC	£735,000	Member Provided	-4.6%	-£33,950	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES 0J/03/2018 £125,675 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.5% VYES 0J/03/2018 £227,621 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% VYES 0J/03/2018 £227,136 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.3% VYES 0J/03/2018 £259,136 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.3% I NA NO - N/A NO OFFER RECEVED -0.9% I NO VES 0J/03/2018 £60,033 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.9% I NO NO - - N/A NO OFFER RECEVED -0.9% I NO VES 0J/03/2018 £63,030 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -0.9% I NO VES 0J/03/2018 £63,630 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.3% I NO VES 0J/03/2018 £63,630 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.5% I NO VES 0J/03/2018 £63,630 Contract MI - Confided -2.6% VES 0J/03/2018 £61,736 Membe	Highland Council	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	£160,000	,	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
VES 0J/03/2018 £627/621 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -5.0% kvea A, Mailand & Cumbrae VES 0J/03/2018 £60,310 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -1.3% kvea B, Isle of Arran VES 0J/03/2018 £225,136 Member Provided -2.3% l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £040,523 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member NO OFFER RECEVED l NO NO N/A NO OFFER RECEVED l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £23,400 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £23,400 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided l NO VFS 0J/03/2018 £61,036 Ontract MI - Confirmed by Member l NO VFS	Inverclyde Council	YES	01/03/2018	£123,675	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-1.5%	-£1,857	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES 0J/03/2018 E60,310 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 1.3% krea b, Isle of Arran YES 0J/03/2018 E05,5136 Member Provided - 2.3% krea b, Isle of Arran YES 0J/03/2018 E640,523 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member NO OFFER RECEVED I YES 0J/03/2018 E0,000 Member Provided - 2.3% YES 0J/03/2018 E0,000 Member Provided - 6.7% YES 0J/03/2018 E0,000 Member Provided - 6.7% YES 0J/03/2018 E0,000 Member Provided - 6.7% YES 0J/03/2018 E159,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 6.7% YES 0J/03/2018 E159,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 2.6% YES 0J/03/2018 E150,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 2.6% YES 0J/03/2018 E151,989 Member Provided - 2.6% YES 0J/03/2018 E61,436 Member Provided - 2.73 YES 0J/	Midlothian Council	YES	01/03/2018	£227,621	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-5.0%	-£11,424	Benchmarked Current Contract
vrea A, Mainland & Cumbrae YES 01/03/2018 £295,136 Member Provided -2.3% vrea B, Isle of Arran YES 01/03/2018 £640,523 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member Provided -0.9% NO NO - NO -0.9% NO -0.9% NO NO - N/A - -0.9% NO NO NO - N/A - -0.9% NO NO NO - N/A - -0.9% NO	Moray Council	YES	01/03/2018	£60,310	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-1.3%	-£794	Benchmarked Current Contract
vea B, Isle of Arran YES, BUTNO OFFERS RECEIVED 0,103/2018 £640,523 Contract.MI - Confirmed by Member NO OFFER RECEIVED NO YES 01,03/2018 £640,523 Contract.MI - Confirmed by Member -0.9% NO YES 01,03/2018 £23,000 Member Provided -6.7% YES 01,03/2018 £65,030 Member Provided by Member -6.7% YES 01,03/2018 £65,030 Member Provided -6.7% YES 01,03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -6.7% YES 01,03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -6.7% YES 01,03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -7.3% YES 01,03/2018 £61,436 Member Provided -7.3% YES 01,03/2018 £61,436 Member Provided -7.3% YES 01,03/2018 £61,436 Member Provided -7.3% YES 01,03/2018 £62,530 Member Provided -7.3% YES 01,03/2018 £61,436	North Ayrshire Council - Area A, Mainland & Cumbrae	YES	01/03/2018	£295,136	Member Provided	-2.3%	-£6,761	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES	North Ayrshire Council - Area B, Isle of Arran	YES, BUT NO OFFERS RECEIVED	01/03/2018	N/A	,	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
NO OFFER RECEIVED NO OFFER RECEIVED	North Lanarkshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£640,523	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-0.9%	-£6,007	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES QJ/03/2018 £20,000 Member Provided -10.1% YES QJ/03/2018 £329,400 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.3% YES QJ/03/2018 £58,623 Member Provided -6.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -7.5% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £62,500 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £36,504 Member Provided -5.3%	Orkney Islands Council	ON		N/A		NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED	NO OFFER RECEIVED
YES QJ/03/2018 £53,400 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.3% YES QJ/03/2018 £58,623 Member Provided -6.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £63,000 Member Provided -0.0% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,39,569 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -7.3% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,360 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,500 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £31,509 Member Provided -14.7% YES QJ/03/2018 £36,504 Member Provided -5.17%	Perth & Kinross Council	YES	01/03/2018	£20,000	Member Provided	-10.1%	-£2,011	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES QJ/03/2018 ESS,623 Member Provided -6.7% YES QJ/03/2018 EG,000 Member Provided 0.0% YES QJ/03/2018 E159,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member 2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 E61,369 Member Provided 2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 E61,436 Member Provided -1,7% YES QJ/03/2018 E61,436 Member Provided -1,17% YES QJ/03/2018 E61,539 Member Provided -1,17% YES QJ/03/2018 E36,500 Member Provided -1,17% YES QJ/03/2018 E36,500 Member Provided -1,17% YES QJ/03/2018 E36,500 Member Provided -5,17%	Renfrewshire Coundl	YES	01/03/2018	£329,400	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-2.3%	-£7,684	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES QJ(33/2018 £65,000 Member Provided 0.0% I YES QJ(03/2018 £159,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member - 2.6% 2.6% YES QJ(03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided 2.6% 2.6% YES QJ(03/2018 £61,356 Member Provided -7.3% 14.7% YES QJ(03/2018 £157,989 Member Provided -14.7% 11.7% YES QJ(03/2018 £36,500 Member Provided -14.7% 11.7% YES QJ(03/2018 £36,500 Member Provided -14.7% 11.7%	Scottish Borders Council	YES	01/03/2018	£58,623	Member Provided	-6.7%	-£3,928	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES QJ/G3/2018 £159,969 Contract MI - Confirmed by Member -2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 £63,365 Member Provided 2.6% YES QJ/03/2018 £61,36 Member Provided -7.3% YES QJ/03/2018 £157,989 Member Provided -14,7% YES QJ/03/2018 £35,500 Member Provided -1,7% YES QJ/03/2018 £35,500 Member Provided -1,7%	Shetland Islands Council	YES	01/03/2018	£63,000	Member Provided	0.0%	0 J	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES	South Ayrshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£159,969	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	-2.6%	-£4,155	Benchmarked Current Contract
YES Q1/03/2018 £61,436 Member Provided -7.3% Ist YES Q1/03/2018 £157,989 Member Provided -14.7% India YES Q1/03/2018 £261,500 Member Provided -1.7% India YES Q1/03/2018 £261,500 Member Provided -1.7% India YES Q1/03/2018 £395,904 Member Provided -6.3%	South Lanarkshire Council	YES	01/03/2018	£333,659	Member Provided	2.6%	£8,536	Benchmarked Current Contract
VES 01/03/2018 £157,989 Member Provided -14.7% Inite VES 01/03/2018 £261,500 Member Provided -1.7% Inite VES 01/03/2018 £36,904 Member Provided -6.3%	Stirling Council	YES	01/03/2018	£61,436	Member Provided	-7.3%	-£4,466	Benchmarked Current Contract
rtonxibire YES 01/03/2018 £261,500 Member Provided -1.7% n Council YES 01/03/2018 £386,904 Member Provided -6.3%	Tayside Contracts	YES	01/03/2018	£157,989	Member Provided	-14.7%	-£23,177	Benchmarked Current Contract
n Council YES 01/03/2018 £396,904 Member Provided -6.3%	West Dunbartonshire	YES	01/03/2018	£261,500	Member Provided	-1.7%	-£4,422	Benchmarked Current Contract
300 157 53	West Lothian Council	YES	01/03/2018	£396,904	Member Provided	-6.3%	-£24,860	Benchmarked Current Contract
1.3%	TOTALS			£7.475.306		-1.3%	-£96,383	

Appendix 2 – Offers Received & SME Status

ORGANISATION NAME	SME STATUS	LOCATION	NUMBER OF LOTS OFFERED
D & D Dairies Ltd	Small	Crieff, Fife, Scotland	4
D J Campbell & Son	Small	Lochgilphead, Argyll & Bute, Scotland	5
John McKerrell	Micro	Bowmore, Islay, Argyll & Bute, Scotland	1
George Anderson & Sons	Medium	Tranent, East Lothian, Scotland	2
Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd	Large	Bridge of Allan, Stirling, Scotland	13
Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients	Large	Market Drayton, Shropshire, UK	23
Shetland Farm Dairies Ltd	Small	Lerwick, Shetland Islands, Scotland	1

Appendix 3 - Scoring and Recommendations (Asterisk (*) denotes recommended supplier)

	\ \ \ \ \	
Score	95.65	93.00
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients *	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*
Council	linguo) vitin acceptachy	

Score	85 25	62:53
Supplier	***************************************	ת ק ה ב
Council	Angus Council - Non	School Meals

Score	74.00	Score	99,75
Supplier	D J Campbell & Son*	Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A
Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area B, Oban & Lorne	Council	Argyll & Bute Council -

ts*	Score	72.00
Muller Milk & Ingredients *	Supplier	John McKerrell*
Area D, Helensburgh &	Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area F, Islay & Jura

Score	N/A
Supplier	NO OFFER
Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area H, Colonsay

Score	74.00	
Supplier	D J Campbell & Son*	
Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area J, Dunoon	

Score	94.18	93.00	
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	
Council	Clackmannanshire	Council	

99.75	Score	00.86
Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients*	Supplier	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Council	East Ayrshire Council

_		
Score	93.00	89.38
Supplier	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients *
Council		

Score	74.00
Supplier	D J Campbell & Son*
Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area A, Cowal

Council	Supplier	Score
Argyll & Bute Council -	D J Campbell & Son*	74.00
Area C, MIG Argyll &		
Council	Supplier	Score
Argyll & Bute Council -	NO OFFER	V/N
Area E, Tiree & Coll		W/A-1

Score	00 1/2	5	
Supplier		200	
Council	Argyll & Bute Council -	Area G, Mull	

Score	N/A	Score
Supplier	NO OFFER	Supplier
Council	Argyll & Bute Council - Area I, Bute	Council

	13114450	2505
	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	26
City of Edinburgh Council	Muller Milk & Ingredients *	99.73
	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	92.21
Council	Supplier	Score
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	NO OFFER	N/A

-	1	_	_	,
		Score	85.25	
		Supplier	D & D Dairies Ltd*	
		Council	Dundee City Council - Non School Meals	

Score

Supplier

Council

Score	90 75	99.13
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*
Council	East Dunbartonshire	Council

Score	32 00	99.73	85.87
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	George Anderson & Sons*
Council		East Lothian Council	

Score	99.75	89.25
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients*	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*
Council	11000000	

Council	Supplier	Score
	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	75 00
Glasgow City Council	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	57.66
	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	91.09

Council	Supplier	Score
Lizario Comoril	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	90 75
yae coalici	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	0

Score	93.00
Supplier	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*
Council	Moray Council

N/A	Score	N/A
NO OFFER	Supplier	NO OFFER
North Ayrshire Council - Area B, Isle of Arran	Council	Orkney Islands Council

Score	97.61	93.00	
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients*	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	
Council	Renfrewshire Council		

Council	Supplier	Score
1:00:100	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	93.00
	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	60 00
	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	90.03

Score	99 75		
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	
Council	Midlothian Council		

Council	Supplier	Score
North Ayrshire Council -	V/ ± 0 2	
Area A. Mainland &	ואומוופו סע א וופומוומ פוסמל דר ו/א	99.75
	Muller Milk & Ingredients*)
Cumbrae	8	

Score	99 75	0
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*
Council	ling of days and althou	

Score

Supplier

Council

Score	85.25	69.59
Supplier	***************************************	ת א ה המוופז בומ
Council	Perth & Kinross Council -	Non School Meals

Score	92.25	80.73		
Supplier	George Anderson & Sons*	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients*		
Council	Scottish Borders Council			

Score	90 75	0
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*
Council	South Avrehire Council	

Score 88.50

Shetland Farm Dairies Ltd*

Shetland Islands Council

Council

Supplier

Score	99.75
Supplier	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A Muller Milk & Ingredients*
Council	South Lanarkshire Council

Score	85.25
Supplier	D & D Dairies Ltd*
Council	Tayside Contracts

Council	Supplier	Score
	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	00 10
West Lothian Council	Muller Milk & Ingredients*	93.00
	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	93.00

e.	0	ш	
Score	93.00	91.45	
Supplier	Grahams the Family Dairy Ltd*	Muller UK & Ireland Group LLP T/A	Muller Milk & Ingredients*
Council	Worth change	West Calibality	