

To: Council

On: 24th September 2020

Report by: Lead Officer, on behalf of the Audit, Risk & Scrutiny Board

Heading: The Effectiveness of Fair Trade within Renfrewshire

1. Summary

- 1.1 Over a period of months and as part of the Audit, Risk and Scrutiny Board's annual programme, reports have been presented to the Board by the Lead Officer on the effectiveness of fair trade within Renfrewshire.
- 1.2 In undertaking this review, the Lead Officer liaised with and interviewed various external organisations, steering group members, council officers and elected members. Council officers were presented information and key partners and witnesses attended Board meetings to describe their roles in fair trade and provide further background and relevant information.
- 1.3 This report describes the purpose and scope of the review, it includes summaries of the information reported to each Board meeting and concludes with the key findings and proposed recommendations approved by the Audit, Risk & Scrutiny Board at its meeting held on 16 March 2020.

2. Recommendations

- 2.1 The Council is asked to:
 - approve the findings and recommendations of this report.

3. Background

- 3.1 At its meeting on 27th August 2018, members of the Audit, Risk and Scrutiny Board agreed an annual programme of activity for the Board for 2018/19. This included a review which would look at the effectiveness of fair trade within Renfrewshire.
- 3.2 The key purpose of this review was to:
 - (1) understand what motivates people to purchase fair trade products.
 - (2) ensure that fair trade in Renfrewshire benefits the producer at source.
 - (3) understand the processes in place to monitor the effectiveness of fair trade within Renfrewshire
 - (4) understand how fair trade is promoted within schools.
 - (5) determine if the current processes in place for the purchase and distribution of fair trade goods is the most efficient, both for the end producer and the customer.
 - (6) identify if there are other ways to deliver fair trade to ensure best value, whilst ensuring that the correct people are benefiting. This could include investigating if the current process of purchasing from numerous countries and spreading the wealth is the most beneficial, or, focus on a single country.
- 3.3 The scope of the review focused on liaising and interviewing:
 - Fair trade Organisations within and out-with Renfrewshire, including:
 - Rainbow Turtle,
 - Gavin's Mill
 - Just Trading Scotland,
 - Scottish Fair Trade Forum,
 - Fairtrade International
 - Fair Trade Scotland.

The intention of this was to understand the process or purchasing, distributing and selling fair trade products and to understand what motivates people to purchase fair trade.

- Services currently provided by the Chief Executive's service, this is predominantly how Renfrewshire Council engages with schools and community groups and how Renfrewshire Council monitors if fair trade is effective.
- Liaised with Renfrewshire Council Strategic Procurement Manager to gauge the financial implications of purchasing Fair Trade items if and when available.

- Renfrewshire's Fair Trade Steering Group to understand the work being undertaken in the local community.
- Attending the Scottish Fair Trade Forum to understand Fair Trade in Scotland.
- East Dunbartonshire Council, a Local Authority widely regarded as being one of the leading fair trade Authorities in Scotland to highlight potential areas of improvement within Renfrewshire.
- Engaged with Elected Members on the Fair Trade Steering Group to gain their overall views on fair trade within Renfrewshire.
- Undertaking a staff survey to get a better understanding as to what
 motivates people to purchase fair trade and to provide examples of
 fair trade products that people are interested in purchasing.
- 3.4 Progress reports were presented regularly to the Board and paragraphs 3.5 3.8 provide a resume of the main points presented on each occasion.

3.5 28th May 2019 – Scoping Paper & Fair Trade Summary

3.5.1 What is Fair Trade?

Fair trade aims to provide fair terms of trade for farmers and workers in the developing world, whilst:

- obtaining fairer prices,
- improving working conditions,
- providing local sustainability,

This is undertaken in a variety of ways by requiring companies to pay sustainable prices. That is, prices that never fall below the market price for the produce.

Fair trade aims to stop discrimination against the poorest, weakest producer by addressing conventional trade. This enables farmers, producers and those associated with fair trade in the developing world to improve their conditions and have more control over their lives.

3.5.2 Fair Trade in Renfrewshire

Renfrewshire Council recognises the importance that fair trade has; both within Renfrewshire and the effect is has Globally to the producer.

In 2007, a motion was raised at council Board supporting Renfrewshire's application to become a fairtrade zone, with status being granted shortly thereafter. Within a fairtrade zone, individual towns can also apply to become a fairtrade town. At present, Renfrewshire's fairtrade zone status has lapsed and the council are in the process of renewing it. Within Renfrewshire, only Kilbarchan currently has fairtrade town status, with the other towns requiring renewal, this is undertaken by community groups.

On 28th February 2019, Renfrewshire Council became one of the first Local Authorities in the UK to formally adopt the International Fair Trade Charter. Adoption of the Charter is not legally binding, however it signals Renfrewshire Council's intention to commit to the fair trade principles set out in the Charter.

The International Fair Trade Charter is a comprehensive document that lays out the purpose and aims of fair trade, as agreed by the World Fair Trade Organisation and Fairtrade International, two of the biggest global fair trade organisations.

Renfrewshire has a strong fair trade brand with a prominent retail outlet (Rainbow Turtle) situated in Paisley that is dedicated to the selling of fair trade produce. Paisley is also home to a commercial fair trade importer, distributor and educator based in Paisley (Just Trading Scotland).

3.6 26th August 2019 - Fair Trade out-with Renfrewshire

3.6.1 To facilitate a balanced review it was important to understand what other local authorities do in addressing fair trade. To further provide context to this element of the review, a knowledge sharing exercise was held with East Dunbartonshire to help share working practices and to highlight potential areas of improvement within Renfrewshire.

East Dunbartonshire Council support the principles of fair trade and as a consumer, the promotion and purchase of fair trade goods as part of their commitment to sustainable development.

East Dunbartonshire Council have successfully implemented:

- To offer fair trade goods where possible when catering for Council meetings and functions.
- To implement fair trade through procurement processes and those of suppliers wherever possible.
- To appoint a named Council representative to support the work of the East Dunbartonshire Fairtrade Steering Group.

- To promote Fair Trade issues and practices among local business, commercial and other organisations.
- To support the Group's communication plan (Appendix 1).
- To share best practice with regard to Fair Trade and sustainable development with other public bodies, stakeholders and partners.
- To work with the Steering Group to ensure that East Dunbartonshire continues to meet and exceed the requirements necessary to maintain its status as a Fairtrade Zone.
- 3.6.2 In relation to local fair trade wholesaler, Just Trading Scotland (JTS) are a fair trade importer based in Paisley and a registered Scottish charity, the business manager at Just Trading Scotland attended the August Board and gave an insight into the process from growing crops, to selling it throughout Renfrewshire and the UK. Discussion also took place in relation to the 90kg rice challenge that is undertaken in both schools and the wider community. It also allowed the Board to understand fully the process of fair trade and the associated benefits and challenges faced.

To date JTS have informed over 20,000 school children and 10,000 adults about fair trade and sustainable farming. The Lead Officer interviewed their business manager in relation to the purpose of this review.

The key areas covered were those highlighted in the initial scoping paper as being the key purpose of the review with the main points noted:

- <u>Motivation</u> Shops selling various products publicise that people are motivated to help the producers, but also that their customers feel that they are doing the right thing.
- Benefits the producer JTS deal direct with organisations in South Africa and have confidence that the producer at source is benefiting from products purchased in Renfrewshire. JTS are also in the audit stage of obtaining World Fair Trade Organisation (WFTO) membership. WFTO membership ensures that registered organisations are improving their ethical performance.
- Monitoring the effectiveness of fair trade this is very difficult to undertake as there are no existing benchmarks that can be used year on year and there are various version of what is fair trade.

 <u>Promotion within schools</u> - at present, very little proactive promotion is undertaken by Renfrewshire Council within its schools. It is largely left to individual schools to engage with fair trade organisations. A structured approach to fair trade led by a nominated officer would provide the emphasis and focus to promote fair trade within Renfrewshire schools.

3.7 <u>23rd September 2019 – the Fair Trade Steering Group & Fair Trade</u> within Schools

- 3.7.1 In keeping with the scope agreed by the Board, the review moved on to consider the relevant activities carried out by and facilitated by Renfrewshire Council. The main activities include chairing and facilitating the Fair Trade Steering Group and co-ordinating Fair Trade in schools.
- 3.7.2 The Steering group is there to allow any persons or organisations to come together to discuss fair trade within Renfrewshire

Renfrewshire's Fair Trade Steering Group is chaired by the Leader of Renfrewshire Council. Renfrewshire Council officers are there in the role of facilitators to support the group, to help it expand and to provide support to the work they are doing.

The objectives of the steering group are:

- To promote fair trade within Renfrewshire.
- To encourage the use of fairly traded goods.
- To secure the renewal of Fairtrade Zone status for Renfrewshire.
- To provide support for community groups to develop local fair trade campaigns.
- To support Scotland's aim to become a fair trade nation.
- To provide support for schools to encourage wider understanding about fair trade and to help promote the benefits of becoming a fairtrade school.
- To provide publicity to raise awareness of trade issues with the developing world.
- To take any action incidental to supporting these objectives.
- 3.7.3 Fair trade or the ethical purchasing of goods does not form part of the school curriculum.

At present it is down to individual schools as to whether they want to get involved in the promotion of fair trade and to introduce it into lessons, with some schools choosing to be more pro-active than others.

At present, the John McDowell award which is given to primary schools and a separate secondary schools award is given each year to schools. There is a basic application form that the Fair Trade Steering Group sends to schools with set criteria.

- 3.8 4th November 2020 Staff Survey, Discussions with Councillor Nicolson & External Organisations
 - 3.8.1 To facilitate a balanced review it was important to understand what motivated staff to purchase fair frade and to gather views on fair trade overall, as such a staff survey was undertaken by 268 renfrewshire staff members with the key points highlighted below with the full survey results available in Appendix 2. Discussions also took place with the chair of the fair trade Steering Group and a number of external organisations.
 - 3.8.2 The key points from the staff survey highlighted:
 - 69% of staff purchased a variety of fair trade products with the vast majority aware of where to go to purchase products.
 - 64% of respondents believe all towns in Renfrewshire should be Fairtrade towns
 - 85% of respondents believe that the children of Renfrewshire should be taught about fair trade at school.
 - 84% of respondents believe that Renfrewshire Council should purchase Fairtrade products where possible.
 - 33% of staff believe Renfrewshire Council does enough to promote fair trade.
 - 3.8.3 The Leader of the Renfrewshire Council, Councillor Nicolson is the chair of the Renfrewshire Fair Trade Steering Group. Discussions took place with Councillor Nicolson and the key points are highlighted:
 - Fair trade should be promoted along with ethical procurement of goods.
 - Engagement with local communities and voluntary groups should be explored as the steering group exists to support fair trade throughout Renfrewshire.
 - New members would help promote fair trade to the wider community.

- Renfrewshire Council should be doing more to promote fair trade.
 This thought mirrors part of the staff survey with only 33% of staff thinking that the council does enough to promote fair trade.
- Councillor Nicolson discussed that one element could be a more aggressive procurement policy, with the council purchasing fair trade goods unless there is justification not to, whilst ensuring that products are still reasonably priced.
- Councillor Nicolson believes that the promotion of fair trade within schools should be encouraged and is echoed by 85% of all council employees that were surveyed. However, schools may require additional support where they wish to take on fair trade as it does not form part of the school curriculum.
- 3.8.4 In order to facilitate a balanced review it was important to understand what other organisations do in promoting fair trade. As such, the Directors of Fair Trade Scotland Ltd were invited to a discussion to better understand the process involved in produce becoming certified.

There are a number of certifications for goods that are fair trade, there is the world renown logo of the Fairtrade Mark and there is also the Fair Trade Charter, to mention but a few.

The Fairtrade Mark guarantees giving a set price to the producer. Unfortunately, not all products carrying the Fairtrade logo are 100% fairtrade. The impact of goods must be audited to ensure the producer is benefiting. At present, this is not undertaken in order to get the Fairtrade Mark and the process of accreditation is not fully audited. Large International Organisations have diluted the mark in recent years as they purchase produce from co-operatives. Many of these co-operatives are not monitored and it may be a family with a number of farms that excludes the rest of the surrounding community.

At present, the World Fair Trade Organisation (WFTO) is the only organisation that ensures the producer is key in the chain. It is relatively straight forward for a company to get the Fairtrade Mark. However, many would find it difficult to obtain the WFTO accreditation due to the thoroughness of the accreditation process.

The WFTO have set out 10 principles that must be adhered to in order to obtain their accreditation. This rigorous accreditation takes many years to obtain. Producers must stick to all 10 principles to get the WFTO mark. The 10 principles are:

























4 Key Findings

- 4.1 While findings and recommendations follow, Renfrewshire Council's activity relating to fair trade is an ever-developing area and the council is continually looking at ways to promote and engage with fair trade organisations. Some findings are therefore observations only; not all lead to recommendations.
- 4.2 The promotion of fair trade within schools should be encouraged and is echoed by 85% of Renfrewshire council employees that were surveyed. However, schools may require additional support where they wish to take on fair trade as it does not form part of the school curriculum

Discussions have been ongoing with the Scottish Fair Trade Forum with a view to developing a Fair Trade culture within schools. The programme would be extended to not only cover fair trade but would also seek to educate children and young adults on issues surrounding poverty alleviation, human rights, gender equity, environmental protection and sustainable economic growth. This would help current and future generations to appreciate and embrace their responsibility as global citizens. This approach would potentially have a greater uptake than Fair Trade on is own in a time when many environmental platforms are vying for the public's attention.

4.3 It has been noted that fair trade could benefit from the council purchasing fair trade goods unless there is justification not to, as agreed by 84% of staff.

Discussions have taken place with the council's Strategic Procurement Manager to investigate the practicalities of introducing such a policy whilst ensuring that products are still reasonably priced. As an example, at present we purchase bananas through a contract at £1.08/kg. If we were to switch to fairtrade bananas through the same contract, that price wold increase to £1.90/kg, an increase of 76%. When pro rata'd over a 12 month period the additional cost to introduce fairtrade bananas would be approximately £55,000. Whilst consumers may look for a choice between fair trade and non fair trade, it would be costly for Renfrewshire Council to implement a fair trade only option on certain food-types.

4.4 It is noted that the Fairtrade Mark and WFTO accreditation both have their roles to play in the promotion of Fair Trade. It should be down to individual organisations to decide what level of fair trade they wish their products to be and to ensure that consumers are aware of each when making a fair trade purchase.

5 Recommendations

- 5.1 (1) Elected Members and Council Officers on the Renfrewshire Fair Trade Steering Group should support and encourage other members to set the agendas and initiate common objectives to benefit fair trade throughout Renfrewshire, with officers continuing to minute the meetings.
 - (2) It is recommended that the members of the steering group become more proactive in ensuring their own towns have Fairtrade status.
 - (3) It is recommended that the group introduce a structured communications plan for the year ahead as introduced by East Dunbartonshire Council. This would provide an ongoing focus and enable groups to plan in advance and liaise with other fair trade providers. It would also provide momentum for the group and could be used to harness the energy of each of the towns of Renfrewshire to work collectively towards a common goal.
 - (4) The Fair Trade Steering Group should look to establish a fair trade award in conjunction with the wider public and businesses. This could encompass a Renfrewshire Council fair trade sticker that can be displayed by local businesses with criteria set by the group.
 - (5) It is a recommendation of this report that the option to deliver a programme to educate staff and pupils is progressed with engagement with senior representatives within education. This programme, co-ordinated by The Scottish Fair Trade Forum would cover issues such as fair trade, poverty alleviation, human rights,

gender equity, environmental protection and sustainable economic growth as detailed in section 4.2 of this report. In doing so, the profile and awareness of the fair trade awards within schools would be increased.

- (6) It is recommended that the Fair Trade Steering Group introduce an awareness campaign to the wider community to highlight what fair trade produce is sold locally, as 69% of staff surveyed were aware of the location of the fair trade shop but were unaware as to the products sold. It would also be beneficial to highlight the benefits of purchasing fair trade and help to entice customers through the door. This could also be incorporated into the communications plan, as per recommendation (3).
- (7) Rainbow Turtle, Renfrewshire's flagship fair trade shop does not advertise other than facebook and twitter which is a captive audience for those individuals that already have an interest in fair trade. Smaller organisation like this would benefit from and support that could be offered through the community benefits section of the councils procurement contracts. It is recommended that the Steering Group meet to discuss any benefits with the councils Strategic Procurement Manager.

Implications of the Report

- 1. Financial none
- 2. HR & Organisational Development none
- 3. Community Planning
- 4. Legal none
- 5. **Property/Assets** none
- 6. **Information Technology** none
- 7. Equality & Human Rights
 - a) The Recommendations contained within this report have been assessed in relation to their impact on equalities and human rights. No negative impacts on equality groups or potential for infringement of individuals' human rights have been identified arising from the recommendations contained in the report. If required following implementation, the actual impact of the recommendations and the mitigating actions will be reviewed and monitored, and the results of the assessment will be published on the Council's website.
- 8. **Health & Safety** none
- 9. **Procurement** none
- 10. **Risk** none
- 11. Privacy Impact none
- 12. **Cosla Policy Position** not applicable.
- 13. Climate Risk none

Author: Craig Doogan 0141 618 6198

Craig.Doogan@renfrewshire.gov.uk

Appendix 1

EAST DUNBARTONSHIRE FAIR TRADE STEERING GROUP - COMMUNICATIONS PLAN - 2017-19

1. KEY MESSAGES

Fair Trade is about decent working conditions and fair terms of trade for farmers and workers. It encourages sustainable production techniques and protection for the environment. It contributes to the sustainability of supply chains. The Fairtrade Mark gives consumers guarantees about the product so they can make an informed decision about their purchase.

- 1. The East Dunbartonshire Fair Trade Steering Group supports all fair trade, not just farmers in the Fairtrade system, so it supports a raising of social, economic and environmental standards in all supply chains both locally and globally.
- 2. East Dunbartonshire was one of the first areas to gain Fairtrade Zone status in 2007 and has held Fairtrade Zone status continually since then the only area in Scotland to achieve continual zone status for so long.
- 3. It has pioneered new initiatives, such as the Fairtrade Cotton Schoolwear Campaign, the Nurseries Campaign and Themed Menus in Schools. These have been rolled out nationally.
- 4. It is well supported by the Council, something the Fairtrade Foundation praised "we were particularly impressed by the excellent and continuing relationship with the Council and their active involvement locally and nationally encouraging fair trade food procurement in schools".
- 5. Fair Trade is supported throughout all geographical areas of East Dunbartonshire, being particularly strong in schools and churches. The Coach House at Balmore was established in 1980 and was one of the first supporters of Fair Trade in Scotland.

2. KEY PEOPLE INVOLVED

Alongside the members of the East Dunbartonshire Fair Trade Steering Group

- Lenzie Fairtrade Group
- Bearsden and Milngavie Fairtrade Group
- Milton of Campsie Parish Church Justice and Peace Group (Founding Group)
- The Balmore Trust

The Group also operates a Nursery Group and a Schools Group to support Fair Trade in Teaching and Learning. Nursery Group led by Tracy Mitchell, Schools Group led by Angela Oakley

The Group works closely with the Scottish Fair Trade Forum. One member is also on the Board of the Forum and another is the Forum's Volunteers Schools Advisor. The Forum offers advice and support.

3. METHODS OF COMMUNICATION

- Local newspapers (Kirkintilloch Herald, Bishopbriggs Herald, Milngavie and Bearsden Herald)
- Local radio
- Meetings and events
- Email bulletins
- Magazines, newsletters and flyers (e.g. EDC Edit but also of other partners e.g. EDVA quarterly newsletter)
- Websites (EDC plus those of partners)
- Social media (facebook and twitter)

4. ACTION PLAN

Date	Milestone / Event / Task	Target Group	Communication	Purpose / Key Messages
			Method	
January 2017	Update Council website with new Fair Trade Motion		Council Website	Awareness of Council
				commitment to Fair Trade
Ongoing	Continue to update and share posts from other		Social Media	Raise awareness of fair trade
	organisations on Facebook			amongst a wider audience
Ongoing	New school mergers (Auchinairn/Woodhill & St. Agatha's/St. Flannan's) and ongoing consideration of fair trade school uniforms		Emails, meetings, newsletters.	Raise awareness and encourage take up of fair trade school uniforms.
Ongoing	Steering Group to secure another flagship employer		Press Release/Social Media	Raise Awareness and uptake of Fair Trade with business sector
2 February	Fairtrade nursery group meets in Hillhead Primary			
End February	Article about Fair Trade in East Dunbartonshire	Community	EDC Website and	Raise Awareness and uptake of
2017	Council 'You and Your Community' newsletter.	groups and	email to	Fair Trade with community
	Update community grant guidance to refer to	General Public	community	groups. Seek new members of
	sustainable development.		groups.	steering group and offer to talk

			to community groups about Fair Trade.
27 February – 12 March 2017	Fair Trade Fortnight Activity will be Put Fairtrade in your Break. Don't feed Exploitation Event packs and special resources are available from the Fairtrade Foundation. http://schools.fairtrade.org.uk/	Press Release/Social Media	
Early March 2017	Celebrate Fair trade zone renewal for East Dunbartonshire	Press Release/Social Media	Ten years of fair trade status
1 March	Gavin's Mill opening	Council Facebook and Social Media	
2 March	Photo opportunity in Lairdsland School dining area with P6 pupils in the afternoon at 1:15. Fair Trade stalls in Southbank receptions on March 2nd 12-1 Marina, 1.30-2.30 Southbank House and 2.30-3.30 Campus Building. Brommhill Stall (8 March over lunch in canteen) following week.	Press Release/Social Media Internal email bulletin for stalls in Southbank.	Put Fairtrade in your Break. Don't feed Exploitation. During Fairtrade Fortnight this year we are being encouraged to choose Fairtrade items for our Breaks. As well as tea and coffee, this may include cakes, biscuits and sweets made with Fairtrade ingredients and we should also think about fairly traded fruit from countries where farmers may struggle to provide life's necessities for their families.
Saturday 11 March	'Time to put Fairtrade in your Break' event by Lenzie Group. Lenzie Fairtrade Group is organising a coffee morning devoted to the theme of putting Fairtrade into our Break which will take place on	Press Release/Social Media	Put Fairtrade in your Break. Don't feed Exploitation

	Saturday 11 March from 10 - 12 in Lenzie Union Parish Church Hall. As well as a range of Fairtrade coffee blends to taste, there will be plenty of home baked "Fairtrade Break" items to try as well as the ever popular "smoothie bike". There will also be lots of activities for children to help them understand the Fairtrade message in a fun and enjoyable way. Admission charge will be £2 per adult and £1 per school age child.			
13 May 2017	World Fair Trade Day		Press Release/Social Media	A worldwide festival of events celebrating Fair Trade as a tangible contribution to the fight against poverty and exploitation, climate change and the economic crises.
TBC in 2017	Closure of the Coach House and ensuring its work continues.		TBC	Celebrate achievements and plans for future.
TBC in 2017	Council to affiliate with Electronics Watch		Press Release / Social Media	First Council in Scotland to affiliate? Highlight progress re fair trade in Council procurement (e.g. laptop rollout)
24-30 April 2017	Fashion Revolution Week			Ethical clothes production
Summer 2017	Fair Trade presence at Kirkintilloch Canal Festival		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
Summer 2017	Fair Trade presence at town Gala Days		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
TBC in 2017	Directory of Fair Trade ED retailers	Steering Group members to add retailers to ED asset map: http://www.east	TBC in 2017 (funding for leaflet)	Directory of Fair Trade ED retailers Encourage people to buy Fair

		dunassets.org.uk		Trade products from local shops.
		7		Raise awareness in businesses of the ethos of Fair Trade including the Fair Trade premium and the effect on local communities in developing countries.
September 2017	Autumn Event		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
February 2018	Fairtrade Fortnight		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
May 2018	World Fair Trade Day		Press Release/Social Media	A worldwide festival of events celebrating Fair Trade as a tangible contribution to the fight against poverty and exploitation, climate change and the economic crises.
Summer 2018	Fair Trade presence at Kirkintilloch Canal Festival		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
Summer 2018	Fair Trade presence at town Gala Days		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
September 2018	Autumn event		Press Release/Social Media	5 Key Messages
December 2018	Fair Trade Zone renewal			Celebrate Achievements

Appendix 2 - Fair Trade Survey Results















