

Minute of Meeting

Audit, Scrutiny and Petitions Board

Date	Time	Venue
Monday, 28 November 2016	10:00	CMR 1, Council Headquarters, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley, PA1 1AN

PRESENT

Councillors Bibby, M Brown, Caldwell, M Devine, McEwan, Provost Hall, Councillors J MacLaren, Perrie and J Sharkey.

CHAIR

Councillor J Sharkey, Convener, presided.

IN ATTENDANCE

P MacLeod, Director of Children's Services; L McIntyre, Strategic Planning & Policy Development Manager and N Irvine-Brown, Assistant Planning & Policy Development Manager (both Chief Executive's); C Grainger, Service Planning & Policy Development Manager, lead officer, and D McNab, Transportation Manager (both Community Resources); and K Graham, Head of Corporate Governance, G Allison, Graduate Intern, L Belshaw, Democratic Services Manager, F Lannie, Information Governance Development Officer, K Locke, Risk Manager, and A McMahon, Chief Auditor (all Finance & Resources).

ALSO ATTENDING

M Ferris and T Reid, both Audit Scotland.

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillor M Devine declared an interest in relation to item 10 of the agenda. She indicated that it was her intention to remain in the meeting and to participate in discussion of the item.

1 SUMMARY OF INTERNAL AUDIT FINDINGS - 1 JULY TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2016

There was submitted a report by the Chief Auditor relative to the requirement in terms of the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) that Internal Audit must communicate the results of each engagement to the Board. To comply with this requirement, Internal Audit submitted regular reports on the findings and conclusions of audit engagements. The appendix to the report provided a summary of findings in relation to final reports issued for those engagements completed during the period 1 July to 30 September 2016.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

2 INTERNAL AUDIT AND COUNTER FRAUD PERFORMANCE - 1 JULY TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2016

There was submitted a report by the Chief Auditor relative to progress against local and national initiatives involving Internal Audit and the Counter Fraud team from 1 April to 30 September 2016. The report intimated that normally, Internal Audit measured the progress and performance of the team on a regular basis using a range of performance indicators (PIs) and reported these to the Board as part of this report. However, as Internal Audit were transferring over to a revised audit management system and the PIs had to be calculated manually, only the percentage of Audit Plan completion PI was available for the period 1 April to 30 September 2016.

In terms of Counter Fraud, the report intimated that the current focus in this area was establishing priorities for the new team and it had been agreed with the Director of Finance & Resources that no performance targets would be established for 2016/17.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

3 'RISK MATTERS' COMBINED RISK MANAGEMENT POLICY AND STRATEGY

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to 'Risk Matters' the Council's combined risk management policy and strategy.

The report intimated that Risk Matters was formally reviewed every two years and an interim review was conducted by the Corporate Risk Management Group on behalf of the Corporate Management Team. The report highlighted that risk management arrangements were well established and robust. Risk Matters continued to reflect good practice, was aligned to recognised standards and took account of learning through benchmarking with other public sector organisations. The report proposed that as risk management practice was well embedded what had traditionally been the Corporate Risk Register be separated into two distinct risks - a Strategic Risk Register which would contain details of the externally-focussed risks and a Corporate Risk Register which would contain details of the internally focussed risks. This arrangement would fit well with the Council Plan as the Strategic Risk Register would align with the Better Future priorities of the Plan and the Corporate Risk Register would align with the Better Council priorities. Once approved, these arrangements would take effect from 1 April 2017.

DECIDED: That Risk Matters, version 12.0, be approved.

4 **AUDIT SCOTLAND REPORT 'SOCIAL WORK IN SCOTLAND'**

There was submitted a report by the Director of Children's Services relative to Audit Scotland's report 'Social Work in Scotland' which highlighted the risks to high quality sustainable social work services within the context of continuing financial constraint, demographic challenges and changes to structures and governance within social care and social work. The report stated that the social work profession was at a watershed and made key recommendations in relation to social work strategy and service planning; governance and scrutiny arrangements; workforce and service efficiency and effectiveness.

The report intimated that Audit Scotland planned subsequent audits on health and social care integration, particularly after the first full year of integration and thereafter on the longer-term impact integration, which would expect to see a shift of resources towards community-based services and preventative interventions which would improve the outcomes for people who used services.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

5 **SENIOR OFFICERS' REGISTER OF INTERESTS**

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the register of senior officers' interests. The report intimated that the 2015/16 annual audit report to members and the Controller of Audit issued by Audit Scotland included a recommendation that information relating to senior officers' interests should be published on the Council website and the Council should consider extending the scope of the register to other staff by 30 June 2017. The report confirmed that information from the register of senior officers' interests had been published from 28 October 2016 on the Council's website. Renfrewshire was the only Council in Scotland that had published information on the interests of its senior officers. The report noted that a review would be undertaken of these arrangements ahead of the 30 June 2017 deadline to determine whether the requirement to register interests should be extended to other officers and whether further information should be included in the information published on the website.

DECIDED: That it be noted that the action in the annual audit report from Audit Scotland regarding publication of information relating to senior officers interests had been implemented.

6 **SCOTTISH INFORMATION COMMISSIONER ANNUAL REPORT 2015/16**

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the annual report by the Scottish Information Commissioner. The report intimated that the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA) created a general right to obtain information from any designated Scottish public authority subject to limited exemptions. The Commissioner's 2015/16 annual report explored the performance of the Office of the Scottish Information Commissioner across the year and how FOISA could 'add demonstrable value to public services' within Scotland. It was noted that there had been a total of 540 appeals to the Commissioner in 2015/16. Renfrewshire Council had three appeals submitted to the Commissioner, two of which were from the same requester and which were subsequently withdrawn. The third fully upheld the Council's decision to refuse to release material as it was already publicly available on the Council's website and no further release of information was required.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

7 COMMISSIONER FOR ETHICAL STANDARDS IN PUBLIC LIFE IN SCOTLAND ANNUAL REPORT 2015/16

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the annual report by the Commissioner for Ethical Standards in Public Life in Scotland. The report provided details of the investigation of complaints about the conduct of councillors, members of devolved public bodies and MSPs and scrutiny of Scotland's Ministerial public appointments process. The report also related to the last year of the Commissioner's 2012/16 strategic plan, looked forward to the first period of the 2016/20 plan and provided an overview of the 2015/16 budget. The report advised that the volume and complexity of conduct complaints remained high with a 19% increase over the previous year. Whilst the number of complaints relating to failure to register or declare an interest appeared to be on a downward trend, there had been a significant increase in the number of complaints alleging failure to show respect to councillors, to officials or to members of the public. The report also referred to the increasing number of complaints about comments made on social media. Nationally during 2015/16 the Commissioner received 202 complaints about councillors and the subject matter of the complaints was detailed in the report. No specific figures for Renfrewshire Council were included in the report. However, information had been received separately from the Commissioner that, during the period covered by the report 6 complaints had been received against Renfrewshire councillors compared with 10 in 2014/15. During the period covered by the report there were no hearings involving Renfrewshire councillors.

The report noted that, as part of the elected members' training and development programme, briefings on code of conduct matters were provided to members and a new programme of briefings was in preparation for 2017.

DECIDED: That the report and the actions taken in Renfrewshire in relation to the Code of Conduct and members' training and development be noted.

8 SCOTTISH PUBLIC SERVICES OMBUDSMAN (SPSO) ANNUAL REPORT 2015/16

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman's (SPSO) annual report. The report intimated that the SPSO was the final stage for complaints about councils, the National Health Service, housing associations, colleges, and universities, prisons, most water providers, the Scottish Government and its agencies and departments and most Scottish authorities. Local government remained the sector about which the SPSO received most complaints at 37.45% with the NHS again receiving the second highest number 32.88%. No complaint details for specific organisations were included in the report. However, information was received separately from the SPSO which indicated that the number of complaints received relative to Renfrewshire was 56 compared with 63 in 2014/15. During the period of the report the SPSO determined 52 complaints against the Council. Received and determined numbers did not tally as complaints determined included cases carried forward from previous years. Of the 52 complaints determined during the period, none were fully investigated, only one was partly upheld and none were the subject of a report to the Scottish Parliament. The SPSO would not generally consider a complaint unless the complainer had gone through the Council's complaints procedure fully. In 2015/16 the Council received 6860 complaints.

The SPSO indicated that a low uphold rate suggests a robustness in an authority's handling of complaints.

DECIDED:

- (a) That the report be noted; and
- (b) That it be noted of the 52 complaints against Renfrewshire Council determined by the SPSO in 2015/16, none were fully investigated, only one was partly upheld, and none were the subject of a report to the Scottish Parliament.

9 **REVIEW OF WARD 15 (CHILDREN'S WARD) ROYAL ALEXANDRA HOSPITAL (LEAD OFFICER COLIN GRAINGER)**

Under reference to item 10 of the Minute of the meeting of the Board held on 19 September 2016 there was submitted a report by the Lead Officer attaching the Board's findings and recommendations relative to its review, the purpose of which had been to provide an evidence-based analysis of the current provision at Ward 15 and to inform the Council's position on any NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde consultation on the future of the Ward.

The report set out the background and scope of the review together with information gathered via local testimonials, including on-line consultation and from engagement with NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. It was noted that NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde would commence a formal consultation process in November 2016 which would conclude in February 2017.

DECIDED:

- (a) That the findings of the review be approved;
- (b) That the evidence gathered which was now publically available and able to inform local people and members in relation to the current, and any future, consultation relating to Ward 15 (Children's Ward) Royal Alexandra Hospital, be noted; and
- (c) That the report be submitted for approval to the next meeting of the Council to be held on 15 December 2016.

Prior to consideration of the following item, the Convener welcomed Mr Hunter to the meeting.

SEDERUNT

Councillors McEwan and Perrie left the meeting prior to consideration of the following item.

DECLARATION OF INTEREST

Councillor M Devine, having previously declared an interest in the following item, remained in the meeting.

10 **PETITION: PARKING BAYS, RENFREW ROAD, PAISLEY**

Under reference to item 6 of the Minute of the meeting of the Board held on 21 March 2016 there was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the petition by Mr Hunter in the following terms:

"I would like Renfrew District Council to remove the safety hazard caused by the position of parking bays outside my house 86a Renfrew Road. I would like a Health and Safety assessment of the risk and I would like the pavement to be re-instated and metal bollards on the pavement to prevent on pavement parking."

The report intimated that the petition had been considered previously at meetings of the Board held on 25 January and 21 March 2016. At the meeting of the Board held on 21 March 2016 the petition had been continued in order that the Board could be provided with all information in relation to this matter. The report outlined the Head of Amenity Services' advice to Mr Hunter in relation to the matter.

The Board then heard from Mr Hunter in relation to his petition and from the Transportation Manager.

The Convener proposed that the Board recommend to the Director of Community Resources that bollards be erected on the pavement outside Mr Hunter's property. This was agreed.

DECIDED: That it be recommended to the Director of Community Resources that bollards be erected on the pavement outside Mr Hunter's property.

Prior to consideration of the following matter, the Convener welcomed Ms Dryburgh to the meeting.

11 **PETITION: CORSEBAR ROAD, PAISLEY**

Under reference to item 12 of the Minute of the meeting of the Board held on 19 September 2016 there was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the petition by Ms Dryburgh, in the following terms:

"As I have become visually impaired and can no longer drive I have to access buses and also have to frequently attend clinics at the RAH. Trying to cross Corsebar Road is very difficult and dangerous, even for people who are elderly or disabled. I think there is an urgent need for a pedestrian crossing or even just a central island near the entrance to the RAH driveway."

The report intimated that the petition had been considered by the Board previously at meetings held on 30 November 2015 and 15 February 2016 and set out the Head of Amenity Services' comments in relation to this matter.

The Board heard from Ms Dryburgh and from the Transportation Manager.

The Convener proposed that the petition be continued to a future meeting of the Board and that the Transportation Manager liaise with the Royal Alexandra Hospital in relation to their views on a pedestrian crossing on Corsebar Road in the vicinity of the entrance to the hospital. It was also proposed that with reference to the Head of Amenity Services' comment that the site's injury record did not justify an intervention, the Board be provided with details of the injury record and what would justify an intervention. This was agreed.

DECIDED:

(a) That the petition be continued to a future meeting of the Board and that the Transportation Manager liaise with the Royal Alexandra Hospital in relation to their views on a pedestrian crossing on Corsebar Road in the vicinity of the entrance to the hospital; and

(b) That with reference to the Head of Amenity Services' comment that the site's injury record did not justify an intervention, the Board be provided with details of the injury record and what would justify an intervention.

Prior to consideration of the following item, the Convener welcomed Mr and Mrs Lang to the meeting.

12 PETITION: NEWMAINS ROAD, RENFREW

Under reference to item 15 of the Minute of the meeting of the Board held on 19 September 2016 there was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to the petition by Mrs Lang in the following terms:

"To address traffic concerns, in particular 'speeding' on Newmains Road, Renfrew."

The report intimated that the Head of Amenity Services had advised that he was aware of speeding complaints on Newmains Road, Renfrew, which was a wide road with parking on both sides and links with Paisley Road and Sandy Road.

The Board heard from Mr and Mrs Lang and from the Transportation Manager.

The Convener proposed that the matter be referred to Police Scotland to conduct monitoring at appropriate times, including the use of speed traps, and that the petitioner and Police Scotland be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which time the petition would be considered further. This was agreed.

DECIDED: That the matter be referred to Police Scotland to conduct monitoring at appropriate times and that the petitioner and Police Scotland be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which time the petition would be considered further.

Prior to consideration of the following item, the Convener welcomed Ms McEwan to the meeting.

13 PETITION: BUS STOP AND SHELTER, BARRHEAD ROAD, PAISLEY

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to a petition which had been received from Ms McEwan in the following terms:

"To reinstate the bus stop and shelter on Barrhead Road, adjacent to Barscube Terrace - because of concerns and issues of access for those disabled and elderly passengers."

The report intimated that the Head of Amenity Services had advised that the bus shelter had been assessed for safety reasons by Strathclyde Partnership for Transport (SPT) and Renfrewshire Council. Access from the footpath to the shelter was by four steps which was not Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) compliant, in addition access to the shelter was restricted to less than one metre and as a result had been decommissioned on safety grounds. SPT had removed the bus stop flag

and had advised bus operators that they should no longer use the stop. However, the shelter would have to remain in place as it formed part of the bus shelter advertising contract and was subject to planning permission. The nearest stop and shelter was approximately 90 metres southeast of the decommissioned stop.

The Board heard from Ms McEwan and the Transportation Manager.

The Convener proposed that the Transportation Manager investigate what measures would be required to make the shelter DDA compliant and that the petitioner be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which the petition would be considered further. This was agreed.

DECIDED: That the Transportation Manager investigate what measures would be required to make the shelter DDA compliant and that the petitioner be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which the petition would be considered further

Prior to consideration of the following item, the Convener welcomed Mr Jackson and Mr Anderson to the meeting.

14 **PETITION: SPEED BUMPS, THE WICKETS, PAISLEY**

There was submitted a report by the Director of Finance & Resources relative to a petition which had been received from Mr Jackson, on behalf of the Wickets Residents Association, in the following terms:

"The Wickets Residents Association

Speeding by some drivers through the Wickets estate is persistent. The Association committee over the last 4 years has striven to address the issues, but to little effect.

The committee wish Renfrewshire Council to approve 3 sets of speed bumps within the estate."

The report intimated that the Head of Amenity Services had advised that there were no injury accidents recorded on this length of road over the last three-year period. However, the Council was aware that there had been reports of speeding in this area but there had been no evidence to support this.

The Board heard from Mr Jackson, Mr Anderson and from the Transportation Manager.

The Convener proposed that the Transportation Manager undertake further discussions with the petitioners and that a site visit be arranged with Police Scotland; that the Transportation Manager and representatives of the Residents Association; and that the petitioner, together with Police Scotland be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which the petition would be considered further. This was agreed.

DECIDED: That the Transportation Manager undertake further discussions with the petitioners and that a site visit be arranged with Police Scotland the Transportation Manager and representatives of the Residents Association; and that the petitioner, together with Police Scotland be invited to a future meeting of the Board at which the petition would be considered further.