

Planning Application: Supplementary Report



Reference No. 20/0813/LB

Renfrewshire
Council

KEY INFORMATION

Ward: (9) Johnstone North, Kilbarchan, Howwood and Lochwinnoch

Applicant: Graiseley Investments Ltd

Registered: 4 December 2020

Report by Head of Economy & Development

PROSPECTIVE PROPOSAL: Demolition of C Listed Building

LOCATION: St Joseph's Nursing Home Dormitory Block, St Joseph's Nursing Home, Kilbirnie Road, Lochwinnoch

APPLICATION FOR: Listed Building Consent

This supplementary report should be read together with the original report of handling considered by the Communities, Housing and Planning Policy Board on 26 October 2021.

BACKGROUND

The Communities, Housing and Planning Policy Board at its meeting on 26 October 2021 considered the attached report of handling and decided to continue the consideration of the report to allow a site visit to take place. The detailed assessment of the proposed development is included in the attached report of handling.

SITE VISIT

A site visit took place on 12 January 2022 and those members attending viewed the application site and its surroundings.

The site visit was conducted in accordance with the Protocol for Site Visits (22 May 2018) and members attending did not discuss the merits of the proposal.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

It is considered that assessment of the proposed development, as detailed in the attached report of handling, together with the additional information provided by the applicant in respect of the late representation, is sufficient to recommend that planning permission be granted subject to conditions.

For clarity the recommendation with reasons and conditions are set out below:

RECOMMENDATION

Grant subject to conditions

Alasdair Morrison
Head of Economy & Development

Planning Application: Supplementary Report

Reference No. 20/0813/LB



Reason for Decision

The proposal accords with the provisions of the Development Plan and there are no material considerations which outweigh the presumption in favour of development according with the Development Plan.

Conditions

- 1 No demolition shall take place until it has been demonstrated to the written satisfaction of the planning authority that signed and binding contracts are in place to secure the redevelopment of the site immediately following demolition.

Reason: In the interest of amenity and to ensure that the listed building is not demolished unless approved development is to take place on the cleared site immediately following its demolition.

- 2 No demolition shall take place until it has been demonstrated to the written satisfaction of the planning authority that architectural features worthy of salvage have been identified and shall be salvaged through the demolition process.

Reason: To ensure that architectural features of note are saved and capable of reuse in the redevelopment of the site.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 - Background Papers. For further information or to inspect any letters of objection and other background papers, please contact Sharon Marklow on 0141 618 7835.

Planning Application: Report of Handling

Reference No. 20/0813/LB



Renfrewshire
Council

KEY INFORMATION

Ward: (9) Johnstone North, Kilbarchan, Howwood and Lochwinnoch

Applicant: Graiseley Investments Ltd

Registered: 4 December 2020

Report by Head of Economy & Development

PROSPECTIVE PROPOSAL: Demolition of C Listed Building

LOCATION: St Joseph's Nursing Home Dormitory Block, St Joseph's Nursing Home, Kilbirnie Road, Lochwinnoch

APPLICATION FOR: Listed Building Consent



© Crown Copyright and database right 2020. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey Licence number 100023417.

RECOMMENDATION

Grant subject to conditions

Alasdair Morrison
Head of Economy and
Development Services

IDENTIFIED KEY ISSUES

- The application site is identified by Policy ENV1 and ENV3 of both the Adopted Renfrewshire Local Development Plan (2014) and the Proposed Renfrewshire Local Development Plan (2021 as modified).
- 1 representation in support of the proposal has been received.
- There have been no objections from consultees.
- The proposal accords with the relevant provisions of the Adopted Renfrewshire Local Development Plan and Scottish Historic Environment Policy Statement as sufficient evidence has been provided to satisfy the relevant tests in relation to demolition of listed buildings and it has been demonstrated that St Joseph's dormitory building is beyond viable conversion, refurbishment, or reuse.

REPORT OF HANDLING FOR APPLICATION 20/0813/LB

SITE ADDRESS:	St Joseph's Nursing Home Dormitory Block, St Joseph's Nursing Home, Kilbirnie Road, Lochwinnoch
PROPOSAL:	Demolition of C Listed Building
RECOMMENDATION	Grant subject to conditions.

PROPOSAL	<p>This application seeks listed building consent for the demolition of a category C listed building, 'the dormitory building', located within the former St Joseph's College Missionary site, which until its closure in 2005 operated as a Care Home.</p> <p>The principal reason for seeking the demolition of the dormitory building is due to its very poor condition. Structural surveys undertaken concluded that the dormitory building is a dangerous building and economic repair is not viable.</p> <p>The building is described in its listing as an 8 bay, 3 storey, rectangular-plan hospital ward block and plain Art-Deco style built in 1936 as a later addition to the site.</p> <p>The frontage of the rectangular block remains along with a later addition of a stairwell/lift shaft which is conventional and utilitarian in its appearance.</p> <p>The rear of the hospital block building has fell away, with the rubble remaining as mounds to the rear of the building and the internal areas of the building exposed.</p>
PLANNING HISTORY	<p>07/0725/LB – Conversion of existing building to form 30 flats and selective demolition of outbuildings, upgrading of access roads, car parking and associated landscaping. Granted subject to conditions on 8 April 2008.</p> <p>07/0724/PP – Conversion of existing building to form 30 flats and selective demolition of outbuildings, upgrading of access roads, car parking and associated landscaping. Granted subject to conditions on 25 April 2008.</p>
CONSULTATIONS:	Historic Environment Scotland (HES) – No objections.
REPRESENTATIONS	One representation in support of the proposal has been received which outlines that the building is semi-derelict and in a partially demolished state which is a danger to children living in the immediate vicinity and to local residents generally.
DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES	Renfrewshire Local Development Plan 2014 Policy ENV3 - Built Heritage

	<p>New Development Supplementary Guidance Delivering the Environment Strategy: Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas.</p> <p>Proposed Renfrewshire Local Development Plan (2021 as modified) Policy ENV3 – Built and Cultural Heritage</p> <p>Draft New Development Supplementary Guidance 2019 Delivering the Environment Strategy: Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas.</p> <p>Material considerations The Scottish Historic Environment Policy Statement and associated Managing Change in the Historic Environment Guidance - Demolition.</p>
PLANNING ASSESSMENT	<p>In the case of applications for the demolition of listed buildings the Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement states that no listed building should be demolished unless it can be clearly demonstrated that every effort has been made to retain it.</p> <p>Historic Environmental Scotland's Policy sets out that Planning Authorities should only approve such applications where they are satisfied that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The building is not of special interest; or (b) The building is incapable of repair; or (c) The demolition of the building is essential to delivering significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community; or (d) The repair of the building is not economically viable and that it has been marketed at a price reflecting its location and condition to potential restoring purchasers for a reasonable period. <p>These four tests are re-stated in Renfrewshire Council's New Development Supplementary Guidance.</p> <p>Historic Environmental Scotland's Policy Statement and the New Development Supplementary Guidance requires that only one of these four tests be satisfied.</p> <p>When the proposed demolition is assessed against these requirements the following conclusions can be made:</p> <p>(a) The building is not of special interest</p> <p>The dormitory building is different in character to the main buildings which were on this site, which comprised Garthland Mansion House and the chapel building built in 1943.</p> <p>It is the largest structure on the site and the building now stands alone</p>

	<p>after the demolition of Garthland House due to its structural condition.</p> <p>It is considered that the building does not contribute to the original grouping or setting and does not relate well to the chapel building which remains on site.</p> <p>The renovation that would be required to bring this unit back into use would essentially amount to re-build.</p> <p>Historic Environment Scotland considers that on balance taking into account the condition and the character and appearance of the building along with the likely costs of a meaningful restoration, that they do not object to the proposal.</p> <p>In considering the evidence the accompanies this application along with the consideration of Historic Environment Scotland, test (a) is therefore satisfactorily met as the building is not of a special interest on its own or as part of the remaining grouping.</p> <p>(b) The building is incapable of repair</p> <p>A suite of reports has been submitted alongside the application which seek to demonstrate that the repair works required would be so invasive that any architectural character left in this building would be lost.</p> <p>The reports on the building condition have highlighted major structural inadequacies and defects due to years of vacancy, general neglect, vandalism, and weathering.</p> <p>The submitted reports confirm that the building is incapable of repair and conversion.</p> <p>In considering the evidence the accompanies this application along with the consideration of Historic Environment Scotland, test (b) is therefore satisfactorily met.</p> <p>(c) The demolition of the building is essential to delivering significant benefits to economic growth or the wider community</p> <p>With regard to benefits to the wider community, it is recognised that the building in its current condition has a negative impact on the immediate environment visually as well as the safety aspect of surrounding uses furthermore the area around the site is also that this is a route used by others such as dog walkers.</p> <p>Its demolition and replacement with an appropriate residential care scheme would significantly benefit the visual amenity of the immediate area and the redevelopment of the St Joseph's site as a whole.</p> <p>Removal of the dormitory block would open up the former care home site for redevelopment and the applicant has been discussing the proposals for a 40 bed care home which could facilitate the</p>
--	---

	<p>refurbishment and renovation of the structures around the elevated walled garden as well as the important Chapel building which does have significant architectural qualities.</p> <p>Historic Environment Scotland and Renfrewshire Council policies and guidance require that cognisance is taken of the importance of the building to the character or appearance of the area, and of proposals for the future of the cleared site.</p> <p>Any redevelopment proposal for the site would require to demonstrate good qualities of design taking due cognisance of the local built and natural environment.</p> <p>The test is therefore only partly met as although pre application proposals have been tabled and discussed, no formal application has been submitted.</p> <p>A condition can be added to the listed building consent that it will require to be demonstrated that signed and binding contracts are in place to secure the redevelopment of the site following demolition.</p> <p>(d) The repair of the building is not economically viable and that it has been marketed at a price reflecting its location and condition to potential restoring purchasers for a reasonable period</p> <p>Historic Scotland's Managing Change Guidance Note acknowledges that consent may be granted for the demolition of a listed building that is capable of repair but where the costs of doing so mean that its repair would not be viable.</p> <p>The supporting information includes viability appraisals and addresses the condition of the building.</p> <p>Permission was granted for the re-development of the original Garthland House and Dormitory block in 2007. However, shortly after consent was granted the economic environment for residential development became unfavourable due to the global financial crash of 2008. In the subsequent period, the deterioration in the condition of the building, further eroded the economic viability.</p> <p>The report concludes that the dormitory building is in a poor state of repair and that renovation is not viable.</p> <p>Given that the building is considered to be incapable of repair and there is conclusive evidence provided in the supporting documents to demonstrate that associated costs are prohibitive, it is therefore considered that the building is inherently not economically viable to repair.</p> <p>It is considered that the evidence that accompanies this application demonstrates that test (d) has therefore also been met.</p>
--	--

	<p>Conclusion</p> <p>It has been demonstrated through the accompanying supporting information that all potential scenarios for restoration have been appropriately considered and that an alternative scheme for the resultant cleared site has been discussed in detail.</p> <p>The proposal accords with the relevant provisions of the Adopted Renfrewshire Local Development Plan and Scottish Historic Environment Policy Statement as sufficient evidence has been provided to satisfy the relevant tests in relation to demolition of listed buildings and it has been demonstrated that St Joseph's dormitory building is beyond viable conversion, refurbishment, or reuse.</p>
RECOMMENDATION	Grant subject to conditions

Reason for Decision

The proposal accords with the provisions of the Development Plan and there were no material consideration which outweighed the presumption in favour of development according with the Development Plan.

Conditions

- 1 No demolition shall take place until it has been demonstrated to the written satisfaction of the planning authority that signed and binding contracts are in place to secure the redevelopment of the site immediately following demolition.

Reason: In the interest of amenity and to ensure that the listed building is not demolished unless approved development is to take place on the cleared site immediately following its demolition.

- 2 No demolition shall take place until it has been demonstrated to the written satisfaction of the planning authority that architectural features worthy of salvage have been identified and shall be salvaged through the demolition process.

Reason: To ensure that architectural features of note are saved and capable of reuse in the redevelopment of the site.

Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 - Background Papers
For further information or to inspect any letters of objection and other background papers, please contact Sharon Marklow on 0141 618 7835.