

Notice of Meeting and Agenda Scotland Excel Executive Sub-Committee

Date	Time	Venue
Friday, 02 October 2015	10:45	Scotland Excel Meeting Room 1, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley

KENNETH GRAHAM
Head of Corporate Governance

Members

Councillors W Howatson, Aberdeenshire Council; P Valentine, Angus Council; I Whyte, City of Edinburgh Council; N Macdonald, Comhairle Nan Eilean Siar; G Dykes, Dumfries and Galloway Council; M McElroy, Glasgow City Council; B Fernie, Highland Council; G McLean, North Ayrshire Council; M Holmes, Renfrewshire Council; A Westlake, Shetland Islands Council and Provost E Logan, South Lanarkshire Council.

Convener

Councillor M Holmes (Renfrewshire Council)

Further Information

This is a meeting which is open to members of the public.

A copy of the agenda and reports for this meeting will be available for inspection prior to the meeting at the Customer Service Centre, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley and online at www.renfrewshire.gov.uk/agendas.

For further information, please either email democratic-services@renfrewshire.gov.uk or telephone 0141 618 7112.

Members of the Press and Public

Members of the press and public wishing to attend the meeting should report to the customer service centre where they will be met and directed to the meeting.

Video Conferencing

Should any member wish to participate using video conference, please contact either Elaine Currie on 0141 618 7111 or Karen Druce on 0141 618 7110.

Items of business

Apologies

Apologies from members.

Declarations of Interest

Members are asked to declare an interest in any item(s) on the agenda and to provide a brief explanation of the nature of the interest.

- | | | |
|----------|---|----------------|
| 1 | Minute of Previous Meeting | 5 - 10 |
| | Minute of previous meeting held on 28 August, 2015 | |
| 2 | Revenue Budget Monitoring Report | 11 - 14 |
| | Joint Report by Treasurer and Director | |
| 3 | Contracts for Approval - Demolition Services | 15 - 26 |
| | Report by the Director | |
| 4 | Contract for Approval - Plumbing and Heating Materials | 27 - 40 |
| | Report by the Director | |
| 5 | Date of Next Meeting | |
| | Members are asked to note that the next meeting of the Scotland Excel Executive Sub-Committee will be held in Glasgow City Chambers, 80 George Square Glasgow on Friday 27 November 2015 at 9.45 am | |

Minute of Meeting Scotland Excel Executive Sub-Committee

Agenda Item No 1

Date	Time	Venue
Friday, 28 August 2015	10:45	Scotland Excel Meeting Room 1, Renfrewshire House, Cotton Street, Paisley

PRESENT

Councillors G Dykes (Dumfries & Galloway Council); M McElroy (Glasgow City Council); M Holmes (Renfrewshire Council); Provost E Logan (South Lanarkshire Council) and Councillor A Westlake (Shetland Islands Council).

BY VIDEO LINK Councillors W Howatson (Aberdeenshire Council) and P Valentine (Angus Council).

CHAIR

Councillor Holmes, Convener, presided.

APOLOGIES

Councillors N Macdonald (Comhairle nan Eilean Siar); I Whyte (City of Edinburgh Council); B Fernie (Highland Council); and G McLean (North Ayrshire Council).

IN ATTENDANCE

J Welsh, Director, H Carr, Head of Strategic Procurement, S Brannagan, Head of Customer & Business Services; J Bowles, Senior Procurement Specialist; A Richmond, Senior Procurement Specialist and A Kowalska, Assistant Procurement Specialist (all Scotland Excel); R Lewis, Head of Procurement (Dumfries & Galloway Council) and D Forbes, Finance Manager, Elaine Currie, Senior Committee Services Officer and K Druce, Assistant Committee Services Officer (all Renfrewshire Council).

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest intimated prior to the commencement of the meeting.

1 **MINUTE**

There was submitted the Minute of the meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee held on 12 June, 2015.

DECIDED: That the Minute be approved.

2 **REVENUE BUDGET MONITORING**

There was submitted a revenue budget monitoring report by the Treasurer and Director for the period 1 April to 24 July, 2015.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

3 **AUDITED ANNUAL ACCOUNTS 2014/15**

Under reference to item 9 of the Minute of the meeting of the Joint Committee held on 12 June, 2015 there was submitted a report by the Treasurer and Director relative to the annual accounts for the Joint Committee for 2014/15. The report intimated that the Audit Certificate issued by Audit Scotland provided an unqualified opinion that the abstract of accounts presented a true and fair view of the financial position of the Joint Board as at 31 March, 2015, in accordance with the accounting policies detailed in the accounts. A report on the 2014/15 audit by Audit Scotland was also attached to the report and indicated that there were no matters arising from the audit which required specific reporting to members.

Following the introduction of the Local Authority Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2014 the audited accounts had to be approved for signature by the Executive Sub-Committee no later than 30 September each year. Following approval the audited accounts would be signed by the Director, Convener and Treasurer.

DECIDED: That the audited annual accounts 2014/15 be approved for signature and the report by Audit Scotland be noted.

4 **QUARTERLY ABSENCE MONITORING**

There was submitted a report by the Director relative to the sickness absence statistics for Scotland Excel for the period May to July 2015. The Joint Committee had previously agreed that Scotland Excel should work to an absence rate of below 4%. This target aligned Scotland Excel with partner organisations, supported good practice in this area and demonstrated the ongoing commitment to absence management as a key efficiency target.

In line with audit recommendations, the report detailed the breakdown of the current month, the last six months and the last 12 months absence figures; an illustration of the last 12 months in days, percentages and full-time equivalent (FTE).

The report intimated that Scotland Excel would continue its positive practices, including working with Occupational Health and other support services to support attendance and support staff who had significant health issues.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

5 **ASSOCIATE MEMBERSHIP**

Under reference to item 6 of the Minute of meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 15 May, 2015 there was submitted a report by the Director relative to the proposed changes to the fee structure for Associate Membership.

The report intimated that officers had engaged with current and potential new members to implement the changes. The number of members who had intimated their intention to resign had been low and there had been contact from a number of new organisations wishing to explore membership opportunities.

As part of the additional and ongoing work to gather spend data it had become clear that one area of the original proposal submitted to the sub-committee as part of the fee structure report had not offered the opportunity that was initially anticipated. The report proposed that more work be carried out to explore an acceptable and manageable fee for the group of larger, high spending Associate Members and that a revised proposal for the organisations affected would be submitted to a future meeting of the sub-committee. In the meantime the report proposed that the current fees be applied with the normal inflationary increase which would generate income in the region of £18,000. A revised proposal for the organisations affected would be submitted to a future meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee.

DECIDED:

(a) That the actions detailed in the report be approved; and

(b) That a report relative to a revised proposal for the organisations affected be submitted to a future meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee.

6 **NATIONAL CARE HOME CONTRACT**

There was submitted a report by the Director relative to the National Care Home Contract arrangements which had been in place since 2006. The arrangements were coordinated by CoSLA, who took the lead role in the annual negotiations with provider representative bodies on both fees and contract variations. All Scottish Councils, with the exception of Shetlands Islands, currently accessed the contract the purchase care home placements and the current rates were in place until March 2016.

The report provided an update on the proposal that Scotland Excel provided councils with procurement and contract management services for the National Care Home Contract, supplementing the existing council contract monitoring. Funding of circa £250k per annum would be required to provide procurement, data analysis, financial accounting and legal skills required to deliver the planned activities to all 32 councils. These resources reflected the significant scale of the older peoples' care home sector in Scotland, which comprised close to 900 care homes and 350 providers.

In July 2015 Scotland Excel and CoSLA issued a joint letter to 28 councils seeking support for the proposal that Scotland Excel would provide a range of predetermined procurement and contract management services to complement local contract monitoring activities.

Responses had been received from 30 councils, with 23 councils supporting the proposals (subject to some caveats that needed to be discussed further) and 8 not supporting the proposals.

A meeting was also held with the Scottish Local Government Partnership (SLGP) members to establish their views on the proposal as these councils represented a significant proportion of the overall care home placements currently made under the National Care Home Contract.

During a period of sustained financial constraint, Scotland Excel would not request any further contribution from supporting councils to meet the shortfall from those councils not supportive of the proposal, however, this necessitated a review of the full range of activities originally proposed.

Scotland Excel's planned procurement and contract management service would include an analysis of the available procurement options for the future contracting of care homes for older people. A report on the procurement options would be submitted to a future meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee when the analysis had been concluded.

DECIDED:

- (a) That the level of support from councils in respect of the proposal for Scotland Excel to provide supplementary contract management services be noted;
- (b) That Scotland Excel move forward to work with those councils supportive of the contract management proposal;
- (c) That the development of a procurement strategy by Scotland Excel be approved;
- (d) That it be noted that Scotland Excel was in continued dialogue with both CoSLA and SLGP regarding the future contracting for care home services for older people; and
- (e) That a report relative to the procurement options be submitted to a future meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee once the analysis had been concluded.

7 UPDATE ON PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT AGAINST THE SCOTLAND EXCEL OPERATING PLAN

Under reference to item 4 of the Minute of meeting of the Joint Committee held on 12 June, 2015 there was submitted a report by the Director relative to Scotland Excel's operating plan and supporting key performance indicators (KPIs).

The report intimated that from the one year operating plan, a suite of 10 KPIs across the four goals had been derived which would be used to report overall performance against the plan. These KPIs would ensure clear and concise reporting on an ongoing basis and would be reported quarterly. The operating plan KPIs formed the appendix to the report.

DECIDED: That the report be noted.

8(a) CONTRACT: BUILDINGS RELATED ENGINEERING CONSULTANCY

There was submitted a report by the Director relative to the national collaborative framework for the provision of building related engineering consultancy services which encompassed mechanical, electrical, civil and structural engineering activities including inspection, feasibility and design for the period 1 October, 2015 to 30 September, 2017, with the option to extend up to a further two years until 30 September, 2019.

The report intimated that this framework would provide an efficient method of engaging external consultancy for services commonly used across councils which in turn would realise benefits for both councils and consultants in terms of cost savings and the adoption of best practice. The NEC3 Professional Services Contract 2013 and the NEC3 Professional Services Short Contract 2013 formed the terms and conditions on which councils would contract.

Twenty six councils and the Advance Procurement for Universities and Colleges (APUC) had confirmed their intention to participate in the framework from the start date and a further four councils had confirmed they may participate once their current contractual arrangements expired.

The framework had been advertised at £40m over the maximum period of four years. The value of work awarded under the framework would be dependent on the level of funding councils received and their ability to utilise internal resources. It was anticipated that spend would be lower in the initial two years of the framework and would increase in the later years.

DECIDED:

(i) That, based on the evaluation undertaken on the criteria set out in the report, the multi-supplier framework agreement be awarded to 29 consultants across the two lots as detailed in Appendix 3 to the report; and

(ii) That it be noted that the range of recommended consultants awarded to each council varied from eight to fourteen consultants per lot with councils being able to utilise between three and eight consultants for each category. This would provide best value to councils by ensuring that there was sufficient competitive capacity and full geographical and service coverage to meet operational requirements.

8(b) CONTRACT: DEMOLITION SERVICES

There was submitted a report by the Director relative to the national collaborative framework for the provision of demolition services for the period 1 October, 2015 to 30 September, 2017 with an option to extend for up to 24 months to 30 September 2019.

The Director intimated that she wished to withdraw this report.

DECIDED: That it be noted that this report had been withdrawn.

9 **UPDATE ON COMMUNITY MEAL POST TENDER NEGOTIATIONS**

Under reference to item 2 of the Minute of the meeting of this Sub-Committee held on 12 June, 2015 there was submitted a report by the Director relative to an update on the tender negotiation process in relation to the community meals contract and the outcomes achieved.

The report intimated that Scotland Excel had invited the three suppliers who were recommended for award on Lot 1 and the councils affected by the proposed increases to post tender negotiation meetings. Following this process, the overall estimated increased cost of the framework was now approximately 2.69% per annum across the participating councils, based on current spend forecast, as detailed in the appendix to the report. This was a reduction from the 3.67% on cost presented to the Executive Sub-Committee on 12 June, 2015.

DECIDED:

- (a) That the update report on post tender negotiations be noted; and
- (b) That the updated participation, spend and savings, which formed the appendix to the report, be noted.

10 **DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

DECIDED: That it be noted that the next meeting of the Executive Sub-Committee would be held on 2 October, 2015 at 10.45 am.

SCOTLAND EXCEL

To: Scotland Excel Executive Sub Committee

On: 2 October 2015

Report by: Joint Report by the Treasurer and the Director

Heading: Revenue Budget Monitoring Report to 21 August 2015

1. Summary

- 1.1 Gross expenditure is £75,000 under budget and income is currently £32,000 over recovered which results in a net underspend of £107,000 for Scotland Excel. This is summarised in point 4:

2 Recommendations

- 2.1 It is recommended that members consider the report.

3 Budget Adjustments Since Last Report

- 3.1 There have been no budget adjustments since the last report.

4 Budget Performance

- | | |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 4.1 Current Position | Net Underspend £107,000 |
| <i>Previously Reported</i> | <i>Net Underspend £89,000</i> |

The variance in expenditure is primarily due to underspends in Employee Costs and Contractors offset by an overspend in Payment to Other Bodies.

The underspend in Employee Costs is mainly related to 3 vacancies within procurement roles which are expected to be filled by the end of September. This has been partially offset by a temporary member of staff within the Reform Team during April. This staff member was fully funded with the income received within Other Income.

The underspend in Contractors is due a reduction in the use of consultants to assist Scotland Excel develop tenders for future contracts. This is part of Scotland Excel's long term aim of achieving a sustainable budget and reducing the requirement for external consultants over employed staff members.

Training courses delivered by Scotland Excel have resulted in the overspend within Payments to Other Bodies. These are fully recharged back to delegates and offset by additional income.

The over recovery of Other Income relates to the recoverable Employee Costs and Training Costs discussed above.

4.2 Projected Year End Position

The projected year end position shows a draw down from reserves of £364,900 which is £140,600 less than the approved draw down primarily associated with the reduced consultants discussed in 4.1

RENFREWSHIRE COUNCIL
REVENUE BUDGET MONITORING STATEMENT 2015/16
1st April 2014 to 21st August 2015

JOINT COMMITTEE : SCOTLAND EXCEL

Description (1)	£000's	Agreed Annual Budget (2)	Year to Date Budget (3)	Year to Date Actual (4)	Adjustments (5)	Revised Actual (6) = (4 + 5)	Budget Variance		
		£000's	£000's	£000's	£000's	£000's	£000's	(7)	%
Employee Costs		2,763	891	838	16	854	37	4.2%	underspend
Property Costs		178	88	88	0	88	0	0.0%	breakeven
Supplies & Services		170	43	43	0	43	0	0.0%	breakeven
Contractors and Others		263	102	44	0	44	58	56.9%	underspend
Administration Costs		324	102	92	13	105	(3)	-2.9%	overspend
Payments to Other Bodies		22	1	18	0	18	(17)	-1700.0%	overspend
GROSS EXPENDITURE		3,720	1,227	1,123	29	1,152	75	6.1%	underspend
Contributions from Local Authorities		(3,184)	0	0	0	0	0	0.0%	breakeven
Other Income		(30)	(21)	(49)	(4)	(53)	32	152.4%	Over-recovery
INCOME		(3,214)	(21)	(49)	(4)	(53)	32	152.4%	over-recovery
TRANSFER (TO)/FROM RESERVES		506	1,206	1,074	25	1,099	107	8.9%	underspend

	Agreed Annual Budget	Year to Date Budget	Year to Date Actual	Adjustments	Revised Actual
CORE OPERATIONS EXPENDITURE	3,214	1,074	1,044	14	1,058
NON-CORE OPERATIONS EXPENDITURE	506	153	78	16	94
TOTAL GROSS EXPENDITURE	3,720	1,227	1,122	30	1,152

Budgeted Draw on Reserves	£000's	Opening Reserves
Anticipated Year End Budget Position is an underspend of	506	(734)
	141	(369)

Scotland Excel Executive Sub Committee

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 02 October 2015

Report by Director

Tender: Demolition Services

Schedule: 07/14

Period: 1 October 2015 to 30 September 2017, with an option to extend for up to 24 months to 30 September 2019

1. Introduction and Background

This recommendation is for the award of a demolition services framework. This framework is the first national collaborative arrangement for demolition services and is an addition to the growing portfolio of construction related service frameworks.

Councils have an ongoing programmed requirement to demolish both domestic and commercial buildings. This framework provides councils with the mechanism to procure demolition services without a repeated need to approach the open market for each programmed demolition. While councils will be able to award work directly from this framework, due to the often bespoke nature of each demolition project, it is expected that the majority of demolition works will be awarded via mini competitions. The framework scope also includes emergency demolition requirements.

To meet the varying contracting methods and experiences of councils, Scotland Excel has developed this framework to incorporate two sets of standard industry terms and conditions to award demolition work. The NEC3 Engineering and Construction Short Contract and SBCC Minor Works Building Contract are both available to participating councils under this framework

2. Scope, Participation and Spend

During strategy development it was agreed with council representatives that the framework would be split into three lots:

Table 1: Lotting Structure

Lot No.	Description	Percentage Value
1	Demolition Works up to £50,000	80%
2	Demolition Works £50,000 and over	
3	Emergency Demolition	20%

The lotting structure was agreed to align with the various specialisms within the supply base, as well encourage, in particular, the participation of small demolition suppliers.

Due to the unique nature of each demolition job, lots 1 and 2 requested suppliers to submit pricing for a suite of different building type demolitions. While the emergency demolition lot sought a range of labour and equipment hire rates and required attendance on site within 3 hours of the emergency call out.

As detailed in Appendix 1, 30 councils have confirmed their intention to participate on this framework, with the remaining two councils having their own contractual arrangements in place. All member councils however are listed in the EU contract notice as potential participants so that they may access the framework in the future if required.

Based on indicative council spend projections (refer Appendix 1), together with an allowance for emergency demolition work, potential associate member spend, as well as additional contingency, the framework was advertised at £16 million per annum across all three lots.

3. Procurement Process

A User Intelligence Group (UIG) consisting of procurement and technical representatives from the participating councils was established to develop the procurement strategy that was designed to best meet overall user requirements.

To ensure that the contract is awarded to the most capable tenderers, the UIG agreed that the open procedure for tendering should be used. It was also agreed that a two stage procedure would be used, stage one addressing qualification criteria and stage two addressing award criteria. Stage one assessed tenderers business probity, financial standing, insurances, compliance to terms and conditions and quality management, environmental and health and safety systems.

At the second stage of the process, the offers were evaluated against the following criteria and weightings:

- Commercial 70%
- Technical 30%

For lots 1 and 2, tenderers were invited to submit a single price for all tendered councils for each demolition (i.e. crush and skip only) scenario. For lot 3, tenderers were required to submit pricing (day work and plant hire rates) for each council tendered.

In preparation of the procurement strategy, Scotland Excel consulted with Police Scotland and as a result of these discussions, Scotland Excel included a declaration document requiring tenderers to certify their 'non involvement in serious and organised crime'. This inclusion allows for the legal removal of any supplier from the framework that are found to be in breach of the declaration.

Scotland Excel also consulted with the supply base to gain their insight on a range of essential elements. These market consultations were advertised to the market through publication of a Prior Information Notice (PIN).

The PIN and the framework were advertised in the Public Contracts Scotland Portal as well as the Official Journal of the European Union.

4. Report on Offers Received

A total of 49 organisations accessed the tender documents, with 30 submitting an offer before the closing date and time.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender document, a full evaluation of the 30 offers received was conducted and details of the overall scores per lot are set out in Appendix 3.

5. Recommendations

Under EU procurement legislation a framework arrangement can be concluded with a single supplier. If the agreement is concluded with several suppliers, the minimum number of suppliers must be three (provided there is sufficient numbers of suppliers satisfying the selection criteria and tenders meeting the award criteria).

Based on the evaluations carried out in line with the criteria and weightings set out above, it is recommended that the framework be awarded to a total of 22 suppliers across the three lots as detailed in Appendix 3.

The range of suppliers recommended will meet the varied operational and geographical requirements of participating councils and provides an appropriate degree of choice with regards to maximising operational efficiency and best commercial value. It is encouraging to note that all councils will be afforded service coverage and that 21 of the 22 recommended suppliers are classified SME (refer Appendix 2).

6. Benefits

Savings

Due to the bespoke nature of each demolition job, a benchmarking exercise was not undertaken for lots 1 and 2. The level of competition that will exist within the framework should ensure that mini competitions continue to produce best value outcomes.

For lot 3, emergency demolition, tenderers were required to provide rates as a percentage variation from the National Federation of Demolition Contractors (NFDC) Daywork Charges. The tendered rates of the recommended suppliers for lot 3 have been benchmarked against the NFDC rates and confirm that the overall tendered rates are, on average, circa 20% below the NFDC rates.

This framework also offers significant price stability. The rates submitted for lot 3 have been fixed by eight of the recommended suppliers for 24 months, while one recommended supplier has fixed their rates for 18 months, with the remaining supplier fixing their rates for 12 months. Any requests for price increases beyond these fixed periods will be considered in accordance with the defined Scotland Excel process and evaluated against a range of applicable market indices.

Process savings will certainly be realised under this framework. Currently most councils need to conduct substantive procurement processes for each of their demolition requirements. This framework will now allow direct awards for works under council standing order thresholds and for lot 3 emergency demolition work, as well as issue of mini competitions under the framework terms.

Sustainable Procurement Benefits

The majority of the recommended suppliers are ISO14001 Environmental Management accredited or equivalent meaning they are actively working towards reducing process cost, emissions and waste.

Environmental Initiatives

Environmental initiatives were scored as part of the evaluation and a range of proposals were received.

Tenderers were asked to detail how they will recycle construction waste and what other initiatives their organisations would implement to reduce the impact of their services to the environment. The recommended suppliers recycle up to 90% of materials removed from demolition sites. As well as this, the recommended suppliers offered a range of additional environmental initiatives including:

- lowering their vehicle and plant emissions by using Euro 5 and 6 emission standard vehicles;
- reducing their carbon footprint through , for example, local sourcing of required plant and equipment, the use of biodegradable oils and the use of hybrid vehicles;
- minimising air pollution by promoting vehicle sharing, encouraging fuel efficient driving and maintaining vehicles and plant on a regular basis; and
- educating staff to become more environmentally responsible.

Community Benefits

As the majority of spend on this framework will result from mini competitions conducted by councils under lots 1 and 2, it was clear to Scotland Excel that community benefits would be maximised if councils sought community benefit commitments as part of each mini competition therefore this was agreed at the procurement strategy development phase. This methodology was detailed in the tender documentation and as a non scored element, assurances were sought from suppliers on their commitment to delivering community benefits through this

framework. All recommended suppliers have confirmed they will be willing to offer community benefits as part of any mini competition conducted under this framework. Councils will determine the level of community benefits at the time of each mini competition. Scotland Excel will monitor and report on the delivery of community benefits under the framework as part of its contract and supplier management programme.

Added Value

As a non scored element of the tender, suppliers were also given the opportunity to offer any other value adding ideas. The recommended suppliers have offered plans such as using mobile recycling equipment, creating community notice boards to keep residents up to date with ongoing projects, waste management consultations and community benefits tracking.

Workforce Matters

Tenderers were also asked a non scored question on the payment of the living wage to their workforce. The responses confirm that 19 out of the 22 recommended suppliers already pay the living wage or above to all their employees (except apprentices and probationary staff), with 18 suppliers expected to be accredited by the Living Wage Foundation within the first two years of the framework.

Two of the remaining suppliers pay over 90% of their employees the living wage or above and are working towards paying all their staff the living wage. The remaining recommended supplier did not detail any commitment in respect to the living wage. Scotland Excel however will monitor workforce matters with all awarded suppliers as part of its contract and supplier management programme.

7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

In accordance with Scotland Excel's established Contract Supplier Management (CSM) programme, in terms of risk and spend, this framework is classified as level 2. As such, on a quarterly basis Scotland Excel will collect, analyse and review detailed supplier management information. Scotland Excel will also monitor agreed key performance indicators, community benefits and payment of the living wage. Scotland Excel will meet with the framework suppliers and UIG annually to review the framework operation.

Scotland Excel will host a framework mobilisation event to ensure purchasing councils and awarded suppliers are familiar with the framework requirements. The event will

also provide a platform for councils and suppliers to make introductions, given this is the first national collaborative framework for demolition services.

8. Summary

This framework aims to provide participating councils access to best value suppliers for demolition related services.

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendations to award agreements to the suppliers as detailed in Appendix 3.

Appendix 1 – Participation and Spend Summary
Demolition Services 07-14

Member Name	Participation in Contract	Participation Entry Date	Estimated Annual Spend (£)	Source of Spend Data
Aberdeen City Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£1,316,128	Spikes Cavell
Aberdeenshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£79,802	Spikes Cavell
Angus Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£122,143	Spikes Cavell
Argyll & Bute Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£60,154	Spikes Cavell
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£161,371	Spikes Cavell
Clackmannanshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£156,470	Spikes Cavell
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	Yes	01 April 2017	£10,000	Spikes Cavell
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£45,000	Spikes Cavell
Dundee City Council	No			
East Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£239,187	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
East Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£52,438	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
East Lothian Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£117,700	Spikes Cavell
East Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£250,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Falkirk Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£270,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Fife Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£360,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Glasgow City Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£1,500,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Highland Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£127,058	Spikes Cavell
Inverclyde Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£235,757	Spikes Cavell
Midlothian Council	No			
North Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£100,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
North Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£968,980	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Orkney Islands Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£10,000	Spikes Cavell
Perth & Kinross Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£231,209	Spikes Cavell
Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 April 2017	£564,151	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Scottish Borders Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£790,707	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Shetland Islands Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£10,000	Spikes Cavell
South Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£160,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
South Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 September 2016	£822,257	Spikes Cavell
Stirling Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£30,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
The Moray Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£50,000	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
West Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£1,094,200	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
West Lothian Council	Yes	01 October 2015	£320,793	Spikes Cavell - Confirmed by Member
Associate Members	Yes	01 October 2015	£1,000,000	Spikes Cavell
NHS	Yes	01 October 2015	£100,000	
*Emergency Demolition	Yes		£3,000,000	
Totals			£14,355,505	

*Councils are unable to assign estimated annual spends for Emergency Demolition therefore £3m annually has been included in the value

Appendix 2 – SME Status
Demolition Services 07-14

Supplier name	SME Status	Location	Lots Offered
Bardem Limited	Small*	Paisley	1 and 2
Burnfield Builders & Demolishers Ltd	Small*	Glasgow	1 and 2
C.E.P. Demolitions Limited	Small*	Glasgow	1, 2 and 3
Caskie Limited	Small	Glasgow	1 and 3
Central Demolition Limited	Medium*	Bonnybridge	1, 2 and 3
Coleman & Company Limited	Medium*	Birmingham	2
Connell Brothers Limited	Small	Manchester	2
Daltons Demolitions Limited	Small*	Edinburgh	1, 2 and 3
David Morton (Larbert) Limited	Small	Falkirk	1 and 2
Delson Contracts Limited	Small	Kirriemuir	1
Dem-master Demolition Limited	Medium*	Bathgate	1, 2 and 3
DSM Demolition Limited	Medium	Birmingham	2
E. Nicholson & Sons (Metals) Limited	Small*	Glasgow	1 and 2
Frank O'Gara & Sons Limited	Small*	Manchester	2
G&J Demolition Limited	TBC*	Glasgow	1, 2 and 3
George Beattie & Sons Limited	Small*	Glasgow	1, 2 and 3
Gowrie Contracts Limited	Small*	Dundee	1 and 2
Grantham Industries Limited trading as GBM Demolition	Medium*	Louth	2
JCJ (Demolition & Construction) Limited	Small*	Glasgow	1, 2 and 3
John Graham (Metals) Limited	Small*	Stirling	1
Keltbray Limited	Large*	Glasgow	1 and 2
MacWilliam Demolition Limited	Small	Coatbridge	1 and 2
MM Miller (Wick) Limited	Small*	Wick	1 and 2
Reigart Contracts Limited	Medium*	Coatbridge	1, 2 and 3
Safedem Limited	Medium*	Dundee	1, 2 and 3
Squibb Group Ltd	Medium	Barking	2
Technical Demolition Services Limited	Medium*	Wirral	1 and 2
Thompsons of Prudhoe Limited	Large	Northumberland	1 and 2
William Goodfellow (Contractors) Limited	Small*	Glasgow	1 and 2
William Munro Construction (Highland) Limited	Medium*	Alness	1, 2 and 3

Asterisk (*) denotes recommended suppliers

Appendix 3 – Scoring and Recommendations Demolition Services 07-14

Asterisk (*) denotes recommended suppliers

Lot 1 – Demolition Works up to £50,000

Supplier	Final Score
*John Graham (Metals) Limited	84.8
*Gowrie Contracts Limited	81.1
*Daltons Demolitions Ltd	56.7
*George Beattie & Sons Limited	53.5
*Keltbray Limited	52.7
*E. Nicholson & Sons (Metals) Limited	52.6
*C.E.P. Demolitions Limited	50.2
*Burnfield Builders & Demolishers Ltd.	47.5
*MM Miller (Wick) Limited	44.1
*Reigart Contracts Limited	43.6
*Technical Demolition Services Limited	40.9
*Bardem Limited	39.4
*Safedem Limited	39.3
*Central Demolition Limited	37.4
*Dem-master Demolition Limited	36.7
*G&J Demolition Limited	34.3
MacWilliam Demolition Ltd	29.0
William Goodfellow (Contractors) Limited	25.9
JCJ (Demolition & Construction) Limited	25.6
Thompsons of Prudhoe Limited	25.2
Caskie Limited	22.7
William Munro Construction (Highland) Limited	21.3
Delson Contracts Limited	18.2
David Morton (Larbert) Limited	16.0

Lot 2 – Demolition Works £50,000 and over

Supplier	Final Score
*Frank O'Gara & Sons Limited	86.7
*Daltons Demolitions Ltd	82.0
*George Beattie & Sons Limited	67.1
*Gratham Industries Limited trading as GBM Demolition	62.2
*Technical Demolition Services Limited	62.2
*C.E.P. Demolitions Limited	55.8
*Keltbray Limited	54.8
*William Goodfellow (Contractors) Limited	54.3
*Central Demolition Limited	54.1
*Bardem Limited	51.1
*Coleman & Company Limited	48.3
*G&J Demolition Limited	47.5
*Safedem Limited	47.1
*Reigart Contracts Limited	46.7
*Dem-master Demolition Limited	44.4
*Burnfield Builders & Demolishers Ltd.	42.0
E. Nicholson & Sons (Metals) Limited	39.9
Connell Brothers Limited	39.3
Thompsons of Prudhoe Limited	37.3
DSM Demolition Limited	36.7
Squibb Group Ltd	33.8
William Munro Construction (Highland) Limited	32.6
JCJ (Demolition & Construction) Limited	29.8
Gowrie Contracts Limited	29.3
MM Miller (Wick) Limited	28.3
David Morton (Larbert) Limited	27.9
MacWilliam Demolition Ltd	27.8

Appendix 3 – Scoring and Recommendations

Demolition Services 07-14

Asterisk (*) denotes recommended suppliers

Lot 3 - Emergency Demolition

	Burnfield Builders & Demolishers Ltd.	C.E.P. Demolitions Limited	Caskie Limited	Central Demolition Limited	Daltons Demolitions Limited	Dem-master Demolition Limited	G&J Demolition Limited	George Beattie & Sons Limited	JCJ (Demolition & Construction) Limited	Reigart Contracts Limited	Safedem Limited	William Munro Construction (Highland) Limited
Aberdeen City Council					84.7*			74.2*			60.4*	
Aberdeenshire Council					84.7*			74.5*			63.8*	
Angus Council					83.5*			72.6*		83.0*	57.6	
Argyll & Bute Council					81.3*			68.6*	62.3*	83.5*	51.4	
City of Edinburgh Council				48.3	81.3*	84.0*	67.4*	62.2	60.5	79.2*	47.9	
Clackmannanshire Council				48.3	81.3*	84.0*	67.4	74.6*	60.5	79.2*	47.7	
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar					86.6*						64.1*	
Dumfries & Galloway Council					81.3*			65.9*	60.5*	79.2*	47.7	
Dundee City Council					80.9*	85.7*		66.7	60.9	80.4*	52.0	
East Ayrshire Council		83.4*			66.2*	69.6*		59.6	55.4	67.1*	46.8	
East Dunbartonshire	54.9	82.8*		44.6	65.5*	68.7*	56.9*	54.6	54.5	66.4*	43.5	
East Lothian Council					81.3*	84.3*		67.1*	60.5	79.2*	53.4	
East Renfrewshire Council	54.5	82.8*		44.6	65.5*	68.7*	56.9	54.6	54.5	66.4*	43.7	
Falkirk Council				45.9	78.6*	81.1*	64.0	59.0	60.5	76.4*	79.4*	
Fife Council					81.3*			65.9*	60.5*	79.2*	52.1	
Glasgow City Council	54.4*	82.8*		44.6	65.5*	69.2*	51.4	54.6*	54.5*	66.4*	45.1	
Inverclyde Council	55.8*	81.7*	41.7		64.4*	67.6*		56.5*	53.0	65.2*	49.9	
Midlothian Council				48.3	81.3*	84.0*	67.4*	62.2	60.5	79.2*	47.7	
North Ayrshire Council	56.7	82.8*	45.2		65.5*	68.9*	57.9	57.9	54.5	66.2*	46.9	
North Lanarkshire Council	54.7*	82.8*		44.6	65.5*	68.7*	56.9*	54.6*	54.5*	66.2*	43.5	
Orkney Islands Council					87.4*						72.7*	
Perth & Kinross Council					81.3*	84.3*		65.9	60.5	79.2*	52.2	
Renfrewshire Council	56.7	82.8*	42.5		65.5*	68.9*	57.9	58.0	54.5	66.4*	47.0	
Scottish Borders Council					84.7*	87.9*		69.7	57.2	82.7*	55.2	
Shetland Islands Council					87.4*						73.2*	
South Ayrshire Council		83.4*			66.2*	69.9*		58.8	55.4	67.1*	47.1	
South Lanarkshire Council		83.4*		45.2	66.2*	69.4*		55.4	55.4	67.1*	43.4	
Stirling Council	62.2			47.7	80.7*	84.1*	66.6*	61.4	59.6	78.5*	46.7	
The Highland Council					86.1*						66.8*	60.2*
The Moray Council					87.4*						72.1*	
West Dunbartonshire	55.4	82.8*		44.6	65.5*	68.7*		54.6	54.5	66.4*	43.6	
West Lothian Council				48.3	85.8*	84.0*	67.4*	62.2	60.5	79.2*	47.4	

Scotland Excel Executive Sub Committee

To: Executive Sub Committee

On: 2 October 2015

Report by Director

Tender: Supply and Delivery of Plumbing and Heating Materials

Schedule: 17/14

Period: 1 December 2015 until 30 November 2018 with an option to extend for up to 12 months until 30 November 2019

1. Introduction and Background

The current framework for Plumbing Materials will expire on 30 November 2015. This proposed renewal framework will operate from 1 December 2015 until 30 November 2018 with an option to extend for up to 12 months until 30 November 2019.

This framework will provide councils and other participating bodies with a mechanism to procure a range of plumbing and heating materials in support of construction projects, replacement programmes, ongoing maintenance schedules and ad hoc repairs. Product groupings with significant spend are boilers, showers, copper and lead and sanitary ware with a range of council functions likely to access the framework including stores, housing and maintenance departments. A key objective for the renewal was to ensure councils had sufficient competition and flexibility for certain lots where product compatibility with diverse housing stock is crucial.

This renewal incorporates a number of enhancements to the current framework including the inclusion of spare parts on the core list, increased product competition within the framework and improved support for boiler procurement and replacement programmes.

2. Scope, Participation and Spend

As part of strategy development, the User Intelligence Group (UIG) approved the inclusion of nine lots as summarised in Table 1. This lotting strategy recognises the current structure of the market place and was designed to more closely align with council requirements. The lotting strategy continued to maximise opportunities for SMEs.

Table 1: Lotting Structure

<i>Lot No.</i>	<i>Description</i>	<i>No. of products</i>	<i>Estimated % of Spend</i>
1	Solder Ring, DZR and Brass	116	6%
2	Cast Iron	36	1%
3	Copper and Lead	21	17%
4	Internal and External Plastic Pipe	161	9%
5	Boilers	63	25%
6	Radiators	107	6%
7	Sanitary Ware	61	12%
8	Sink Tops and Taps	54	6%
9	Showers and Accessories	45	18%

As detailed in Appendix 1, 28 councils have confirmed their intention to participate in this framework. East Ayrshire, Glasgow City, Scottish Borders and Stirling Councils have confirmed that they will not participate as they have their own arrangements in place. Fife Council may migrate to the framework when existing supply arrangements are due to end.

In addition to councils, the NHS, Scottish Prison Service (SPS) and the Royal Botanic Gardens Edinburgh have also confirmed an intention to participate in the framework.

The forecast annual spend for participating councils is £19.4m, equating to £77.6m over the term of the framework, including the extension period. Other participating bodies have validated an additional £0.6m per annum, a total of £2.4m over the term of the framework. To allow a contingency, for continued boiler and bathroom replacements programmes, the framework was advertised at a £82.4m for the full term of the framework.

3. Procurement Process

A UIG consisting of representatives from participating councils agreed the procurement strategy. In addition, a working group of technical and procurement representatives was formed to review technical specifications and participate in the evaluation.

A Prior Information Notice (PIN) was published on 19 March 2015, which resulted in expressions of interest from 26 organisations. Meetings were held with potential bidders including both incumbent and new suppliers. During these meetings, ability to service, trading processes, market trends, community benefits and sustainability were discussed as well as potential product lists and specifications.

Following this initial market engagement, on 4 June 2015, additional information was added to the PIN to invite manufacturers to discuss the procurement of boilers. These meetings helped inform a revised approach to the inclusion of boilers and spare parts in the renewal framework.

To ensure maximum competition, the UIG agreed that an open tender process should be followed to establish the renewal framework.

This framework was advertised on the Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU) and the Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) portal on the 17 July 2015. The tender process was conducted using the Public Contracts Scotland Tender (PCS-Tender) system.

The procurement process followed a two stage tendering procedure. At the first stage, tender responses were assessed against financial capability, technical/professional capability and business probity requirements. Bidders were required to pass this stage to be eligible for award. At the second stage of the process, the offers were evaluated against the following criteria and weightings.

Technical	20%
Commercial	80%

Within the technical section, bidders were required to evidence their knowledge and experience by responding to method statements which covered areas including; service, delivery and contract management, added value, community benefits, sustainability and the management of non core spend. Bidders were also assessed in terms of any additional fixed pricing periods offered.

Within the commercial section, bidders were invited to offer on a lot by lot basis. Fixed pricing for six months was required for lots 1-2 and 4-9. Due to the volatility of raw materials, only three months fixed pricing was required for lot 3 (copper and lead). Bidders were also assessed in terms of the annual retrospective rebate offered.

As a key objective for the renewal framework was to increase the competition and flexibility for councils requiring product compatibility with diverse housing stock, lots 4-9 contained a multiple offer structure to facilitate the submission of offers for a range of different manufacturer brands. Bidders could submit up to three offers in lots 4-9 to broaden the choice for councils and encourage competition from the supply base.

Bidders were also invited to offer discounts per lot for the supply of non core items, sole supply status, collection and delivery to central stores. Those bidders offering for lot 5 (boilers) were further invited to offer a discount for spare parts and accessories and document additional warranties where available.

4. Report on Offers Received

The tender document was downloaded by 32 organisations, with 11 tender responses received. A summary of the offers received is provided in Appendix 2. One offer was non compliant as the bidder rejected the advertised terms and conditions.

Based on the criteria and scoring methodology set out in the tender document, a full evaluation of the offers received was completed. Appendix 3 confirms the scoring achieved by each bidder.

5. Recommendations

Under EU procurement legislation a framework agreement can be concluded with a single supplier or more than one supplier. If the framework agreement is concluded with more than one supplier, the minimum number of suppliers must be three (provided there is a sufficient number of suppliers satisfying the selection criteria and meeting the award criteria).

Based on the evaluation undertaken, and in line with the criteria and weightings set out above, it is recommended that a multi supplier framework agreement is awarded to 10 suppliers across the nine lots as outlined in Appendix 3.

These 10 recommended suppliers offer best value and represent a mix of small, medium and large organisations. The range of suppliers recommended also provides competitive options for all participating councils as well as offering a degree of choice and capacity. Furthermore, the multiple offer structure employed in lots 4-9, as outlined above, has delivered the objective of increasing the competition and flexibility for councils.

6. Benefits

Savings

Scotland Excel conducted a benchmarking exercise based upon the historic purchasing patterns of councils, comparing current prices paid with the prices submitted against the new framework. The result of this benchmarking is listed in Appendix 1; the projected average saving across all councils is estimated at 4.7%, which equates to an estimated total saving of approximately £0.9 million per annum. The estimated savings per council range from 0% to 13.2%. The variance reported is caused by the significant fluctuation in product requirements between councils.

There is scope for councils to derive further savings as seven suppliers have offered annual retrospective rebates of 1-2.5% for certain lots. Two suppliers have offered a single source discount of 1-2% for certain lots and six suppliers have offered a range of non core discounts across the lots.

Price Stability

In addition to the mandatory six months fixed pricing for lots 1-2 and 4-9, five suppliers have offered an additional six months fixed pricing. Furthermore, in addition to the mandatory three months fixed pricing for lot 3 (copper and lead), two suppliers have offered an additional three months fixed pricing.

Sustainable Procurement Benefits

Within the technical section, the sustainability method statement assessed suppliers in relation to their corporate approach to sustainability to minimise the impact of the supply chain on the environment. A range of sustainable measures were outlined by suppliers including; reduction of waste to landfill and packaging, recycling initiatives, use of renewable energy including biomass and solar panels, segregation of waste streams, water conservation, setting of emissions targets and fuel efficiency measures.

In the specifications for lot 5 (boilers), lot 7 (sanitary ware), lot 8 (sink tops and taps) and lot 9 (showers and accessories) bidders were advised that all applicable products must meet relevant Government Buying Standards for; gas boilers, heating systems, combined heat and power systems, taps, showers and toilets.

It is envisaged that enhanced supplier support for boilers will result in fewer deliveries for spare parts, which will lessen the environmental impact of the framework.

Bidders were asked to detail community benefits initiatives they would commit to deliver during the lifetime of the framework. These commitments will be discussed during mobilisation and reported through ongoing contract management returns. Results reported on community benefits will be disseminated to councils on a six monthly basis. A range of community benefits were offered by bidders including:

- Support for training and employment programmes
- Donation of materials for community projects
- Increase in number of apprenticeships
- Tenant workshops on energy saving
- One supplier has committed to a work experience placement for local unemployed for each £250,000 of sales per annum
- Another supplier has committed to donating 1% of all sales to community benefits

Living Wage

While this renewal is a supply framework and there is limited ability to influence supplier behaviour on workforce matters compared with a services framework, an unscored question asked bidders to confirm their living wage status. Of the 10 recommended bidders:

- Eight have confirmed that they either pay or will pay the living wage to all employees (except volunteers, apprentices and interns) within the initial two year period of the framework.
- Two have confirmed that a majority of their staff are paid the living wage (63% and 76%).

Other Benefits

Some of the recommended suppliers provided further details of how bathroom and heating replacement programmes can be supported through the framework. This included information on stock management, delivery schedules, resident sampling, viewing days in local communities and guidance on product ranges.

Councils with in-house heating engineers are able to benefit from a key enhancement for this renewal. In such circumstances, subject to mutual agreement, additional contract support available includes, specialist training in installation and diagnostics, free of charge parts and improved response time for tenants. Furthermore, there is also an opportunity to explore a potential income stream where the council acts as an agent of the manufacturer for remedial works, maintenance and servicing of boilers.

Further benefits offered by recommended suppliers through the framework are outlined below;

- Specialist guidance and advice on installation
- Technical support for end users
- Next day and emergency deliveries
- Free of charge training, offer of “Toolbox Talks”
- Assistance in the management of council stores requirements
- Out of hours support for orders
- Call and collect branches
- Tenant discounts
- Emergency stock held at council premises, arrangement of lock boxes

7. Contract Mobilisation and Management

Each supplier will be invited to a mobilisation meeting to outline the operation of the framework, roles and responsibilities, management information requirements and community benefits commitments. Both suppliers and participating members will be issued with a mobilisation pack containing all required details to launch the framework.

In accordance with Scotland Excel’s established contract and supplier management programme, this framework has been classified as a level 1 arrangement in terms of both risk and spend requiring annual or six monthly supplier and user group reviews as appropriate.

8. Summary

This framework for the supply and delivery of plumbing and heating materials aims to maximise collaboration, promote added value and deliver best value.

A range of benefits can be reported in relation to savings, price stability, retrospective rebates and community benefits. Although this is a renewal framework, positive

efficiencies have been achieved through close working relationships with an already established UIG to improve the core list. Enhancements in this third generation of the framework include; support for boiler and bathroom replacement programmes, additional contract support from boiler manufacturers, inclusion of spare parts on the core list and increased competition and flexibility for councils.

The Executive Sub Committee is requested to approve the recommendation to award this framework agreement as detailed in Appendix 3.

Appendix 1 – Participation, Spend and Savings Summary Supply and Delivery of Plumbing and Heating Materials 17/14

Member Name	Participation in Contract	Participation Entry Date	Estimated Annual Spend (£)	Source of Spend Data	% Estimated Forecast Savings	Estimated Annual Savings (£)	Basis of Savings Calculation
Aberdeen City Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£824,240	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	2.9%	£23,903	Benchmarked Current Contract
Aberdeenshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£210,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	7.3%	£15,330	Benchmarked Current Contract
Angus Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£0	Member Provided	4.7%	£0	Average Saving
Argyll & Bute Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£270	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	4.7%	£13	Average Saving
City of Edinburgh Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£50,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	5.4%	£2,700	Benchmarked Current Contract
Clackmannanshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£400,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	12.1%	£48,400	Benchmarked Current Contract
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	Yes	01 December 2015	£0	Member Provided	4.7%	£0	Average Saving
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£10,957	Contract MI	9.0%	£986	Benchmarked Current Contract
Dundee City Council*	Yes	01 December 2015	£398,620	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	0.0%	£0	Benchmarked Current Contract
East Ayrshire Council	No						
East Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£1,150,535	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	3.6%	£41,419	Benchmarked Current Contract
East Lothian Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£830,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	6.9%	£57,270	Benchmarked Current Contract
East Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£75,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	9.8%	£7,350	Benchmarked Current Contract
Falkirk Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£10,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	2.6%	£258	Benchmarked Current Contract
Fife Council	Yes	31 July 2017	£2,800,000	Member Provided	5.2%	£145,600	Benchmarked Current Contract
Glasgow City Council	No						
Highland Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£295,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	13.2%	£38,940	Benchmarked Current Contract
Inverclyde Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£44,405	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	7.8%	£3,464	Benchmarked Current Contract
Midlothian Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£1,262,605	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	7.3%	£92,170	Benchmarked Current Contract
North Ayrshire Council*	Yes	01 December 2015	£750,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	8.3%	£62,250	Benchmarked Current Contract
North Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£0	Member Provided	4.7%	£0	Average Saving
Orkney Islands Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£1,000	Contract MI	4.6%	£46	Benchmarked Current Contract
Perth & Kinross Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£375,208	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	9.4%	£35,270	Benchmarked Current Contract
Renfrewshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£750,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	2.6%	£19,500	Benchmarked Current Contract
Scottish Borders Council	No						
Shetland Islands Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£55,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	7.5%	£4,125	Benchmarked Current Contract
South Ayrshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£270,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	9.3%	£25,110	Benchmarked Current Contract
South Lanarkshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£5,480,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	3.0%	£164,400	Benchmarked Current Contract
Stirling Council	No						
The Moray Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£480,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	6.9%	£33,120	Benchmarked Current Contract
West Dunbartonshire Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£850,000	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	8.6%	£73,100	Benchmarked Current Contract
West Lothian Council	Yes	01 December 2015	£2,050,104	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	1.8%	£36,902	Benchmarked Current Contract
Tayside Contracts	No						
Scottish Government (RBGE)	Yes	01 December 2015	£6,000	Member Provided	4.7%	£282	Average Saving
NHS	Yes	01 December 2015	£255,325	Contract MI - Confirmed by Member	1.2%	£3,064	Benchmarked Current Contract
SPS	Yes	01 December 2015	£300,000	Member Provided	4.7%	£14,100	Average Saving
Totals			£19,984,269.00		4.7%	£949,071.12	

*Subject to final council validation

Appendix 2 - SME Status

Tenderer's Name	SME Status	Location	Lots Tendered
AKW Medicare Ltd	Medium	Droitwich Spa	9
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart	Large	Edinburgh	1,3,4,6,8,9
Grafton Merchanting GB Ltd	Large	Glasgow	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant	Large	Coventry	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd	Large	Glasgow	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd	Medium	Glasgow	1,4,5,6
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd	Small	Glasgow	1,2,3,4,6,7,8,9
Screwfix Direct Ltd	Large	Somerset	4,5,6,8,9
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd	Large	Northampton	3,4,5,6,7,8,9
William Wilson Ltd	Large	Aberdeen	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9
Wolseley UK Ltd	Large	Royal Leamington Spa	1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9

Appendix 3 - Scoring and Recommendations (Asterisk (*) denotes recommended supplier)

Lot 1 - Solder Ring, DZR and Brass	
Tenderer	Score
William Wilson Ltd*	91.30
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*	91.08
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd*	80.58
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*	75.07
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*	66.88
Wolseley UK Ltd*	59.02
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd	52.33
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart	51.78

Lot 2 - Cast Iron	
Tenderer	Score
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*	91.25
Wolseley UK Ltd*	80.47
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*	76.52
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*	73.35
William Wilson Ltd*	71.14
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd	58.43

Lot 3 - Copper and Lead	
Tenderer	Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*	92.33
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*	78.25
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*	76.70
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*	76.68
William Wilson Ltd*	73.72
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd	65.12
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart	63.59
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd	61.70

Lot 4 - Internal and External Plastic Pipe	
Offer - Floplast	
Tenderer	Score
William Wilson Ltd*	90.22
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd*	87.25
Offer - John Guest Speedfit	
Tenderer	Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*	92.80
Offer - Marley	
Tenderer	Score
William Wilson Ltd*	91.30
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 2)*	77.12
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 3)	73.49
Wolseley UK Ltd	66.72
Offer - McAlpine	
Tenderer	Score
William Wilson Ltd*	91.30
Offer - Polypipe	
Tenderer	Score
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*	91.70
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*	84.81
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd*	82.30
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd*	81.68
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*	77.83
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart*	74.95
Offer - Wavin	
Tenderer	Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant (offer 2)*	91.55
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant (offer 1)*	85.65

Lot 5 - Boilers		
Offer - Alpha Therm		
Tenderer		Score
William Wilson Ltd*		91.30
Offer - Ariston		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		91.55
William Wilson Ltd*		89.51
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd		77.02
Offer - Ideal		
Tenderer		Score
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd (offer 1)*		90.75
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		87.97
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd (offer 2)		85.96
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd (offer 3)		82.13
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd		75.00
Offer - Sime		
Tenderer		Score
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd*		87.25
Offer - Vaillant		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		91.55
Wolseley UK Ltd*		73.94
Offer - Vokera		
Tenderer		Score
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		90.50
Wolseley UK Ltd*		89.26
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		85.86
William Wilson Ltd*		85.62
Offer - Worcester		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*		92.80
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		87.29

Lot 6 - Radiators		
Offer - Barlo / Quinn		
Tenderer		Score
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		89.78
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd (offer 1)*		87.25
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		87.01
William Wilson Ltd*		86.42
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd (offer 2)		80.18
Offer - Centerad		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*		92.80
Offer - Henrad		
Tenderer		Score
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*		90.45
Offer - Instinct		
Tenderer		Score
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd*		88.30
Offer - Kermi		
Tenderer		Score
Plumbstore (Plumbing & Heating Supplies) Ltd*		87.25
Offer - Myson		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*		92.80
Offer - Purmo		
Tenderer		Score
William Wilson Ltd*		91.30
Offer - Rettig		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		91.55
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		88.67
Offer - Stelrad		
Tenderer		Score
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*		90.75
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		88.28
Wolseley UK Ltd		72.79
Offer - Supaplumb		
Tenderer		Score
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart*		86.25

Lot 7 - Sanitary Ware		
Offer - Armitage Shanks, Ideal, Shires		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		92.08
Wolseley UK Ltd (offer 2)*		77.01
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 2)*		76.18
William Wilson Ltd*		71.58
Wolseley UK Ltd (offer 1)*		71.44
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 1)		68.21
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd		65.57
Offer - Instinct		
Tenderer		Score
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*		91.25
Offer - Lecico		
Tenderer		Score
William Wilson Ltd*		91.83
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*		86.11
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant		82.25
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd		81.64
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd		78.01
Offer - Twyford		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*		92.79
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		92.08
William Wilson Ltd*		85.66

Lot 8 - Sink Tops and Taps		
Offer - Bristan		
Tenderer		Score
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*		91.25
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		80.09
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		75.55
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*		65.97
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd		62.83
Wolseley UK Ltd		54.79
Offer - Deva		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd*		93.33
Offer - Methven		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		92.08
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		87.69
William Wilson Ltd*		87.08
Offer - Pegler		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		92.08
William Wilson Ltd*		91.83
Offer - Supaplumb		
Tenderer		Score
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart*		86.25
Offer - Westco		
Tenderer		Score
William Wilson Ltd*		91.83

Lot 9 - Showers and Accessories		
Offer - AKW		
Tenderer		Score
AKW Medicare Ltd*		92.00
Offer - Bristan		
Tenderer		Score
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		92.08
Wolseley UK Ltd*		86.46
Offer - Coram		
Tenderer		Score
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 3)*		90.50
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd (offer 2)*		79.42
Offer - Croydex		
Tenderer		Score
Stax Trade Centres Plc T/A DF Wishart*		86.25
Offer - Express		
Tenderer		Score
William Wilson Ltd*		91.83
Offer - Instinct		
Tenderer		Score
M. K. M. Building Supplies Ltd*		91.25
Richmonds Plumbing and Heating Merchants Ltd		65.24
Offer - Mira		
Tenderer		Score
Wolseley UK Ltd (offer 2)*		93.33
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant*		85.94
Grafton Merchants GB Ltd*		81.25
Wolseley UK Ltd (offer 1)*		81.16
William Wilson Ltd*		70.43
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd		68.10
Offer - MX		
Tenderer		Score
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*		90.75
Jewson Ltd T/A Graham Plumbers Merchant		73.66
Offer - Triton		
Tenderer		Score
Travis Perkins Trading Company Ltd*		90.75
William Wilson Ltd*		85.70

